

**REPORT OF THE STANDING COMMITTEE ON FINANCE AND PUBLIC
ACCOUNTS (FPAC)**



**COVERING THE 2020 AUDITED ACCOUNTS OF GOVERNMENT OF
THE GAMBIA; THE ANNUAL ACTIVITY REPORTS AND AUDITED
FINANCIAL STATEMENTS OF PUBLIC AGENCIES, HOSPITALS AND
LOCAL GOVERNMENT COUNCILS.**

OCTOBER 2023 – FEBRUARY 2024

JUNE 2025

CONTENTS

CHAIRPERSON'S STATEMENT	2
ACKNOWLEDGEMENT	4
INTRODUCTION.....	5
METHODOLOGY	6
CHAPTER 1 – AUDITOR GENERAL'S REPORT ON THE 2020 ACCOUNTS OF GOVERNMENT	7
CHAPTER 2 – PUBLIC INSTITUTIONS AND AGENCIES.....	26
2.1 Gambia Investment and Export Promotion Agency (GIEPA).....	26
2.3 Independent Electoral Commission (IEC)	31
2.4 National Nutrition Agency (NaNA).....	42
CHAPTER 3 – PUBLIC HEALTH FACILITIES.....	48
3.1 Bansang General Hospital.....	48
3.2 Bundung Maternal and Child Hospital (BMCH).....	52
3.3 Bwiam General Hospital	54
3.6 Sheikh Zayed Regional Eye Care Centre (SZRECC).....	74
CHAPTER 4 – LOCAL GOVERNMENT COUNCILS.....	85
4.1 Banjul City Council (BCC)	85
5.1 Basse Area Council (BSAC)	97
6.0 Kanifing Municipal Council (KMC)	101
7.0 Kerewan Area Council (KAC)	115
8.0 Kuntaur Area Council (KTRAC).....	103
9.0 Mansakonko Area Council (MKAC)	107
CHAPTER 6 – GENERAL RECOMMENDATIONS.....	112
Appendix I (Membership of FPAC).....	115
Appendix II (List of Witnesses)	115

CHAIRPERSON'S STATEMENT

On behalf of the Standing Committee on Finance and Public Accounts (FPAC), I rise with profound respect to present to this august Assembly the Committee's report on the scrutiny of the Auditor General's Report on the Government's Audited Financial Statements for the year ended 31st December 2020, together with the Annual Activity Reports and Audited Financial Statements of Public Agencies, Local Government Councils, and Public Health Institutions for the period covering 2019 to 2021.

This exercise is conducted pursuant to the mandate conferred upon the FPAC under Sections 102, 109, and 160 of the 1997 Constitution of the Republic of The Gambia. It is aimed at fostering transparency, probity, and sound financial management in the utilisation of public resources.

Honourable Speaker, permit me, at the outset, to express the Committee's deep appreciation to the Office of the Speaker and the Office of the Clerk for their unwavering support in facilitating the effective discharge of the Committee's oversight functions. I would like to extend my sincere gratitude to the Auditor General and his team at the National Audit Office for their invaluable professional input and technical guidance throughout the scrutiny process. The diligence, competence, and cooperation of the Auditor General have been instrumental in enabling the Committee to interrogate the accounts with the rigour and objectivity that the Constitution demands.

The Committee equally acknowledges, with gratitude, the critical role played by the Subject Matter Specialists whose expertise greatly enhanced the quality of the Committee's analysis and deliberations. The Secretariat Staff attached to the Committee equally deserve commendation for their dedication, meticulous record-keeping, and logistical support throughout the Committee's engagements. Their services have been indispensable in ensuring the smooth conduct of our proceedings.

Honourable Members, the findings emanating from this scrutiny exercise are deeply concerning and warrant serious reflection by all stakeholders. The Auditor General's report unearthed significant weaknesses in public financial management, including unauthorized virements exceeding D246 million, unallocated warrants, persistent failure to provide documentation relating to budget processes, and widespread non-compliance with the Public Finance Act and Financial Regulations.

The Committee also noted highly irregular financial practices, including the encashment of cancelled cheques, unreconciled transfer and transit accounts, and substantial variances in foreign currency translations. Of particular concern are glaring lapses in revenue collection and accountability mechanisms within key revenue-generating entities such as the Department of Geology and the Department of Fisheries, where instances of detached receipts, unaccounted revenue, and failure to deposit funds on time were prevalent.

Furthermore, the misuse of the Contingency Fund, the absence of an annual borrowing plan, failure to adequately monitor government investments in development banks, and the

continued non-repayment of on-lent loans by State-Owned Enterprises—thereby exposing government to additional interest liabilities—remain grave concerns.

At the subnational level, Local Government Councils and Public Health Institutions were also found to be marred by weak internal controls, poor asset management, procurement irregularities, and inadequate financial reporting.

Honourable Speaker, in response to these findings, the Committee has made robust recommendations, including remedial policy actions, enforcement of financial discipline, and where warranted, the referral of matters to the appropriate investigative and prosecutorial authorities. The Committee also calls on the Ministry of Finance and Economic Affairs, the Accountant General's Department, and all public institutions to fully comply with the Public Finance Act, the GPPA Act, and all relevant financial governance instruments.

In conclusion, while the Committee notes some areas of improvement, the magnitude and recurrence of these deficiencies highlight the urgent need for comprehensive reforms and a renewed commitment to sound public financial management. The Committee urges this august Assembly to adopt this report and to support the implementation of its recommendations in the best interest of accountability, transparency, and national development.

Hon. Alhagie S. Darbo

Chairperson of FPAC

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

The Finance and Public Accounts Committee (FPAC) of the National Assembly of The Gambia wishes to express its profound appreciation to all individuals and institutions whose invaluable contributions made this scrutiny exercise a success.

The Committee extends sincere gratitude to the Office of the Speaker of the National Assembly for its unwavering support and continued commitment to strengthening the oversight mandate of the National Assembly. Equally, the Committee acknowledges the vital role played by the Office of the Clerk of the National Assembly, whose leadership and administrative support greatly facilitated the successful execution of the Committee's work.

Special appreciation is accorded to the Auditor General and the staff of the National Audit Office (NAO) for their professionalism, diligence, and commitment in producing credible and comprehensive audit reports that serve as a critical foundation for the Committee's scrutiny work. The Committee further recognises the efforts of the Accountant General's Department (AGD) and the Permanent Secretaries of Government Ministries, as well as the Board Members and Management Teams of Public Institutions, Agencies, and Local Government Authorities, whose cooperation and responsiveness during the hearings were instrumental.

The Committee also conveys sincere thanks to the Subject Matter Specialists, Technical Advisers, and the Committee Secretariat Staff, whose dedication, expertise, and tireless efforts provided the necessary technical and administrative support throughout the scrutiny process.

Finally, the FPAC appreciates the commitment of Honourable Members of the Committee, whose dedication, professionalism, and active participation reflect the highest standards of parliamentary oversight and accountability. Their collective efforts have been crucial in ensuring that this report accurately reflects the outcomes of the scrutiny exercise and upholds the integrity of public financial management in The Gambia.

The FPAC remains committed to the principles of transparency, accountability, and good governance in the management of public resources, in fulfilment of its constitutional mandate and in service to the people of The Gambia.

INTRODUCTION

The Finance and Public Accounts Committee (FPAC) of the National Assembly is pleased to present this report on the outcome of the public engagements conducted during the parliamentary scrutiny of the Auditor General's Report on the Audited Accounts of the Government of The Gambia for the financial year ended 31st December 2020, together with the Annual Activity Reports and Audited Financial Statements of Public Agencies, Departments, Autonomous Institutions, Hospitals, and Local Government Councils for the period 2019 to 2021.

These public hearings, held between October 2023 and February 2024, brought together key stakeholders responsible for the management of public funds. The Committee engaged with Permanent Secretaries of Government Ministries, officials from the Accountant General's Department (AGD) and the National Audit Office (NAO), as well as Board Members, Chief Executives, and Management of various Public Institutions and Agencies. In addition, Mayors, Chairpersons, and Management of Local Government Councils appeared before the Committee to present and account for their respective Activity Reports and Audited Financial Statements.

This scrutiny was conducted in line with the Committee's constitutional mandate, specifically under Sections 102 and 109 of the 1997 Constitution of the Republic of The Gambia, which entrusts the FPAC with the responsibility to examine and consider the public accounts of the Government as audited by the Auditor General. Further powers are vested in the Committee under Section 109(3) (a), (b), (c) and Section 110, which empower the Committee to take corrective actions, including issuing reprimands or admonitions against any officer, ministry, department, or agency found in breach of financial management regulations or accountability obligations.

In accordance with the resolution of the Bureau of Committees of the Sixth Legislature, the FPAC holds exclusive responsibility for the scrutiny of all public accounts, excluding the accounts of the thirteen (13) commercial State-Owned Enterprises (SOEs), which fall under the purview of the Public Enterprises Committee (PEC).

This report, therefore, captures the Committee's key findings, observations, and recommendations arising from the comprehensive review of the Government's Audited Accounts and the financial and operational performance of public entities within the reporting period. It is intended to enhance transparency, accountability, and the prudent use of public resources in the service of the people of The Gambia.

METHODOLOGY

The methodology applied during the parliamentary oversight and scrutiny includes:

Evidence gathering through analysis of Activity Reports and Financial Statements

The Committee reviewed and considered the annual activity reports of all the affected institutions and received expert analysis from the Subject Matter Specialists, Auditor General and representatives of Gambia Public Procurement Authority.

Public Hearings

The Committee summoned witnesses from all relevant institutions to public hearings where they made presentations and responded to audit queries and other concerns regarding their Activity Reports, Financial Statements and Management Letters.

FINDINGS

CHAPTER 1 – AUDITOR GENERAL’S REPORT ON THE 2020 ACCOUNTS OF GOVERNMENT

Pursuant to Section 160 (1) (c) of the 1997 Constitution of the Republic of The Gambia, the Auditor General, at least once in every year, is required to audit and report on the public accounts of The Gambia, the accounts of all offices and authorities of the Government of The Gambia, the accounts of the Courts, the accounts of the National Assembly and the accounts of all Public Enterprises.

In the same vein, Section 160 (1) (d) of the Constitution requires the Auditor General to report to the National Assembly on the public accounts of The Gambia and to draw attention to any irregularities in the accounts audited and to any other matter, which in the opinion of the Auditor General, ought to be brought to the notice of the National Assembly.

Following the laying of the Report of the Auditor General on the Accounts of the Government of The Gambia for the year ended 31st December 2020 by the Honourable Minister of Finance and Economic Affairs, the report was committed by the Assembly to the Standing Committee on Finance and Public Accounts (FPAC) for proper scrutiny.

After engagements with the Accountant General, Auditor General, Permanent Secretaries, Vote Controllers or Spending Officers and their teams of technicians, the Committee made the following key findings and recommended remedial actions for consideration by the plenary.

3.1.2 Misstatement in the notes to the financial statements

Recasting of the Extended Trial Balance (ETB) and the Financial Statements revealed that Notes 7, 15, 17, 20 and 21 of the Financial Statements were misstated. Both the revised Financial Statements and Extended Trial Balance were reviewed and the following differences were noted:

Description	Extended Trial Balance (D)	Financial Statements (D)	Difference (D)
Receivables (Note 17)	2,500,199,575.75	3,785,660,680.00	1,285,461,104.25
Cash and Cash Equivalent (Note 15)	7,273,813,871.58	7,185,616,180.00	(88,197,691.58)
Deposits (Note 20)	(699,950,436.02)	(564,492,246.26)	(135,458,189.76)
Accounts Payables (Note 21)	(138,046,993.60)	(137,002,000.00)	(1,044,993.60)

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that all these differences should be reconciled in the 2021 Accounts of Government of The Gambia (GoTG).

3.2.1 Un-Allocated Warrant of Funds

Review of the IFMIS reports on the cash allocated but undistributed to different MDAs and unallocated funds to different line items indicated that cash allocation of the Ministry of Finance and Economic Affairs (MoFEA) totalling **D12,097,731.69** were unallocated to line items in the system as at 31st December 2020, leading to unutilized funds in the system that could have been utilized by other Ministries, Departments and Agencies (MDAs).

MDA	Control/Cash Allocation No.	Unallocated Funds
Ministry of Finance and Economic Affairs	20CA22577; 20CA31394; 20CA34565; 20CA34837; 20CA9302; 20CA34963; 20CA9342; 20CA35120; 20CA34838; 20CA13234	12,097,731.69

Recommendations

The Committee recommends that the Accountant General should work with the Budget Directorate of the Ministry of Finance to investigate and resolve these differences.

3.2.3 Virement to create new post

The Committee noted that twenty (20) virements amounting to **D79,058,793** were made within and across sectors to create new posts contrary to the Financial Regulations.

Recommendations

- a) The Committee recommends that the Minister of Finance must not make or approve any virement for the creation of any new post that was not part of the approved manpower budget in line with the intent and spirit of section 29 (8) of the Public Finance Act 2014.
- b) The Committee further recommends that there must be proper planning at the level of the Personnel Management Office (PMO) to avoid virements to create new posts.

3.2.7 Failure to present information on budgetary process

Documentations to ascertain whether the 2020 Budget for the Government of the Gambia was prepared in accordance with the Call Circular guidelines on the implementation of Program-Based Budgeting were requested but none were provided in contravention of the Constitution and Financial Regulations.

Recommendation

- a) The Committee recommends that the requested documentation should be made available to the Auditors for verification with immediate effect.
- b) The committee further recommends that if information on the budget process is readily available as claimed, it should have been presented to the Auditors without delay.

3.2.8 No Virement notification sent to MDAs

Review of the MDAs' files at the Ministry of Finance and Economic Affairs (MoFEA) by the Auditors revealed that virements amounting to **D31,017,356** were made across budget entities without notifying them before or after the virements were made. This is non-compliance with the Laws and regulations and demonstrates MoFEA's failure to adhere to established procedures when virements are made across budget entities.

Recommendations

- a) The Committee recommends that the Minister of Finance and Economic Affairs must abide by the dictates of Section 29 (4) of the Public Finance Act 2014, in that they must consult the Vote Controllers of the affected budget entities.
- b) The Committee further recommends that making virements without notifying the affected budget entities must end in 2024.

3.2.9 Failure to Approve Virement

A review of Ministries, Departments, and Agencies (MDAs) files at the Ministry of Finance and Economic Affairs (MoFEA) by the Auditors revealed that virement amounting to **D246,223,158** was made within and across budget entities. However, there was no evidence to suggest that these were approved by the Minister before transfers were made, contrary to the provisions of the Financial Regulations.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that MoFEA should provide within thirty (30) days from the adoption of this report, evidence of virement approvals by the Minister to the Auditor General for verification, failure of which the matter be investigated by the Police.

3.3.4 Differences between individual BTL projects account balance and Basket account

Reconciliation of the Below-The-Line (BTL) Cash Book and the Basket Account (Special Project Bank Account) revealed that funds amounting to **D17,588,719.15** still exist between individual BTL projects' account balances in the Cash Book and the Basket Account.

Recommendations

- a) The Committee recommends that the Accountant General should investigate these differences and provide details to the FPAC for confirmation.
- b) The Committee further recommends that the AGD should adequately account for and report all BTL funds received during the year, as they are part of public funds received.

3.3.5 Cancelled Cheques Encashed

A comparison of the cancelled cheques for 2020 against the TMA bank statement revealed that cheques amounting to **D62,505,523.58** were reported as cancelled or voided in the IFMIS but were withdrawn from the bank.

The physical cheques were requested to confirm the cancellation, but none were provided for review. Payments amounting to **D1,921,215.58** were cancelled and withdrawn; these remain as cancelled cheques encashed.

Recommendations

The Committee recommends that the Accountant General's Department (AGD) should establish the status of these cancelled cheques and provide evidence to the FPAC within 30 days from the adoption of this report, failing which the matter will be referred to the Police for investigation.

3.3.8 Transfer Accounts not cleared

From the review of the Trial Balance, the Committee noted that these accounts were not mapped to any disclosures in the Financial Statements. Additionally, four accounts were not cleared to zero at the year end and had a balance as at 31 December 2020. Details of the unresolved balances are shown in the table below:

Transfer From Sub-Treasury	3211125	-71,327,064
Control Account	9999993	-2,026,194,860
AR intercompany	9999995	3,459,811,860
AP Intercompany	9999994	-355,796,454
	Total	1,006,493,482

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that the Accountant General should provide to the FPAC details of a comprehensive investigation that the Taskforce constituted by the Management has done, within 30 days from the adoption of this report.

3.3.9 Difference in translating foreign currency held account

The Committee noted a difference of **D253,716,855,439.67** between the translated Special Project USD General Ledger balance and the figure disclosed as per Note 15 in the financial statements. After a review of the revised Financial Statements, the Committee noted a difference of **D490,351** during the translation of a foreign-held account. See the details below:

Description	Cash book balance	CBG year-end closing rate	Translated figures	Figure disclosed as per Note 15	Difference
	\$	D per \$	D	D	D
Special Project Dollar account	5,723,253.32	51.65	295,606,033.98	295,115,682.98	490,351.00

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that the AGD should provide the FPAC with the Taskforce's findings regarding the details of the differences.

3.3.10 Non-Submission of Annual Plan by Self-Accounting Projects

The Annual Plan of Self-Accounting Projects were requested but none were provided.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that the Annual Plan of Self-Accounting Projects be provided to the FPAC for verification within 60 days from the adoption of this report.

3.4.3 Partial update of personal files

Personnel files from the Ministry of Basic and Secondary Education were not updated with personal records like Birth Certificates, academic qualifications, transfers, contract letters and retirement.

Recommendation

- a) The Committee recommends that PMO should take all necessary steps to update all the Personal Files of all employees under their purview before the end of the year.
- b) The Committee further recommends that the Ministry of Public Service should broaden its reform agenda to include digitalization and integration of personnel records of all its employees for effective control.

3.5.2 No evidence of contribution by seconded employees

The Committee noted that in the Personnel Files of seconded employees, there was no evidence to show that the thirty-nine (39) employees contributed 25% of their monthly Basic Salary as required by the General Order.

Recommendations

The committee recommends that AGD should compile a list of seconded employees that failed to pay their contributions after six months and send it to the PSC for further action.

3.5.4 Opening of bank account without evidence of approval by Minister

The Committee learnt that the Department of Labour opened a bank account with Arab Gambia Islamic Bank (AGIB) for the purpose of paying injury compensation to the deceased family (where death results from injury). According to the Management of the Labour Department, instruction was given to them by the Accountant General to open the said account to render smooth payment of compensation. However, approval of Minister of Finance was not provided to back this claim.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that AGD should immediately provide the FPAC for verification, evidence of the closure of the AGIB account of the Department of Labour.

3.5.5 Unconfirmed Compensation paid to Faraba Bantang victims

The Committee discovered that the sum of **D18,271,059** was claimed to have been paid to victims of the Faraba Banta incident. The list provided to Auditors did not contain sufficient information such as Contact numbers, Parents of victim or Next of Kin to confirm receipt of the compensation.

Recommendations

The Committee recommends that the Accountant General should furnish the FPAC with the full details of all those compensated in the Faraba Banta incident, including receipt confirmation, within 30 days from the adoption of this report.

3.6.1 Unjustified single source procurement

Review of Payment Vouchers and supporting documents revealed that two (2) payments amounting to **D649,300** were made using single-source procurement instead of using three quotations as per the GPPA threshold. These procurements have exceeded the threshold required for single sourcing, which is set at D 20,000 and D 50,000 for goods & services and works respectively. There was no evidence of approval from GPPA to justify the single-source procurement. The details are shown on the table below:

Date	Details	PV Number	Payee	Amount (D)
2020-12-11	Audio-Visual, Radio Equipment and Installations	07PV20001866	EYEAFRICA TV	325,000.00
2020-07-08	Office Equipment	03PV20000752	UNIQUE ENTERPRISE	324,300.00
Total				649,300.00

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that the Accountant General and the Vote Controllers should be held accountable for all unjustifiable payments that are in breach of the Laws and Regulations.

3.6.2 Invoices received prior to receiving Request for Quotations and Purchase Order.

Review of payment voucher files revealed that invoices amounting to **D603,775** were paid to suppliers whose invoices were collected prior to receiving a request for quotation. Moreover, requests for quotation were raised and approved by authorizing officer after obtaining invoices.

Recommendations

- a) The Committee recommends that any Public Officer who acted in violation of the Public Finance Act, GPPA Act and other regulations by entering a contract or commitment without following due process shall be held accountable for the amounts involved.
- b) The committee further recommends that the payments of the procuring organisation should be stopped as a form of deterrent.

3.7.1 Unpresented supporting documents

The Committee noted with serious concern that twenty (20) payment vouchers on other charges and thirty-two (32) payment vouchers on capital expenditure amounting to **D27,360,324.10** and **D1,517,329,882.42**, respectively, were without the required supporting documents.

Recommendation

- a) The Committee recommends that the AGD should provide sufficient documents supporting the payment vouchers amounting to **D27,360,324.10** and **D1,517,329,882.42**; failure of which the Accountant General shall be sanctioned.
- b) The committee further recommends that henceforth, the AGD should strictly adhere to the dictates of the Laws and not honour any payment without required supporting documents.
- c) More importantly, the Committee recommends that the AGD resends the list of pending audit queries to all the affected MDAs.

3.8.1.1 Non-monitoring of US Dollar collections

The government and NICK TC SCAN Gambia have an existing agreement to deposit all scanning fees collected into an Escrow account held at First International /MISTA Bank. Monies deposited into the Escrow account are required to be disbursed by the Escrow agent to the Government and NICK in the following order: the Government **35%** and NICK Scanning Gambia Limited **65%**. The 35% disbursement for the Government shall be paid to the following accounts, detailed below:

Account Denomination	Account No.	Bank	Account BBAN No.
Dalasi	1101005026	Central Bank of The Gambia	901101110100502611
Dollar	1103000805	Central Bank of The Gambia	901101110300080596

Review of the transfer advice from the Escrow agent and bank statements from Central Bank of the Gambia (CBG) revealed that **\$227,210.63**, representing the 35% of total Dollar collection for the period under review, was transferred to the Dollar account at Central Bank of The Gambia. However, the Committee noted that Gambia Revenue Authority (GRA) failed to monitor and keep records of the Dollar collections and payments made by NICK TC SCAN to the Escrow Dollar account at CBG. Furthermore, there is no evidence of reconciliation performed by GRA to confirm the accuracy of amounts transferred as Government share.

Recommendations

- a) The Committee recommends that AGD must ensure that reconciliation of the Dollar account is performed periodically, with the evidence provided to the FPAC.
- b) The Committee further recommends that the AGD should immediately ensure that a monitoring mechanism of the USD collection is put in place as a matter of urgency.
- c) Additionally, The committee recommends that the AGD instruct Central Bank of The Gambia (CBG) to grant Gambia Revenue Authority (GRA) user access rights or provide GRA with regular statements to do the necessary reconciliations.

3.8.1.2 Difference between daily accumulated collection and amount transferred to the Escrow account

The Committee discovered differences amounting to **D646,959.50** between amounts transferred to the Escrow account at First International/VISTA Bank against figures derived from details of scanning fees recorded in an excel file (representing the Cash Book). The details are shown in the table below:

Months/Period	Monthly Accumulated Collection D	Transfer Letter Total D	Difference +/- D
April	12,308,249.00	12,312,317.00	(4,068.00)
June	10,570,807.00	10,570,712.00	95.00
July	10,918,471.00	10,253,045.00	665,426.00
August	12,013,986.00	12,018,123.00	(4,137.00)
September	11,025,454.00	11,033,746.00	(8,292.00)
December	9,949,210.50	9,951,275.00	(2,064.50)
Total	137,202,527.50	136,555,568.00	646,959.50

Recommendations

- a) The Committee recommends that these differences should be investigated by the AGD and the evidence furnished to the FPAC within 60 days from the adoption of this report.
- b) The AGD should ensure reconciliation of collections with the GRA to avoid over/under lodgement of collections.

3.8.1.4 Difference between bank statement and daily collections

The committee observed that details of scanning fees collected are recorded in an Excel file representing the Cash Book. Review of the Escrow bank statements revealed differences amounting to **D111,721** between bank statements and total daily receipts collected by GRA.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that the AGD and GRA must immediately investigate and provide to the FPAC for verification within 30 days from the adoption of this report, clarity on the difference of **D111,721** between collection and bank statement amounts.

3.8.3.1 Failure to present revenue receipts

The Committee learnt that twenty-six (26) receipts from the Immigration Department amounting to **D26,000** were not presented for review up to the time of writing this Management Letter.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that the unpresented receipts must be provided by the Immigration Department to the FPAC for verification within 30 days from the adoption of this report.

3.8.3.4 Untraced GTR and IFMIS receipts to the Deposit Slip

The Committee noted that the serial numbers of GTRS and IFMIS receipts are not indicated on the bank deposit slips at the time of depositing revenue collected during the period under review by Ministry of Justice and Department of Geology. As a result, the serial numbers of the receipts and the deposit slips could not be reconciled. The unreconciled receipts amounted to **D7,279,194** and **D43,500** for the Department of Geology and Ministry of Justice respectively.

Recommendations

- a) The Committee recommends that the AGD should liaise with Ministries of Finance, Justice and Energy to ensure that necessary actions are taken within 60 days from the adoption of this report.
- b) The Committee further recommends that the Accountant General (through the PS Finance) should impose sanctions on Accounting Officers and Vote Controllers that fail to present supporting documents for audit.

3.8.3.5 Failure to present supporting documents

Examination of IFMIS receipts revealed that revenue collections amounting to **D5,097,141.85** at the Departments of Geology and Fisheries were made without adequate supporting documents. The issue remains unresolved as documents amounting to **D2,991,957.85** are still outstanding at the Departments of Fisheries. The details are shown below:

Date	Receipt #	Amount	Remark
2020-11-02	25CR20000236	603,500.00	No Application or Approval of awarded Vendor. Only invoice attached
2020-02-03	25CR20000009	500,000.00	No Meeting Minutes of the Committee and Notification by Navy
2020-08-25	25CR20000184	430,275.00	No Application or Approval of awarded Vendor. Only invoice attached

2020-09-16	25CR20000201	384,072.00	No Application or Approval of awarded Vendor. Only invoice attached
2020-02-28	25CR20000032	350,000.00	No Meeting Minutes of the Committee and Notification by Navy
2020-11-18	25CR20000256	204,630.85	No Application or Approval of license
2020-05-05	25CR20000086	200,000.00	No Meeting Minutes of the Committee and Notification by Navy
2020-07-28	25CR20000165	150,580.00	No Application or Approval of awarded Vendor
2020-08-20	25CR20000183	101,200.00	No Application or Approval of awarded Vendor. Only invoice attached
2020-12-08	25CR20000278	67,700.00	No Application or Approval of awarded Vendor. Only invoice attached
Total		2,991,957.85	

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that the Permanent Secretary at the Ministry of Fisheries should take the necessary steps to ensure that all the outstanding documentation is provided to the AGD for onward submission to the FPAC for verification within 30 days from the adoption of this report.

3.8.3.6 Failure to deposit revenue on time

Reviewed of the cash books, GTRs and IFMIS receipts against the deposit slips (paying-in-slips) revealed instances where revenues collected totalling **D7,152,208.37** from various Ministries and Departments were not deposited to the Bank in a timely manner.

Recommendations

- a) The Committee recommends that the Accountant General should liaise with the relevant Ministries and Departments to ensure that all revenue collections are banked on time.
- b) The Committee further recommends that specific penalties must be imposed on individuals and/or institutions that are found wanting.

3.8.3.7 Detached receipt from the receipt book

Review of the GTR books at the Department of Geology revealed that original, duplicate, and triplicate receipts of receipt number **3710017** were completely detached from the receipt book and the amounts collected cannot be established or confirmed whether it was accounted for. This suggests a deliberate attempt with the intention to defraud government revenue.

Recommendations

- a) The Committee recommends that the Geology Department must ensure that the completely detached original, duplicate and triplicate receipts are investigated by the Police and the details provided to the FPAC for review.
- b) The committee further recommends that punitive actions must be taken against the official responsible for this deliberate suppression of government revenue.

3.8.3.8 Difference between GTR books amount and the deposit slip

The Committee observed that the reconciliation between the total revenue collected from the General Triplicate Receipts (GTR) books provided against the total deposit-slips revealed a cumulative difference of **D3,276,409** in respect of collections from the Department of Geology. The difference between a GTR receipt and deposit slip could not be ascertained since the receipt number is not indicated on the deposit slips.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that this matter be referred to the Police for investigation.

3.8.3.10 Non maintenance of cash book

The committee noted that the Department of Geology did not maintain a Cash Book to record the GTR receipts issued out, and collections made in respect of license fees and royalties on both sand mining operations and stone quarries during the period.

Recommendations

- a) The Committee recommends that the Department of Geology must adhere to the dictates of the Financial Regulations and maintains a Cash Book to record transactions promptly and completely.
- b) The Accountant General as the Receiver General, Paymaster and Chief Accounting Officer of the Government must ensure that all controls are in place by all revenue collecting officers, including maintaining a Cash Book by respective MDAs as dictated by Section 3 (a) and (b) of the Public Finance Act.

3.8.3.11 Failure to present Treasury receipts

The committee learnt that twenty-two (22) integrated Financial Management Information System (IFMIS) generated receipts from the Department of Fisheries, amounting to **D5,420,377.75** were not presented for inspection. Out of these six (6) receipts amounting to **55,974.20** are remain outstanding.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that Management must ensure that all outstanding receipts are presented immediately, failing which the matter must be referred to the Police for investigation.

2.8.6.1 Outstanding balances owed by Gamcel on Gateway funds

Review of invoices and summarized statement of payments revealed that Gamcel has outstanding arrears owed to the Gateway funds amounting to **D11,473,267.54** during the financial year 2020. The details are shown on the table below:

Invoice Code	Period	Total Levies (\$)	Total Amount (D)	Payment (D)	Balance (D)
GMCL03/2020	1/03/2020 - 31/03/2020	31,322.88	1,597,466.88	509,245.44	1,088,221.44
GMCL04/2020	1/04/2020 - 30/04/2020	35,505.51	1,810,781.01	0	1,810,781.01
GMCL05/2020	1/05/2020 - 31/05/2020	37,779.00	1,926,729.00	0	1,926,729.00
GMCL06/2020	1/06/2020 - 30/06/2020	25,100.55	1,296,443.41	0	1,296,443.41
GMCL07/2020	1/07/2020 - 31/07/2020	52,308.23	2,712,704.81	0	2,712,704.81
GMCL08/2020	1/08/2020 - 31/08/2020	50,875.20	2,638,387.87	0	2,638,387.87
Total					11,473,267.54

Recommendations

- a) The Committee recommends that Management must ensure that all outstanding arrears from Gamcel are paid, and evidence of payment is provided to the FPAC for verification within 30 days from the adoption of this report.
- b) The Committee further recommends that the Permanent Secretaries of the Ministries of Finance & Economic Affairs and Digital Economy should engage Gamcel to adhere to a strict payment plan to settle its obligations.

3.9.1 No imprest requests

During the review, the Committee noted that two (2) vouchers totaling D651,706 had no requests or application letters for imprest disbursements. The details are shown below:

Issue Date	Completion Date	Retirement Date	Vendor IRD	Vendor Name	Imprest Amount D
8/31/2020	31/12/2020	31/12/2020	700948	Balkisu Garber	325,816.00
11/11/2020	31/12/2020	31/12/2020	700948	Balkisu Garber	325,890.00
TOTAL					651,706.00

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that the Accountant General must ensure that all payments are duly and appropriately authorized as per the dictates of Section 9 (7) (f) of the Financial Regulations.

3.9.3 No approval by the Permanent Secretary

The Committee observed that vouchers amounting to **D2,184,706** on imprest disbursements to the various Ministries and Departments were not approved by the Permanent Secretary, Ministry of Finance & Economic Affairs. The details are shown below:

Issue Date	Completion Date	Retirement Date	Vendor IRD	Vendor Name	Imprest Amount (D)
19/8/2020	30/9/2020	30/9/2020	5002401	Lamin Jatta	100,000.00
16/1/2020	1/31/2020	1/31/2020	5000774	Lala Camara	80,000.00
31/8/2020	31/12/2020	31/12/2020	700948	Balkisu Garber	325,816.00
11/11/2020	31/12/2020	31/12/2020	700948	Balkisu Garber	325,890.00
26/5/2020	31/5/2020	31/5/2020	300423	Dawda L. Ceesay	500,000.00
25/11/2020	30/11/2020	30/11/2020	5000583	Essa M. Jagne	50,000.00
19/8/2020	30/9/2020	30/9/2020	5002456	Ensa Jawara	100,000.00
31/8/2020	31/12/2020	31/12/2020	127972	Abdou K. Jallow	264,000.00
20/10/2020	31/12/2020	30/12/2020	134370	Touray B. Cham	231,000.00
10/11/2020	31/12/2020	31/12/2020	401090	Momodou L. Darboe	208,000.00
TOTAL					2,184,706.00

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that AGD should provide to the FPAC for verification within 30 days from the adoption of this report, approval letters from the Permanent Secretary for all the affected MDAs.

3.12.2.1 Uncleared Balances in the statement of outstanding commitments

An outstanding balance of **D46,360,820** in respect of commitments from Ministries, Agencies and Embassies/Missions was noted. The details are shown in the table below:

Description	Amount as per Financial Statements (D)
AGENCIES	97,760.00
FOREIGN MISSIONS	38,115,060.00
MINISTRIES	8,148,000.00
	46,360,820.00

Recommendations

- The Committee recommends that the Accountant General ensure that outstanding commitments are cleared every month or at the end of the year.
- The Committee also recommends that AGD should send a Circular requesting MDAs to comply. Where challenges exist, MoFEA should update the Financial Regulations.
- The Committee further recommends that MDAs must avoid signing agreements that grant waivers without the required approval.

3.14.1 Inadequate disclosure on Financial Instruments

The Committee observed that The Government of The Gambia (GoTG) had made several payments in 2016, 2017, 2018 and 2020 towards share acquisition (equity participant) at various Development Banks owing to its membership. The financial statements only disclosed the amount paid towards Government equity participation in these banks (investment held by government) during the current year.

There were no further disclosures and explanations to enhance the understanding of Other Equity Participation such as the Type of Investment, the Number of Shares subscribed, Contributions made and received, as well as Arrears resulting from these subscriptions from inception to date. These tantamount to inadequate disclosures in the Financial Statements.

Note-9b				
Purchase of Financial Instruments Including BTL For The Year Ended 31-Dec-2020				
Description	Schedule	Actual 2020 D'000	Budget 2020 D'000	Previous 2019 D'000
Other Equity Participation		16,248.00	16,248.00	180,000.00
Total Purchase of Financial Instruments		16,248.00	16,248.00	180,000.00

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that the Accountant General should ensure that adequate disclosures are made regarding equity participation in accordance with the Cash Basis of IPSAS.

3.14.2 No effective monitoring of Government Investment on Financial Instruments

The Government of The Gambia had subscribed for shares (Equity Participation) in the under-listed development banks. These shares allow the government to access loans and other membership privileges. The Ministry of Finance and Economic Affairs has attached a staff to each of these development bank to monitor the government's interest. Details are shown below:

Name of Bank
African Development Bank
Islamic Development Bank
ECOWAS Bank for Investment and Development
BSIC Group

Recommendations

- a) The Committee recommends that the Ministry of Finance should ensure adequate and effective controls to monitor Government investments in these development banks.

- b) The Committee further recommends that the Ministry of Finance must establish the number of shares acquired by the Government of The Gambia, the contribution made, and any outstanding arrears in these institutions.

3.15.2 Misuse of Contingency Fund

The committee observed that the Summary Statement of Expenditure Reallocated from the Unallocated funds on the financial statements revealed that expenses amounting to **D474,383,920** were made from the contingency fund vote to cater for expenditures that should have been budgeted for. It was further noted that the virements made from the contingency fund were not in accordance with the dictates of the Constitution.

Recommendation

- a) The Committee recommends that the MoFEA must ensure that the Contingency Fund is used for its intended purpose as dictated by the Constitution.
- b) The committee further recommends that these funds are assigned to the affected line Ministries that they are meant for.

3.16.2 Absence of commentary on the Deposits disclosed as liability in the Statement of Financial Position

The Committee observed that there were no commentary notes in respect of the measurement and recognition of the deposit cash balances disclosed as financial liabilities in the Statements of Financial Position. Hence, the basis of recognition and justifications used by the Accountant General in the measurement and recognition of deposit balances as a liability under the statements of financial position could not be confirmed.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that AGD must ensure adequate disclosure of the cash deposit balances in the Notes to Financial Statements.

3.18.5 Transit Accounts not cleared at the year end

Review of the General Ledger payable transit accounts revealed six (6) General Ledger accounts amounting to **D104,563,216.40** that were not cleared by the year end.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that AGD must ensure that all required accounting entries are made to ensure that the accounts are cleared by the year end.

3.19.3 Non-functional Losses Advisory Committee

Attempts to review Minutes of meetings of the Losses Advisory Committee were unsuccessful since no meeting was held in 2020. This suggests a weak dysfunctional committee.

Recommendations

- a) The committee recommends that the Accountant General should liaise with the Ministry of Finance so that the Losses Advisory Committee can be revived as soon as possible.
- b) The Committee further recommends that the Police should provide an update of the investigation into the matter.
- c) Moreover, the Losses Advisory Committee, through the Ministry of Justice, should also institute civil proceedings.

3.20.1 Misclassification of Loan Payments (Principal and Interest)

The Committee observed that the following Principal repayments were wrongly classified as Interest payments and remained unadjusted or not corrected. Details are shown below:

Date	Payment Voucher Number	Loan ID	Payee	Amount in USD	Amount in D
19/11/2020	50PV20000395	2GM-0075	IDB	1,257,010.25	65,000,000.03
16/09/2020	50PV20000323	2GM-0075	IDB	837,451.69	43,396,746.58
Principal Payment Voucher					
02/06/2020	50PV20000183	V0890	IDA	1.097.00	55,907.00
TOTAL				2,094,461.94	108,452,653.61

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that the AGD must ensure that the payments are properly classified under proper heads, evidence of which should be provided to the FPAC within 30 days from the adoption of this report.

3.20.2 Difference between loan payment schedule and payment bill received from creditors

The Committee observed differences of **D55,201,519.85** between the payment schedule and the bill sent in by the creditors in respect of Interest and Principal payments held in the Meridian Loan System, leading to excess payments made to creditors. This showed that loan repayments are not in conformity with loan schedules.

Recommendations

- a) The Committee recommends that the Permanent Secretary, Ministry of Finance must ensure that the payment schedule in the Meridien system is matched with that of creditors.

- b) The Committee further recommends the Permanent Secretary should give the FPAC updates on the mismatch of the schedules within 30 days from the adoption of this report.

3.20.6 Failure to prepare a borrowing plan in 2020 by the Ministry of Finance

The annual Borrowing Plan from the Ministry of Finance was not made available to the FPAC.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that the Ministry of Finance must prepare an Annual Borrowing Plan in accordance with the Public Finance Act and submit it to the National Assembly as part of the Budget Execution Report.

3.20.7 Failure to present minutes of loan negotiation

The Committee observed that two (2) loans were contracted and signed by the Government of The Gambia during the period under review. However, the Minutes of these negotiations were not presented to the FPAC for review. It could not be ascertained whether relevant stakeholders, including experts from the Loans Unit, were involved in the negotiation processes during the acquisition and signing of these loans. The details are shown below:

CREDITOR	PROJECT	DATE SIGNED	LOAN AMOUNT
EIB	Gambia Renewable Energy Component 4	24/12/2020	EUR8,000,000.00
Saudi fund for development	The Rehabilitation and development of Banjul International Airport Project Phase 11 Additional Loan	24/02/2020	SR 45,000,000.00 EQUIV. US\$12 MILLION

Recommendation

- a) The Committee recommends that the Minister and Permanent Secretary of the Ministry of Finance must ensure that Minutes of the negotiation of Loan Agreements are kept.
- b) The Committee further recommends that all loans and grants brought to the National Assembly for ratification must be accompanied by the Minutes of the negotiations.

3.21.1 Non-Repayment of State Lending to State Owned Enterprises (SOEs)

The Committee observed on the Audit report that the Government on-lend loans amounting to **D1,792,700,000** were issued to the underlisted SOEs. The details are shown in the table below:

Agreement Date	Borrower	Instrument Name	Amount in Foreign Currency (\$)	Amount in D
28-03-08	Gambia Civil Aviation Authority	BJL international improvement project	10,000,000	512,200,000
10-05-18	Gambia Telecommunication	GAMTEL Broadband network project	25,000,000	1,280,500,000
Total				1,792,700,000

Review of the repayment schedule revealed that the above SOEs consistently failed to repay the on-lend loans on their respective due dates. Audit findings indicated that Gamtel pays only two interest payments after which it consistently failed to repay Government on their respective due dates. This has resulted in payments from Government totalling **D43,371,523.30** as interest on loans to the creditor (Exim Bank of China). Details below are the payments made by Government.

Date	Payment Voucher No	Description	Payee	USD	D
08/06/2021	50PV21000185	Interest payment on Exim of China loan	Exim Bank of China	262,130.64	13,392,254
29/09/2021	50PV21000313	Interest payment on Exim of China loan	Exim Bank of China	263,409.27	13,597,186.6
01/03/2022	50PV22000055	Interest payment on Exim of China loan	Exim Bank of China	309,973.18	16,382,082.7
Total				835,513.09	43,371,523.3

Recommendations

- a) The Committee demands that the Directorate of Debts and Loans at the MoFEA provide the FPAC with the status of loans on-lend to parastatals and their repayment status.
- b) The committee also recommends that MoFEA should develop a framework in consultation with the SOE Commission on the on-lending, guarantees, and subsidy arrangements to SOEs, to ensure their ability to meet their obligations when they fall due in line with the provisions of the Public Finance Act, 2014.

3.23.2 Failure to submit Financial Statements within the statutory timeline

The committee noted that the Accountant General submitted the 2020 Financial Statement on 29 June 2022, eighteen (18) months after the end of the financial year contrary to the dictates of the Public Finance Act.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that the Accountant General must ensure the timely preparation and submission of the Consolidated Financial Statement of the Government within the statutory deadline for audit.

3.23.5 Failure to explain material differences between budget and actual amount

Part 1 of the Cash IPSAS 1.7.12 requires an explanation of the material difference between actual amounts and budget amounts. This explanation will assist users in understanding the reasons for material departures from the approved budget for which the MDAs are held publicly accountable. This requirement of the IPSAS was not met in the audit of these financial statements.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that the Ministry of Finance should provide a detailed explanation of the material differences between the budget and the actual expenditure.

CHAPTER 2 – PUBLIC INSTITUTIONS AND AGENCIES

2.1 Gambia Investment and Export Promotion Agency (GIEPA)

The following statutory deductions were not paid to the relevant authorities on time:

PAYE

MONTH	DATE PAID
February	16/03/2020
April	26/05/2020
May	16/06/2020
July	17/08/2020
August	21/09/2020
October	20/11/2020
November	28/12/2020
December	20/01/2021

Social Security Contributions

MONTH	DATE PAID
April	26/05/2020
May	16/06/2020
July	17/08/2020
August	21/09/2020
November	29/12/2020
December	20/01/2021

Recommendations

- a) The Committee recommends that the Finance Department of GIEPA should ensure that all statutory deductions are remitted to the relevant authorities on time.
- b) The committee further recommends that GIEPA should provide FPAC with copies of the letters on these deductions within 30 days from the adoption of this report.

2.1.2 Fuel Management

The Committee noted that fuel coupons purchased for generator use were recorded. However, there was no logbook which shows how these coupons are used.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that Management must ensure that a generator fuel usage logbook is maintained, often checked, and reviewed appropriately.

2.1.3 Bank Reconciliation

The Committee noted that there was no evidence of review on the December reconciliation prepared for the Trust Bank Operating Account.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that reconciliations prepared should be reviewed by the Finance Manager and evidenced by signing the report.

2.2 Gambia Revenue Authority (GRA)

2.2.1 Property, Plant & Equipment (PP&E) – Land Valuation

The Committee noted a total NBV of Land amounting to **GMD374.463 million**, as at 31st December 2021. Based on assessment of the values, it was noted these values were dating back to 2007 and excluded the Brikama Addition in 2021. The Committee is of the view that Management should consider a revaluation to ensure that the Land Values reflected in the Financial Statements reflects the market value.

Date acquired	Asset category	Description	Cost	CY NBV
01/01/2007	Land	Amdalaye Post	1,750,000.00	1,750,000.00
01/01/2007	Land	Farafenni Post	1,350,000.00	1,350,000.00
01/01/2007	Land	Sareh Ngai Post	75,000.00	75,000.00
01/01/2007	Land	Nyamanari Post	250,000.00	250,000.00
01/01/2007	Land	Sabi Post	450,000.00	450,000.00
01/01/2007	Land	Basse (A) Post	950,000.00	950,000.00
01/01/2007	Land	Basse (B) Post	3,500,000.00	3,500,000.00
01/01/2007	Land	Bansang Post	1,500,000.00	1,500,000.00
01/01/2007	Land	Soma (A) Post	1,250,000.00	1,250,000.00
01/01/2007	Land	Soma (B) Post	375,000.00	375,000.00
01/01/2007	Land	Giboro - Post	750,000.00	750,000.00
01/01/2007	Land	Banjulinding	1,250,000.00	1,250,000.00
01/01/2007	Land	Revenue House	350,000,000.00	350,000,000.00
01/01/2007	Land	FARAFENNI TAX OFFICE	450,000.00	450,000.00
01/01/2007	Land	BASSE TAX OFFICE	750,000.00	750,000.00
01/01/2007	Land	BRIKAMA BA TAX OFFICE	125,000.00	125,000.00
01/01/2007	Land	BRIKAMA TAX OFFICE	3,300,000.00	3,300,000.00
01/01/2007	Land	KANIFING INSTITUTIONAL	4,500,000.00	4,500,000.00
29/01/2021	Land	Brikama	1,888,000.00	1,888,000.00
Total			374,463,000.00	374,463,000.00

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that Management should review the above and conduct a revaluation of the lands owned by the Authority to ensure that Land Values in the Financial Statements reflect recent market values.

2.2.2. Sundry Receivables – GSM Levy Collection

Due Year	Details	Balance outstanding (GMD)
2017	GSM Levy Collection fees due	9,250,218.80
2018	GSM Levy Collection fees due	4,528,961.04
2019	GSM Levy Collection fees due	5,272,763.64
2020	GSM Levy Collection fees due	350,506.07
2021	GSM Levy Collection fees due	6,822,861.74

The Committee discovered that the Authority made arrangement through a letter from Office of The President, dated 30th March 2015 (Ref: OP249/171/01/Temp:/(10-RG), regarding the collection of the GSM Levy. The letter also specifies that whatever amount is collected will be distributed between **GRTS** and **GRA** at a ratio of **95%:5%**. The Committee however noticed that that the closing balances relating to the 5% GSM Levy fees due to the Authority was yet to be settled or recovered for the current year, dating back to 2017.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that the outstanding amount should be pursued by Management to be recovered and utilized for positive contribution towards the Authority.

2.2.3. Staff Loans – Vehicle Loans Disbursed

Section 1103 of the GRA Staff Service Rule (*5th Edition*) Vehicle Loan (d) states: “A Bill of Sale must be tendered to the Authority in the case of a loan to purchase a motorcar or motorcycle”. The Bill of Sale in respect of the following vehicle loan disbursements was not provided. It was claimed that this only affects the 50/50 Vehicle Loans which is not stated in the Service Rule.

Employee Number	Amount (GMD)
148046	300,000
146344	300,000
123567	300,000
400999	300,000
123568	300,000
144733	300,000
120136	200,000
120166	200,000

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that Management should ensure that the policy is further developed to make sure that all loan practices within the Authority in relation to the loan process is documented for clarity and in line with recommended practice.

2.2.4. Staff Medical Scheme

Upon review of the Medical Scheme, the Committee noted that all Employee of the Scheme receive a medical card to be tendered at the various clinics which forms the basis of admitting the patient and the bill is later sent to the Authority for settlement. Medical Cards of Staff that left the authority in 2021 were requested but it was claimed that the cards were destroyed once received from the Ex-Staff. Documentation to ascertain that the cards were returned was not provided.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that Management should improve on the process by ensuring that a basic form is filled and signed when cards are returned, whenever a staff exits the service. This will ensure that there is a document trail for the Authority to confirm that the cards are returned.

2.2.5. Terms of Reference – Finance Audit Risk Committee (FARC)

The Committee discovered that the Directors of Technical Services, Enterprise Risk Management and IT have been added to the FARC. It was further noted that the Chairperson directed the Secretary of the FARC to develop Terms of Reference (TOR) for the FARC following its expansion. This was however not provided to the FPAC for review.

Recommendation

- a) The Committee recommends that Management and the Board should develop a detailed TOR covering all aspects of the FARC to ensure that the objectives are achieved.
- b) The Committee further recommends that the revised TOR should be provided to the FPAC for review within 30 days from the adoption of this report.

2.2.6. Internal Audit

The Committee noted the following issues about the Authority's Internal Audit Department:

- i. Responses in the Internal Audit Reports – Responses to audit queries are incorporated in all reports; however, they do not state the given timeline to implement audit findings, and the implementing department or personnel is not stated.
- ii. Date of Completion of the Final Performance Audit Report – The internal audit report of the Gambia Revenue Authority (GRA) for the Financial Year ending 31st December 2021 was dated 3rd of October 2022, which is 10 Months after the year end. This is late since timely reporting is key for the Internal Audit function.
- iii. Quarterly Internal Audit Reports – Quarterly Internal Audit reports were not provided to external Auditors to ensure that these reports are in line with the approved work plan of the Authority.

Recommendations

- i. The Committee recommends that Management responses to audit queries must state the timeline and the personnel responsible to further assist the department in ensuring that the findings raised are addressed on a timely basis.
- ii. The Committee also recommends that the Unit should make sure that final reports are concluded/finalized in a timely manner for timely implementation by the various departments.

- iii. The Committee further recommends that Quarterly Reports should be provided in line with the annual work plan for adequate monitoring between the reports and approved work plan.

Specific Recommendations

- a) The Statement of the Board Chairperson and the Organogram of Gambia Revenue Authority (GRA) should be included in the annual Activity Report.
- b) The Graphs in the Activity Report should have corresponding tables or page references.
- c) The revised Staff Vehicle Loan Policy of GRA should be submitted to the FPAC within 30 days from the adoption of this report.

2.3 Independent Electoral Commission (IEC)

The Independent Electoral Commission (IEC) presented its annual Activity Report, audited Financial Statements for the years ended 31st December 2017, 2018 and 2019. The GPPA has not done any Procurement Compliance review of IEC since 2017. During the interface with the Board and Management of IEC, the Committee observed that:

Year Ended 31st December 2017

2.3.1 Income

The Committee made following observations on the IEC's income:

A. Letter of Advice

The Committee noted that correspondence relating to the monthly subvention received from the Ministry of Finance Auditors was not provided to external Auditors for review

B. Receipts from Replacement of Voter's Card

The Committee noted that the list of individuals that paid for voter's card replacement was not provided for reconciliation with the total of **GMD675,141** recorded as other income, neither were the copies of receipts issued to individuals upon payment for replacement cards.

C. Other Income

The Committee noted that supporting documents for the transactions listed below were not provided to external Auditors for review:

<u>Date</u>	<u>Amount (GMD)</u>
26-4-17	126,998.46
31-5-17	746,000.00

Recommendation

- a) The Committee recommends that Management must investigate the issues regarding the commission's income and ensures that the weaknesses highlighted are addressed.
- b) The Committee further recommends that the Commission must enhance the controls and review process on its income.

2.3.2 Fixed Deposit Investment

The Committee noted that the investments made by the Commission reveal the following:

A. Investment Appraisal – Fixed Deposit

Investment appraisal was not conducted by the IEC for its fixed deposit at Eco Bank (G) Ltd.

B. Interest on Fixed Deposit

The interest of 8% per annum on the fixed deposit investment of **GMD5 Million** was not accrued under interest income in the Financial Statements as at 31st December 2017.

Recommendation

- a) The Committee recommends that investment appraisal should be conducted periodically, in line with proper investment practice.
- b) The Committee further recommends that investment income should be recognised in line with the accrual accounting concept, for proper financial disclosure.

2.3.3 Payroll

The Committee noted that the following during review of the Payroll System of the Commission:

A. Staff Appraisal

There was no evidence of staff appraisal in line with Section 10.1.1 of the IEC Service Code.

B. Head Count Report

The head count report of the IEC staff stationed in the following regions was not provided:

- i. Basse
- ii. Kerewan
- iii. Janjanbureh
- iv. Mansakonko
- v. Banjul
- vi. Kanifing
- vii. Election House (Head Office)

Recommendation

- a) The Committee recommends that Management should ensure that annual staff appraisals are conducted.
- b) The Committee further recommends that head count should be conducted annually to enhance controls on the Commission's Payroll.

3 Payables

During review of the payables the Committee noted the following ledger accounts with negative balances indicating overpayments for which no justifiable explanation was provided:

<u>Details</u>	<u>Amount (GMD)</u>
SSHFC Payable	274,436.00
VAT	24,819.78
Other Accruals	8,899.89

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that Management must investigate the above issues on the payables account and ensure that these errors in the books of accounts are rectified immediately.

2.3.4 Staff Loans

The Committee made the following observations during review of staff loans:

A. Third-Party financier Loans

- i. The January 2017 deductions of **GMD24,999.98** and February 2017 deductions of **GMD24,999.98** were paid to S&S Properties for the purchase of land for senior IEC staff. This was not credited in the Staff Loan ledger, but the payment has been debited.
- ii. Monthly deductions of GMD2,500 from two IEC employees from January to September 2017 were not credited in the ledger but payments were debited for 5 months.

B. Staff Loans

It was noted that loans given to staff were not in line with Section 27.2.3 of the IEC Service Code. The following staff in Grade 5 were entitled to GMD20,000.

<u>Staff</u>	<u>Grade</u>	<u>Entitled (GMD)</u>	<u>Amount Given (GMD)</u>
Palanding Badjie	Grade 5	20,000.00	30,000.00
Dam Gaye	Grade 5	20,000.00	30,000.00

C. Differences Between Ledgers and Schedules

The Committee noted that differences between the following amounts as per Ledger and amounts as per Schedules with regards to the Receivables ledger for staff loans.

Account code	Balance as per Ledger	Balance as per Schedule	Difference between Ledger and Schedule
	GMD	GMD	GMD
1260 Personal Loans	536,746.00	826,219.45	289,473
1261 Building Loans	610,600.00	625,124.47	14,524.47
1262 Staff 1*9	428,401.00	399,947.70	28,453.30

Recommendations

- a) The Committee recommends that postings regarding third-party financier loans are monitored properly to ensure that posting errors do not recur.
- b) The Committee further recommends that Management should ensure that there is full compliance with the loan policies.
- c) Additionally, the committee recommends that the Loan Schedules are reconciled with Loan Ledgers, which will further improve the monitoring aspect between the Monitoring Schedules and the Accounting Schedules.
- d) Furthermore, the committee recommends that Management should considers automating the staff loan process in line with modern practices.

2.3.5 Fuel Management

From the review of IEC’s Fuel Management System, the Committee noted that that the fuel Logbook did not capture the acquisition of fuel coupons to ascertain the running or current fuel coupon balance at any specific time. Although there was a fuel allocation policy in place, no related reconciliations were being done.

Recommendation

- a) The Committee recommends that the fuel logbook should be updated, and Management should ensure that all acquisitions are captured for detailed reconciliations.
- b) The Committee further recommends that a fuel allocation policy should be maintained to further improve fuel management and monitoring.

2.3.6 Property, Plant & Equipment

The Committee noted that the following during review of Property, Plant and Equipment:

A. Capitalisation Policy

Some items were capitalized when they should have been expensed. According to the IEC Accounting Manual, assets valued at GMD5,000.00 or more and have a useful economic life of one year or more are booked as fixed assets capitalised.

B. Fixed Asset Register

During review of the Fixed Asset Register, the Committee noted that that the Commission maintains a manual Fixed Asset Register in a logbook.

C. Capital Grant

The Committee noted that that no grant income was released during the year under review in relation to the grant for the Commission’s motor vehicles that has a closing balance of **GMD25,628,572**. An opening balance difference was also noted on the capital grant account, amounting to **GMD579,194**, for which no documents were provided for review.

D. Capital Funding Account

As per Note 6 of the 2017 Financial Statements, the capital funding account has a movement of **GMD800,000** for which no supporting documents were provided to ascertain that the accounting treatment applied is accurate.

E. Asset Schedule

The Committee noted that differences between the Fixed Asset Schedule and the figures in the Trial Balance as at 31st December 2017 as shown below:

Asset Name	Amount as per Asset Schedule	Amount as per Trial Balance	Difference
	GMD	GMD	GMD
Election Materials	37,565,145	37,441,443	122,702

Motor Vehicles	49,100,000	48,500,000	6,000,000
----------------	------------	------------	-----------

Recommendations

- a) The Committee recommends that Management should always comply with the Commission's Fixed Asset Capitalisation Policy.
- b) The Committee further recommends that Management should explore the possibility of automating the Fixed Assets Register.
- c) Additionally, the Committee recommends that the opening balance difference must be investigated and rectified to ensure that such differences do not exist in future.
- d) Furthermore, supporting documents relating to the movement in the Capital Fund Account should be provided to the FPAC within 30 days from the adoption of this report, for review to confirm the basis of movement.
- e) Moreover, the Committee recommends that Management should carry out a detailed reconciliation between the Asset Schedule to the Financial Statements to ensure the Net Book Value reflected in the Balance Sheet is not misstated.

2.3.7 Cash & Cash Equivalent

During review of the closing balances relating to Cash and Cash Equivalents, the Committee noted that the final 31st December 2017 bank reconciliation's Cash Book balance did not agree with the Accounting System's Cash book balance as summarized below:

Bank	Balance as per Accounting System	Balance as per Bank Reconciliation	Difference
	GMD	GMD	GMD
CBG A/C	436,268	195,332	240,936
TBL A/C	(465)	(21,161)	(12,696)
Eco Bank A/C	(54,257)	40,963	(13,394)

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that Management must look into the above reconciliation issue and make sure that the differences are investigated and resolved.

Year Ended 31st December 2018

2.3.8 Finance Unit

The Committee noted material errors in the postings of cash and non-cash transactions owing to the Finance Team not fully understanding the software in use, due to lack of training.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that Management should investigate the above and ensures that the accounting software is updated and the staff are adequately trained on it.

2.3.9 Fixed Asset

The Committee noted the following about the Commission's Property, Plant and Equipment:

A. Fixed Asset Verification Exercise

An annual fixed asset verification exercise was not conducted.

B. Insurance of Building

The building was not insured against fire and other perils.

Recommendations

- a) The Committee recommends that Management should ensure that an annual asset verification is conducted and documented to improve the controls on the assets of the IEC.
- b) The Committee further recommends that Management should assess and effect insurance coverage on key assets of the Commission to minimize the risk of high financial losses in the event of any eventuality.

2.3.10 Information Technology Review

The Committee noted that the IT Unit maintains vital information such as the Voter Registration database and Finance Information, on the IT Server. The following weaknesses were observed:

A. Offsite Backup

There was no official backup kept offsite for the safeguarding of the information collected.

B. Testing of Backups

It was confirmed that backups are performed and saved on hard drives but the backups are not tested to ensure that the data saved on them has no issues.

C. Security of Server Room

The room where the server with all the information is kept, needs to be further improved and secured with fire extinguishers and fireproof doors.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that Management should look into the above queries or weaknesses highlighted and ensure the IT aspect of the Commission is further improved.

2.3.11 Updating of Service Rulebook

The Committee noted that the Service Rulebook needs to be updated to capture the following:

A. Bonus Payments

The bonus payment processes and procedures are not documented.

B. Risk, Inducement and Responsibility Allowance

Risk, Inducement and Responsibility Allowances were paid but these were not stated in the Service Rulebook.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that Management should update the Service Rulebook to capture all employee entitlements.

2.3.12 Human Resource Management

The committee observed the following on the human resource aspect of the IEC:

A. Temporary Staff

Temporary staff whose contracts were not provided to Auditors were paid monthly wages.

B. Staff Loans – Other Loans

Out of the closing staff loan balances, the other loan category of **GMD64,220** was noted with no breakdown or supporting documents from Management.

Recommendation

- a) The Committee recommends that Management should ensure that staff contracts are maintained for all personnel.
- b) The Committee further recommends that all staff loan categories are adequately monitored with supporting schedules capturing loan issued and repayments made.

2.3.13 Procurement

The Committee noted the following expense with a single invoice attached but the amount exceeded the GPPA single source threshold:

Date	Details	Ref.	Payee Amount (GMD)
05.03.18	Election Materials	RTGS ESI	2,746,011

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that Management must investigate the above to ensure that there is compliance; Single Sourcing approval should always be obtained from GPPA.

2.3.13 Accounting Errors

The committee noted the following on the accounts of the Independent Electoral Commission:

A. Payable Balance – Posting Error

Debit balances on the following payable ledger accounts indicate posting errors:

Details	Amount (GMD)
Environment Tax Payable	36,427
SSHFC Cont. Payable	367,886
Other Accruals	8,899
VAT Liability	35,379

B. Suspense Account

An amount of **GMD40,963** was noted sitting in the Suspense Account on the Balance Sheet with no supporting documents provided to ascertain the posting in the ledger.

C. Debtors Balance

The following negative staff loan balances, which mean an overpayment of staff loan repayments by the staff, were noted, indicate posting errors.

Details	31st Dec 2018
Staff Personal Loans	222,285
Educational loans	23,933

D. Capital Grant

The annual amount to be released to the Income Statement in Note 8 on Motor Vehicle Capital Grant was not done in line with the accounting treatment for Capital Grant.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that Management should investigate the above and ensure that the accounting errors are adjusted to make sure that the figures reported in the Financial Statements are accurate.

2.3.14 Fuel Management

The Committee noted from review of fuel purchases during the year that the fuel purchased was not recorded in the logbook for proper monitoring and control.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that the fuel log should be updated on a regular basis for adequate monitoring and control.

Year Ended 31st December 2019

2.3.15 Property, Plant & Equipment

The Committee noted the following from review of the Property, Plant and Equipment:

A. Asset Register

Management did not provide any Asset Register to the Auditors for 2019. Only the 2018 Asset Register was provided with no 2019 depreciation charges incorporated to arrive at the 2019 closing Net Book Value as per the Financial Statements.

B. Fixed Asset Schedule – Opening Balance Difference on Cost

Differences were noted between the Fixed Asset Schedule closing balance as at 31st December 2018 signed audit report and the 2019 Fixed Asset Schedule opening balance.

Recommendation

- a) The Committee recommends that Management should ensure that the Asset Register is updated and reconciled with the Net Book Value in the Financial Statements.
- b) The Committee further recommends that reviews should be conducted to ensure that all signed audit balances are reflected in the Accounting System of the Commission.

2.3.16 Government Subvention Acknowledgement

The Committee noted that acknowledgement of receipts was not sent to the Government when allocations were received, to complete the document trail for the transaction.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that Management should be sending acknowledgements to Government when allocations are received, to complete the document trail on receipts.

2.3.17 Human Resource Management

The Committee noted the following from review of the Human Resource aspect of the IEC:

A. Leave Outstanding Schedule

List of outstanding staff leave as at 31st December 2019 was not provided to external Auditors.

B. Late Payment of Statutory Deductions

Income Tax and Social Security deductions for January, March, April, May and June 2019 were not paid on time.

Recommendations

- a) The Committee recommends that a Leave Outstanding Schedule should be maintained to ensure adequate monitoring.
- b) The Committee also recommends that all statutory deductions must be paid on time to minimize the risk of fines and penalties.

2.3.18 Expenditure Review

The Committee noted the following issues during the review of the Commission's expenditure:

A. Payment based on Proforma Invoice

Several payments were made based only on the Proforma Invoice.

B. Procurement of Air Tickets

In October 2019, an amount of **GMD200,391** was spent on Air Tickets with Citi Travel Agency but there was no evidence of sourcing quotations from other suppliers.

Recommendation

- a) The Committee recommends that all payments must be backed by a proper Invoice, not just the Proforma Invoice.
- b) The Committee further recommends that Management should ensure full compliance with GPPA Rules, especially regarding Single Sourcing.

2.3.19 Fuel Management

During review of fuel management, the Committee noted the following issues:

A. Distribution List

The distribution list was not attached to some fuel procurement transactions.

B. Generator Time Log

A Generator Time Log was not available on the fuel supplied for Generator Consumption.

C. Fuel Allocation/Distribution Policy

A fuel allocation policy was not maintained by the Commission, in line with best practice.

Recommendations

- a) The Committee recommends that a Distribution List should be maintained for all fuel purchased to ensure adequate review and monitoring.
- b) The Committee further recommends that a Generator Time Log should be developed and utilised to improve the controls on fuel purchased for the Generator.

- c) Moreover, the Committee recommends that Management must develop a Fuel Allocation or Distribution Policy.

Specific Recommendations

- a) IEC needs to include an Organogram in its annual Activity Report to highlight the role of the Internal Auditor.
- b) The IEC must provide to the FPAC, a detailed breakdown of the **GMD595,000** on Nomination Fees and revenue generated from Registration and Replacement of Voters Cards, within 30 days from the adoption of this report.
- c) A detailed breakdown of the **GMD2,724,951** must be provided to the FPAC within 30 days from the adoption of this report, to explain the interest received on loans.
- d) The IEC needs to provide the FPAC with a copy of the Contract Letter or Electoral Service Code, which was last reviewed in 2018.
- e) Furthermore, IEC must provide the FPAC with copies of the Appointment Letters of all its Commissioners with evidence of the drawbacks paid to them, within 30 days from the adoption of this report.

2.4 National Nutrition Agency (NaNA)

The National Nutrition Agency (NaNA) presented its annual Activity Report, audited Financial Statements for the years ended 31st December 2020 and 2021, and the GPPA Procurement Compliance Report for consideration by FPAC. During the interface with the Board and Management of NaNA, the Committee made the observations detailed below.

3.1.1 National Nutrition Council

The Committee observed that there is no functional National Nutrition Council as dictated by law.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that Management must make follow up with the Office of the Vice President to ensure that a new Council is set up without further delay.

3.1.3 PIC & PSC Meeting

The Committee observed with grave concern that the Project Implementation Committee (PIC) and Project Steering Committee (PSC) held meetings only once for the period under review.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that Management must ensure that the PIC and PSC meets at least once every quarter as required, to discharge their functions as an oversight committee, to be able to add value to the Agency.

3.2.4 Difference Between the Financial Statement and the Activity Report

The Committee noted from the review of the Agency's 2020 Activity Report and Financial Statement, significant variance on the reported income and expenditure, as shown below:

Year	2020 Activity Report GMD	2020 Financial Statement GMD	Variance (GMD)
Subvention	18,214,036.31	10,608,571 .00	7,605,465.31
Expenditure	18,189,189.28	18,430,628.00	-241,438.72

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that Management must ensure the accuracy and consistency of data in the relevant financial information shared with the public.

3.3 Internal Control

The Committee noted missing Folio Number references of correspondence in personnel files.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that Management should ensure that all staff Personal Files are correctly referenced and arranged chronologically.

3.3.2 No IT Service Continuity

The Committee noted that the Agency did not have a backup concerning NaNA's operating account data for protection and recovery, to be stored in a secure offsite storage facility.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that Management must make sure that an IT service continuity plan for the data kept off-site, is put in place, updated and tested regularly.

3.3.3 Hall Booking Sheet

The Committee discovered that the booking sheet for the Hall Rentals was not furnished to external Auditors with all relevant details such as PV Numbers, Receipt Numbers and Paying-In Slip Numbers, which are essential for referencing and reconciliation purposes.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that Management must ensure that there is proper booking records on collections of the Agency's Hall Rentals revenue, with controls to mitigate revenue leakages.

3.4 Revenue

The Committee noted that the Agency's restaurant was rented out to a catering service provider (Jabbi Conference and Catering Service) for **GMD72,000** per annum. The restaurant had an outstanding rent of **GMD85,250** as at 31st December 2020.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that Management must immediately recover the outstanding rent from the restaurant service provider and take action to avoid recurrence in future.

3.5 Expenditure

The Committee noted that from July to December 2020 that Management Fees from the Social Safety Net Project (SSNP) amounting to **GMD 5,495,140** were paid to all staff at different rates. Although Board approval was provided to external Auditors, the basis of the rates applied in the absence of detailed calculations showing the rates applicable could not be ascertained.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that Management should furnish the FPAC with evidence supporting the basis of these calculations within 30 days from the adoption of this report.

3-5.2 Late Payment of Withholding Tax

The Committee observed that the Agency's Withholding Tax returns were not remitted on time.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that Management must ensure timely payments of Withholding Taxes to the Gambia Revenue Authority.

Specific Recommendations

- a) The NaNA Payroll for 2021 needs to be provided to FPAC within 30 days from the adoption of this report, to explain the increases from January to December.
- b) The composition of the National Nutrition Council needs to be revisited; Office of the Vice President (OVP) must be engaged to explain their lack of meetings.

2.5 Public Utilities Regulatory Authority (PURA)

The Public Utilities Regulatory Authority (PURA) presented its annual Activity Report and audited Financial Statements for the year ended 31st December 2020. The GPPA's last Procurement Compliance Report on PURA was for 2017 and 2018. GPPA's review for 2019 to 2022 was scheduled for November-December 2023. During interface with the Board and Management of PURA, the Committee observed some key issues.

2.5.1 Payroll not reviewed

The Committee noted that the payroll was prepared monthly for the period under review. However, there was no evidence in the form of signature to confirm that they were reviewed by a Senior Official for the months of January and February 2020.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that the Monthly payroll prepared should be subjected to review by the HR Department, which is evidenced by a signature.

2.5.2 Late Payment of PAYE Taxes

The Committee noted late payments of PAYE taxes to Gambia Revenue Authority (GRA).

Recommendation

The Committee recommends the timely payment of PAYE and all other statutory deductions. This must be done on or before the 15th day of the following the month.

2.5.3 Staff Personal Files

The Committee noted that no Job Descriptions, Staff Appraisal, Medical Certificate, Confirmation of Appointment or Certificate of Character was found in the personal files of some of the staff.

Recommendations

- a) The Committee recommends that all relevant personal documents of the employees should be filed in their personal files.
- b) The Committee further recommends that the Human Resource staff must conduct a special audit of the staff's personal file to fix all gaps.

2.5.4 Lack of a Provisioning Policy

The Committee observed that the Authority does not have a provisioning policy. The provision made is largely based on advice from the external auditors. The provision made last year of **D11,085,425** related to very long debts due from private companies. However, debts due from Government institutions are not provided for, irrespective of how long they have been overdue.

Recommendations

- a) The Committee recommends that a comprehensive provisioning policy should be developed and approved by the Board before it is adopted. This policy should be included in the Finance Manual.
- b) The Committee further recommends that PURA must institute legal actions against all defaulting institutions.

2.5.5 Categorisation of staff costs

The Committee is concerned that not all staff-related costs are categorised and reported as staff costs in the Trial Balance and Financial Statements. Only 2100 - STAFF COST and 2200 - STAFF ALLOWANCE were reported as Staff Costs in the Financial Statements. The following costs are shown as General Admin costs:

2105 - Medical expenses
2309 - Communications
2316 - Staff Car Scheme
2401 - Overseas Training Expenses
2403 - Local Training Expenses
2607- Staff Uniform

The Committee also noted that Stationery and Office Supplies (mainly staff provisions) are all included in one account i.e., 2301 - Stationery/Office Supply.

Recommendations

- a) The Committee recommends that Management should ensure that the Chart of Accounts is amended to group all staff-related costs under the same heading.
- b) The Committee further recommends that the classifications and groupings are reflected in the Finance Manual; Stationery Costs and Office Supplies should be separated.

2.5.6 Internal Audit (various items)

a) Audit plan

The Audit Work Plan prepared by the Internal Auditor was approved by the Director General instead of the Board. Review of this plan has not featured in any Board Meeting in 2020.

b) Staffing

The Committee noted that the Audit Manager does not have any assistant(s) who would do the detailed work, which the Manager would later review and report on.

c) Audit Work Findings

There was no indication as to whether previous audit findings were pending or resolved by the persons responsible.

d) Vetting of Payments

The Internal Auditor was involved in the pre-auditing of payment vouchers whereas, ideally, the Internal Audit should not be implementing control processes.

e) Presentation of reports to the Board of Directors

The Internal Audit reports were not presented to the Board of Directors in the year 2020.

f) Manual

The Internal Audit Manual was not presented to external Auditors for review.

Recommendations

The committee recommends that the Board of Directors and Management should ensure that:

a) Audit plan

The Internal Audit Work Plan should be approved by the Board of Directors not Director General.

b) Staffing

Additional audit staff should be hired to support the Internal Audit Manager.

c) Audit Work Findings

The status of previous audit findings should be included in current audit reports.

d) Vetting of Payments

The Internal Audit Department should not be part of the payment process.

e) Presentation of reports to the Board of Directors

The Board should request the Internal Auditor to present quarterly reports on the audit findings.

f) Manual

The Internal Audit Unit/Department should develop an Audit Manual to guide its operations.

2.5.7 Board Matters

The Committee noted the following from review of Board related matters of PURA:

- a) There is currently no Term of Reference (TOR) for the Board, covering all aspects of their work beyond those reflected in the PURA Act.
- b) The Board is expected to meet quarterly as per the Act but only three Meeting Minutes were provided for review.

- c) No evidence of discussion and approval of the 2019 Financial Statements could be seen in the Board Minutes reviewed.
- d) No evidence of discussion and approval of the 2019 Management Letter was seen in the Board minutes reviewed.
- e) No evidence of the matters relating to the discussion and approval of the Internal Audit Work Plan for 2020 was seen in the Board Minutes reviewed.
- f) No evidence of follow-up on the implementation of both the external and internal audit recommendations was seen in the Board Minutes.
- g) It was not possible to determine if the various Department Heads were invited to present their Activities Reports for the period of the Board meetings (quarterly as expected) apart from the Director of Finance who presents the quarterly Management Accounts.
- h) No Sub-Committees were created to deliberate on issues relating to Governance, Risk Management and Control, among others.

Recommendations

The Committee recommends that the Board should ensure the following corrective measures:

- a) Prepare a Board Charter, which specifies how the Board should conduct its business.
- b) Meet every quarter as required by the PURA Act.
- c) Review and approve the annual Financial Statements of the Authority and Management Letter from the External Auditors.
- d) The Board should monitor the implementation of the auditors' recommendations in the Management Letter. It should assign a Senior Manager staff like the Director of Finance or Internal Audit Manager to be responsible for briefing them on this at Board meetings.
- e) Discuss and approve the Internal Auditor's Annual Plan and monitor the progress of its implementation during the year.
- f) Invite respective Department Heads to brief the Board on their activities for the quarter.
- g) Consider setting up Sub-Committees such as Audit/Risk and Finance to deliberate on issues such as control, risk management and governance, and make them report to it.

Specific Recommendations

- a) Most of the Activity Reports submitted hardly mention what the internal Audit Unit has been doing. PURA should share its current Strategic Plan with the FPAC for review, within 14 days from the adoption of this report.
- b) The difference of **D100,000** on the Regulatory Fees of Radio Stations must be investigated and reported to the FPAC within 30 days from the adoption of this report.
- c) The Finance Manual of PURA should be updated and FPAC should be updated on this development within 60 days from the adoption of this report.

CHAPTER 3 – PUBLIC HEALTH FACILITIES

3.1 Bansang General Hospital

The Bansang General Hospital presented its annual Activity Report and audited Financial Statements for the years ended 31st December 2019 to 2021. During the interface with the Board and Management of Bansang General Hospital, the FPAC made some observations.

3.1.1 Board Meeting

The Committee noted that the Board of the Hospital met only once in 2019 and 2020 (7th September 2019 and 24th October 2020) respectively. While in 2021, they met three times (6 March, 11 September and 18 December 2021).

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that the Management should ensure that Board meetings are held at least once quarterly as per the dictates of the Act.

3.1.2 Excess Board Members

The Committee noted that there are nine (9) Board Members instead of seven (7) as required by the Medical Services (Amendment) Act for the three years under review (2019, 2020 & 2021). The Committee further noted that the additional Board Members were the Governor of Central River Region (CRR) and Director of Health Services (CRR).

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that the Ministry of Health should provide to the FPAC a detailed explanation for the excess number of the Board Members within 30 days from the adoption of this report, and take immediate measure to regularize it.

3.1.3 Increment of Board Allowances

The Committee noted with grave concern that the Board discussed and approved the increment of its allowances from **GMD1,500** to **GMD3,000** during a meeting held on 11th September 2021, Also, during the meeting held on the 18 December 2021, the Board members agreed again to further increase the Board allowance from **GMD3,000** to **GMD5,000** without any evidence of approval by the Minister for both increments.

Recommendations

- a) The Committee recommends that Management should provide to the FPAC the Minutes conveying the increment within 14 days from the adoption of this report.
- b) The Committee further recommends that the matter should be investigated by the Ministry of Health and reported to the FPAC within 30 days from the adoption of this report.
- c)

3.1.4 Auction without Approval

The Committee noted that in 2019 the Hospital engaged in an assets disposal exercise and sold five (5) vehicles through auctioning but there was no evidence of approval by the Minister.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that Management must seek the Minister's approval for all auctions as dictated by the Medical Service Act.

3.2.3 Overdrawn Subvention Account

The Committee noted that the subvention account number 11056003301 with the Trust Bank Limited was overdrawn. This has increased the bank charges of the Hospital over the years. The details are summarized below:

2019		
Date	Details	Amount (GMD)
31/03/2019	Closing bank balance	(15,419.10)
31/07/2019	Closing bank balance	(861,562.54)
31/12/2019	Closing bank balance	(663,007.15)
2020		
31/01/2020	Closing bank balance	(1,593,530.79)
30/06/2020	Closing bank balance	(162,661.76)
2021		
31/07/2021	Closing bank balance	(44,242.62)
30/09/2021	Closing bank balance	(105,383.32)
31/12/2021	Closing bank balance	(22,628.05)

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that the Hospital should adhere to the Public Finance Act and Regulations, with regards to the management of their funds.

3.4.2 Lack of Notification of Subvention Received

The Committee noted that the Hospital does not receive notification of monthly subvention received from the Ministry. They rely on the monthly Bank Statements to update the Ledgers.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that the line Ministry should ensure compliance with the dictates of the Financial Regulations in relation to the management of budgets of subvented institutions.

3.4.7 No Training Policy

The Committee noted that the Hospital did not have a Training Policy. However, there were expenditures made on training during the period under review. In 2020 training was provided for two staff at MDI and UTG costing **GMD37,675** and **GMD52,400** respectively. In 2021 training was provided for a staff at MDI at a cost of **GMD44,694**.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that Management should ensure that a staff Training Policy or plan that outlines relevant processes and procedures for training is put in place.

3.5.4 Payment of Unapproved Allowances

The Committee noted that the Hospital paid monthly **Supervision Allowances** amounting to **GMD7,665** to senior staff and bi-monthly **Firewood Allowances** of **GMD6,500** during the three years under review. The above allowances were not listed among the PMO approved allowances.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that the Management must cease payment of the said allowances, pending approval from the Personnel Management Office.

3.7.3 Procurements Made from Unregistered GPPA Suppliers

The Committee noted that procurements amounting to **GMD593,900** were made from unregistered suppliers.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that the Management should ensure that all procurements are awarded only to GPPA-registered suppliers.

3.2 Bundung Maternal and Child Hospital (BMCH)

The Bundung Maternal and Child Hospital (BMCH) presented its annual Activity Report and audited Financial Statements for the years ended 31st December 2016 and 2017. During interface with the Board and Management of BMCH, the Committee made the observations below.

3.2.1 Cash Collection and Custody

The Committee discovered that the cash collections are banked weekly and the collection is kept in a till during the intervening period. However, the till did not have a proper locking system.

Recommendation

- a) The Committee recommends that Management must have a proper safe for keeping of the cash collected.
- b) The committee further recommends that banking of cash collections should be done more frequently, in accordance with the Financial Regulations.

3.2.2 Non-Current Assets (NCA) Register

The Committee noted with concern that the Procurement Unit was found to be overseeing the Non-Current Assets register. It was also observed that items procured by the procurement unit are directly delivered to the user Department rather than transiting them through stores. The NCA register was also found to have missing key information relating to the assets such as Costs and Reference Numbers. Certain items were not found at the location recorded in the register.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that the Management must ensure that an updated Asset Register is provided for review by the FPAC for review within 30 days from the adoption of this report.

3.2.3 Stores Management

- a) The Auditors observed that the physical tally cards as well as the soft copies are not up to date with the movements of both food items and drugs. It was also observed that in some instances, issuances and receipts have not been recorded in the books.
- b) Some of the drugs are unsealed and used whilst still on shelves. There was no evidence that such issuances were administered by a trained staff; these were also not recorded.
- c) The stores were also not found to be in air-conditioned state to ensure that drugs which required cool temperatures are preserved.

Recommendations

- a) The Committee strongly recommends that Management must keep proper record of the movement of items to ensure safekeeping and to implement proper monitoring and review mechanism to enhance compliance.
- b) The committee further recommends that unsealing and usage of drugs from the stores must cease immediately. Drugs should be only dispensed at the appropriate points and by trained staff.
- c) More importantly, the Committee recommends that Management should immediately install air conditioners at the store to ensure that drugs maintain appropriate potency.

3.2.4 Free Maternal Services

The Committee noted with grave concern that remunerations had been supplemented from the Drug Revolving Fund (DRF), which is solely meant for procurement of supplementary drugs.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that the Board and the Ministry should come up with immediate measures to remedy the situation.

Specific Recommendations

- a) The NAO should work with BMCH to ascertain the actual monthly values on their Repairs and Maintenance.
- b) To sustain Maternal and Child Health services, a system needs to be put in place to reimburse health facilities according to the number of deliveries they conduct.
- c) Minutes of the Board meetings for 2017 and 2018 must be provided to FPAC within 30 days from the adoption of this report to verify if the fuel issue was reported to the Board.
- d) The Board and Management must ensure that all prior-year audit matters are resolved.

3.3 Bwiam General Hospital

The Bwiam General Hospital presented its annual Activity Report and audited Financial Statements for the year ended 31st December 2017 to 2021 for consideration by the FPAC. The Committee observed the following during interface with the Hospital's Board and Management.

3.3.1 Policy Documents

The Committee noted that Bwiam General Hospital did not maintain a Financial Manual for the period under review.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that Management must ensure that policy documents concerning the Hospital's key processes and procedures are instituted for the effective and efficient execution of their mandate.

3.3.2 Lack of Approved Budgets for Other Charges and Development

The Committee learnt that when the approved budgets for the period under review were requested by external Auditors, only the Manpower budget was provided to them. The Hospital did not provide the budget for Other Charges and Development.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that Management should make sure that a detailed budget including Manpower, Other Charges and Development are prepared and approved by the relevant authorities.

3.3.3. Board Members

The Committee observed that in 2017 the Hospital had eleven (11) Board Members and from 2018 to 2021 it had ten (10) Board Members.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that the Ministry of Health should provide a detailed explanation to the FPAC within 30 days from the adoption of this report, for the excess number of Board Members and take immediate measure to regularize it.

3.3.4. Unaccounted DRF Revenue

The Committee discovered that an amount of **D25,000** was collected through the sale of DRF tickets. However, **D18,525** was recorded in the revenue books leaving an unaccounted balance of **D6,525**. Auditors could not ascertain whether these funds were deposited into the Hospital's bank account or not.

Recommendations

- a) The Committee recommends immediate recovery of the full amount of D6,525 from the concerned official, failure of which the matter should be reported to the Police.
- b) The committee further reports that Management must ensure that amounts collected are appropriately and completely banked and evidence presented to the Auditors.

3.3.5. Private Receipt Book

The Committee noted that ten (10) General Triplicate Receipt (GTR) books were used by the Hospital since July 2019 for the internally generated funds. These were not supplied by GPPC. Consequently, review of the receipt books revealed the following anomalies:

- a) Receipt books were acquired from a private supplier (Quality Print) instead of GPPC
- b) Receipts were issued to patients by the Hospital Administrator
- c) Receipt Book with serial number **001** to **050** issued to the Administrator was not presented for audit inspection and was also not accounted for in the books of accounts.

Recommendations

- a) The Committee recommends that Management must immediately cease the use of the private receipt books. All receipt books must be exclusively procured from GPPC.
- b) The Committee further recommends that Management must ensure that all funds of the Hospital are managed by the Accounts Department, which also manages receipt books.
- c) The Committee equally recommends that Management must make sure that the missing receipt book is presented to the FPAC within 30 days from the adoption of this report.

3.3.6. Segregation of Duties

The Committee observed from the review of the internally generated funds that there was no segregation of duties in place due to the following:

- a) The Administrator manages the hall, collects cash, and issues receipts to patients,
- b) The Administrator stamps the Medical Certificates/Medical Report Forms, collects cash from patients, and issues receipts.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that Management must ensure that there is adequate segregation of duties in relation to collection, recording, receipting and accounting of proceeds from the activities surrounding the internally generated funds.

3.3.7. Subvention Advice not Received

The Committee noted that the Hospital does not receive Subvention Advice from the Ministry of Health to notify them about how much was sent to the Central Bank of The

Gambia as their monthly subvention. The Hospital only relies on the amounts posted in its bank account.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that the Management should request that the Ministry sends them monthly subvention advice to ensure that the correct amounts are posted in their bank account.

3.3.8. Spending from Internally Generated Funds

The Committee noted that part of the monies received from sales of Drug Revolving Fund (DRF) tickets and issuance of Medical Certificates were expended on the procurement of DRF tickets, payments to Doctors, and other payments. These expenses were not accounted for in the Cash Book and were also not recognized in the Financial Statements.

Recommendations

Henceforth, the Committee recommends that the following measures must be carried out:

- a) All monies received should be banked with deposit slips retained as evidence.
- b) All the payments from the receipts should be posted in the Cash Book and General Ledger, and adjustments made to the Financial Statements respectively.
- c) All disbursed miscellaneous expenditure, regardless of urgency, should be done through the Petty Cash funds.

3.3.9. Understatement of Domestic Revenue

The Committee discovered that receipt books recorded in the Domestic Revenue for the period 1 July 2019 to 31 December 2021 were misstated in the Financial Statements as shown below:

Domestic Revenue Analysis for Misstatements			
Year	Amount As Per		Misstatements
	Receipt Books	Financial Statements	
2019	57,600.00	18,218.75	39,381.25
2020	69,900.00	37,621.25	32,278.75
2021	131,570.00	146,990.00	(15,420.00)
TOTAL	259,070.00	202,830.00	56,240.00

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that Management must ensure that the adjustments are made accordingly and presented to the FPAC within 30 days from the adoption of this report.

3.3.10. Africell Payments

The Committee observed that there were no traces of rent payments for the two years (1 December 2015 to 30 November 2017) from the Cash Book and Bank Statements, amounting to **D260,000**. The details are shown in the table below:

Payment Date	Period Due	Amount as per		Outstanding Balance DMD
		Agreement GMD	Cash Book / Bank Statement GMD	
	1-12-2015 to 30-11-2016	130,000.00	-	130,000.00
	1-12-2016 to 30-11-2017	130,000.00	-	130,000.00
	TOTAL	260,000.00	-	260,000.00

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that Management must present to the FPAC evidence of payment made by Africell for the two-year period and how it was accounted for, within 14 days from the adoption of this report.

3.3.11. Unaccounted Medical Certificate

The Committee observed that Medical Certificates were issued for D500 to patients upon request. However, the Committee noted that 74 medical certificates amounting to **D37,000** were not accounted for. They were also not recorded in the Medical Certificate Register.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that Management must ensure that this discrepancy is investigated and evidence provided to the FPAC on how the certificates were accounted, for within 30 days from the adoption of this report. Failure of which, the amount must be fully recovered from the officer responsible.

3.3.12. Domestic Revenue not Banked

From a review of the "Domestic Account", the Committee discovered that from the revenue collected for the period 1 July 2019 to 31 December 2021, an amount of **D115,625** was not lodged into the bank account. Also, two receipts amounting to **D52,600** were raised in respect of Hall Rental and Food Services, but did not indicate the amount relating to food services and hall rental respectively.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that Management must ensure that the amount is recovered and paid back into the account and evidence is provided to the FPAC within 30 days from the adoption of this report.

3.3.13. Unaccounted DRF Tickets

The Committee noted with concern that exhausted DRF ticket books amounting to **D179,175** were neither banked nor recorded in both the collector's book and the cashier's Cash Book.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that Management must ensure that the amount is recovered and paid back into the account within 30 days from the adoption of this report.

3.3.14. Presented GPPA Forms

The Committee observed that the Procurement Officer did not complete forms 003 (single sourcing procurement) and 004 (Request for Quotation) for summarizing the procurements.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that, henceforth, all the required GPPA forms must always be completed as required.

3.3.15. Difference between Payment Vouchers and Supporting Documents

The Committee noted from the review of some Payment Vouchers that a difference of **D47,341** exist between the Payment Vouchers and their respective attached Receipts.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that Management must provide the relevant supporting documents to the FPAC within 30 days from the adoption of this report for review. Failure to do so, the amount must be recovered in full immediately.

3.3.16. Withholding Tax

The Committee discovered from a sample of payments made to suppliers that Withholding Tax amounting **D107,266.80** was not deducted from the payment made to suppliers.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that going forward, the Hospital must deduct Withhold Tax and remit it to Gambia Revenue Authority in a timely manner.

3.3.17. Board Allowances

The Committee observed that Minutes relating to the period 2017 were not available for review. However, payments amounting to **D194,000** were made to Board Members for the same period.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that the Board should ensure that meetings are held per the Act's requirement and Minutes prepared for reference purposes.

3.3.18. Vacancy Advertisement

The Committee noted that the Hospital advertises vacant positions through the its Facebook page, Notice Boards and at the Gates only.

Recommendations

The Committee recommends that the Hospital should use other mediums of advertisement such as Newspapers for a wider coverage.

3.3.19. Staff with the Same Employment Number

The Committee noted that some staff of the Hospital shared the same employee/payroll number.

Recommendation

The committee recommends that Management must ensure that all employees of the Hospital have their own unique payroll number.

3.3.20. Over/Under Deduction of Income Tax

The Committee noted that there were over and under deductions of Income Tax on some staff for the period under review.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that Management should ensure that a thorough review is done on the payroll system to ensure that accurate deductions are done.

3.3.21. Allowances Approval

Two different allowance schedules that were said to be for the Hospital from 2019 to date were in existence. The Allowance Schedule was signed by the Board Chairperson and the former CEO. There was no evidence to prove that the allowances were discussed and approved by the Board since the Board Minutes were not presented for review.

Recommendation

The committee recommends that the Board must not pay any unauthorized allowances.

3.3.22. Staff in Wrong Designations

The Committee discovered that two of the Hospital's staff, the Store Manager and the Human Resource Manager, were holding positions that do not correspond to their academic qualifications and experience. They are both Ophthalmologists.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that Management should review these appointments and ensure that the personnel with the right credentials and experience are given the opportunity to manage the positions.

3.3.23. Failure to Resume Duties after Completion of Studies

Review of selected personnel files revealed that a Registered Nurse and Anaesthetist, left the country after completing his studies with the American International University of West Africa (AIUWA). He signed a bond on 15 July 2019 to serve the Hospital for a minimum of four years after the completion of his studies.

The bond clearly states that, when he fails to do so, he would be liable to pay the Hospital the salary paid to him for the two years of his studies plus 50% of the cost incurred on him by the Hospital. His main surety was the acting Deputy Chief Executive Officer, as at the time of signing the bond. The guarantor of the staff concerned was redeployed to Farafenni with a letter dated 27 April 2022 and referenced DDHS/AD/202/04, without servicing the bond,

Recommendation

The committee recommends that the Hospital must follow up on the guarantor to make the necessary payment within 30 days from the adoption of this report.

3.3.24. Retirement

From the review of some personnel files, the Committee noted that some staff were long overdue for retirement. Some overdue staff were still working with the Hospital as of 31 May 2022:

Recommendation

The committee recommends that the HR Manager of the Hospital should make sure that all affected individuals are notified of their retirement prior to their retirement date.

3.3.25. Non-Payment of Income Tax

Income Tax for 2017 and 2018 amounting to **D740,547.38** including penalty charges of **D72,072** and interest of **D154,079.70** was not remitted to Gambia Revenue Authority.

Recommendations

- a) The Committee recommends that these amounts must be immediately paid to GRA, and the evidence furnished to FPAC within 30 days from the adoption of this report.
- b) The Committee also recommends that henceforth, Management must ensure that all tax deductions are remitted to GRA by the 15th of the following month.

3.3.26. Improper Maintenance of Petty Cash

The Committee noted that there was no fixed float maintained for Petty Cash, and replenishment was not based on spending. A fixed amount of **D30,000** is given monthly irrespective of the petty cash balance. The petty cash book also lacks features such as Date, Voucher Number and Payee. The transactions were also not categorised and recorded in sequential order.

Recommendation

The committee recommends that Management must make sure that there is a fixed maximum float level and a minimum replenishment level for the Hospital's Petty Cash.

3.3.27. Wrong classification of Petty Cash Expenses

The Committee noted that Petty Cash expenses were all classified under food and food service, regardless of the expense type incurred.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that Management should ensure that Petty Cash analyses are done and adjustments made to correct the misclassifications.

3.3.28. Donated Assets not Recorded

The Hospital received donations from various partners, individuals, charity foundations, organisations, and international bodies. However, the Committee noted that donated assets received were not recorded in the Donation Register for the period under review.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that Management should ensure that a Donation Register is maintained and that all donated assets are recorded in the Fixed Assets Register.

3.3.29. Assets not Recorded in the Asset Register

During the verification of assets by external Auditors, some assets were seen at the Hospital but not recorded in the Asset Register.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that Management must ensure that all the assets of the Hospital are immediately recorded in the Asset Register.

3.3.30. Drug Dispensed at the Pharmacy

The Committee noted that the pharmacy did not keep records of drugs that were dispensed or issued to the patients for the period under review.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that Management must ensure that all drugs dispensed from the pharmacy are recorded and signed for accountability and reconciliation purposes.

3.3.31. Unseen Central Medical Store Invoices

The Committee noted from the reconciliation between the Central Medical Store's (CMS) data against the records kept by the Medical Storekeeper that some medical items issued to the Hospital were not recorded by the Storekeeper.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that Management should make sure that all items received from CMS are properly accounted for, invoices are properly filed and both the Stock Cards and the Asset Register are adjusted accordingly.

3.3.32. Expired Drugs

During inspection of the inventory of expired medication, the Committee noted that some medical drugs were declared expired from the medical control drugs register and tally cards as per manufacturers guarantee. However, these were neither included on the destructed list of inventories for expired medication nor presented to external Auditors for review. Furthermore, some medical drugs were declared expired, but they were issued to patients. The Committee also learnt that some expired drugs were found on the shelves of the pharmacy.

Recommendations

- a) The Committee recommends that the Hospital must desist from issuing expired drugs.
- b) The Committee further recommends that Management should ensure that all expired drugs are removed from the shelves and dispose off appropriately.

3.3.33. Unconfirmed Drugs

The Committee discovered variances between the Stock Cards balance and physical stock count of the medical items conducted on 14th and 15th June 2022 (medical stores and surgical stores), including control drugs.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that Management should improve on the internal controls surrounding inventory management to ensure effective and efficient service delivery.

3.3.34. Improper Management of Control Drugs

The Committee noted that control drugs which were meant to be stored in a secured place to avoid being stolen or misused due to their fatality when consumed wrongly, were found laid on the unsecured shelves of the store due to the unavailability of space at the secure shelf.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that Management should ensure that the Drug Register is properly maintained and a secured place is created to store control drugs.

3.3.35. Unapproved Single Sourcing

The Committee noted that procurement of fuel by the Hospital was single sourced to Atlas Petrol Station, without any evidence of approval from the Gambia Public Procurement Authority (GPPA).

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that Management must ensure that the GPPA Act and Regulations are adhered to in all aspects of procurements.

3.3.36. Fuel Management

During review of fuel management within the Hospital, the Committee noted the following:

- a) Fuel coupons were managed by the Chief Executive Officer, and a Nurse Attendant (Fuel Attendant), managed the fuel from the period of May 2019 to December 2021.
- b) There was no evidence that the register maintained by the Nurse Attendant was reviewed by a senior officer of the Hospital.
- c) Some of the fuel was stored in plastic gallons at the fuel depot, without proper ventilation.

Recommendation

- a) The Committee recommends that Management should make sure that an up-to-date Fuel Register is maintained and managed by the Accounts Department.
- b) The Committee further recommends that Management must find a proper storage tank for the fuel to avoid any disaster.

3.3.37. Unrecorded Fuel Coupons in the Register

The Committee noted from the Payment Vouchers that fuel coupons amounting to **GMD250,000** were procured but not recorded in the fuel coupon register.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that Management should provide a detailed account of the coupon usage with evidence to the FPAC for verification within 30 days from the adoption of this report.

3.3.38. Fuel Issuance

During the review of the Fuel Register, the Committee noted that some of the purposes for the issuance of fuel were not related to the Hospital's operations.

Recommendations

- a) The Committee recommends that Management must ensure that internal controls are strengthened over the usage of fuel to avert mismanagement.

- b) The Committee further recommends that adequate justification must be provided to the FPAC within 14 days from the adoption of this report for using fuel for unrelated activities.

3.3.39. Minimum Staffing Norm for General Hospitals

Review of the minimum staffing norm for General Hospitals revealed that the Hospital fell short of the minimum requirement because some positions were understaffed.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that the Board should make sure that the minimum requirement as per the staffing norm is in place to achieve the objectives of the Hospital.

3.4 Farafenni General Hospital

The Farafenni General Hospital presented its annual Activity Report and audited Financial Statements for the years ended 31st December 2016 to 2021. The GPPA only had Procurement Compliance Reports for 2015 to 2017, which were treated by the National Assembly Select Committee on Health. During the interface with the Board and Management of Farafenni General Hospital, the Committee made the key observations below.

3.4.1 Cash Plan

The Committee observed that the Hospital did not prepare a Cash Plan for the financial years of 2020 and 2021, to help them in determining the monthly cash requirements for each quarter.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that the Chief Executive Officer (CEO) must ensure a Cash Plan is prepared and submitted to the Ministry of Finance.

3.4.2 Wrong Payment Voucher Numbering

The Committee observed that some Payment Voucher numbers were duplicated in 2021 since the same payment voucher numbers were allocated to more than three different suppliers.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that the Management must ensure that Payment Voucher numbers are never duplicated.

3.4.4 Procurement Process for the Hospital Sub-Accounts

The Committee observed that Procurements amounting to **GMD751,204.17** in 2020 and **GMD2,031,973.40** in 2021 from the Hospital Sub-Accounts did not undergo GPPA procurement processes.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that the CEO of Farafenni General Hospital must provide the FPAC, within 30 days from the adoption of this report, a detailed explanation of why the GPPA requirements were not adhered to.

3.4.5 Staffing

The Committee noted that the Hospital did not observe some of the minimum standards outlined by the Health Ministry. Among them is the non-availability of Perioperative and Public Health Officers and other categories in the Hospital designations which were understaffed.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that the CEO, in consultation with the Hospital's Board and the Line Ministry, should ensure that the staffing issues are resolved as a matter of urgency.

3.4.6 Refund for Scholarship Payment

The Committee discovered that Mamat Kebbeh was under the scholarship of the Hospital in August 2021. In September 2021, he got an MRC Holland Foundation scholarship. He wrote a letter on 27 September 2021 to inform the Management that he was going to make efforts to ensure that the University of the Gambia (UTG) refunds the Hospital all the amount that was paid on his behalf. There was no evidence of such a refund being made.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that the CEO should provide evidence of the recovery to the FPAC within 30 days from the adoption of this report.

3.4.7 Stale Cheque

The Committee noted that a cheque no. **05005616** dated 7 May 2018 amounting to **GMD59,587.40** was paid to Jah Oil on the 11/05/2018. Since then, the cheque has not been cashed by Jah Oil. It appeared as a stale cheque in the 2020 and 2021 bank reconciliations.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that Management must take necessary steps to resolve the issue.

3.4.8 Payments without Three Quotations

The Committee observed that procurements amounting to **D1,474,879.50** were made without obtaining the required three quotations.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that GPPA should investigate the non-compliance with procurement regulations by the Hospital and report to the FPAC within 30 days from the adoption of this report.

3.4.9 Tickets with Printing Error

The Committee learnt that some ticket books with printing errors were issued by the Hospital.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that Management must ensure that all revenue-earning materials are procured in line with the GPPC Act.

3.4.10 De-Aggregation of Procurement

The Committee noted that maintenance of building and facilities contracts amounting to **D933,772.00** did not follow competitive bidding. The amount involved exceeded the GPPA threshold of D500,000 and should have been tendered.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that GPPA must investigate the non-compliance with procurement regulations by the Hospital and report to the FPAC within 30 days from the adoption of this report.

3.4.11 Unapproved Allowances

The Committee noted that allowances paid to staff were not approved by the Board or the Ministry. The Hospital's Management did not provide any evidence of approval. A sample of the unapproved allowances are listed below:

- a) Call Allowance for all In-Charges
- b) Supervision Allowance
- c) SMT Allowance
- d) Duty Room Allowance
- e) Counselling Allowance
- f) Cash/Stores Allowance
- g) Double Shift Allowance
- h) Gas Filling Allowance

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that all unapproved allowances paid are immediately recovered from the authorizing authority, failure of which, the matter shall be reported to the Police.

3.4.12 Lack of Senior Management Meetings

The Committee noted that there was no evidence to show that Senior Management meetings were held during the period under review.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that Management must ensure that Senior Management meetings are held and signed Minutes are maintained and filed for record purposes.

3.4.13 Board Allowances

The Committee noted that the Hospital Management Board was being paid Allowances which were not determined and approved by the Minister.

Recommendations

- a) The Committee recommends that Management must correct the situation by liaising with the Minister for the determination and approval of the Board allowances.
- b) The Committee further recommends that all unapproved allowances paid must be recovered from the authorizing authority.

3.4.14 Board Meetings

The Committee observed that the Board meeting Minutes file showed that the Board held only two meetings in 2020 and three meetings in 2021.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that the Board should meet quarterly as stipulated by the Act, to enhance its oversight function.

Specific Recommendations

- a) Updates on the Management responses to the Management Letter points should be written down and submitted to the FPAC within 30 days from the adoption of this report.
- b) A report on the fluctuating rate of maternal mortality needs to be prepared and presented to the FPAC to enhance the committee's understanding of the trends.

3.5 Kanifing General Hospital (KGH)

The Kanifing General Hospital (KGH) presented its annual Activity Reports and audited Financial Statements for the years ended 31st December 2010 to 2018. The GPPA has not done any Procurement Compliance review for KGH since 2015. During the interface with the Board and Management of KGH, the Committee noted the findings below.

3.5.1 Unpresented Payment Vouchers

The Committee observed that the Hospital did not present some of its Payment Vouchers for audit inspection. The details below are samples of vouchers not presented for audit.

Date	Details	Cash Number	GMD
30/07/2010	Hospital Imprest		10,000.00
Sub Total			10,000.00
07/05/2012	QCell Ltd.		20,000.00
Sub Total			20,000.00
08/11/2015	Patients food and services	872	14,500.00
Sub Total			14,500.00
GRAND TOTAL			44,500.00

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that Management should make sure that the Payment Vouchers queried are provided to the FPAC within 30 days from the adoption of this report.

3.5.2 Payments without Adequate Supporting Documents

The Committee noted the Payment Vouchers below without adequate supporting documents:

Date	PV. No.	Description	GMD
07.04.10	-	Payment towards major plumbing work	5,000.00
12.04.10	-	Interim board sitting	14,500.00
23.04.10	-	Purchase of cartridge	2,700.00
21.05.10	-	Printing expenses for T-shirts	5,000.00
14.07.10	-	Purchase of gasoil	5,580.00
21.07.10	-	Provision for July 22 Anniversary	17,500.00
17.08.10	-	Board sitting allowance	14,300.00
Sub-Total			64,580.00
24.07.12	-	Purchase of material	7,750.00
28.12.12	-	Night duty allowance	14,100.00
28.12.12	-	Purchase of medical dispensing bags	6,000.00
Sub-Total			27,850.00
08.03.13	-	Payment of house rent	35,000.00
20.03.13	-	Payment of air ticket	13,800.00
Sub-Total			48,800.00
GRAND TOTAL			141,230.00

Recommendations

- a) The Committee recommends that all missing supporting documents should be provided to the FPAC within 30 days from the adoption of this report.
- b) The Committee further recommends that in future, all Payment Vouchers accompanied by relevant supporting documents, must be provided to the Auditors on time.

3.5.3 Non-Deduction of 10% Withholding Tax

The Committee noted with concern that the Hospital did not deduct Withholding Tax from suppliers to be remitted to Gambia Revenue Authority (GRA).

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that the Management should ensure that the Withholding Tax is deducted from suppliers or contractors and remitted to GRA as required by law.

3.5.4 Payments without Three Quotations

The Committee noted that procurements and payments amounting to **D230,672.50** were made without the required three quotations.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that the Management should ensure that all procurements made are in line with GPPA Rules and Regulations.

3.5.5 Assets not Recorded, Recognised or Disclosed

I. Motor Vehicles

The Committee noted with concern that the Hospital did not record, recognise, or disclose motor vehicles that it owned or controlled for the years 2010, 2011, 2012, 2013, 2014, 2015, 2016, 2017 and 2018. However, there was a record of vehicle operating expenses, including fuel purchases, in the Financial Statements.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that Management should ensure that all motor vehicles are recorded, recognised or disclosed in the Financial Statements.

3.5.6 Land and Building

The Committee noted that land and buildings were not recorded in the Asset Register and were not recognised in the Financial Statements for the years under review. This was disclosed in the Financial Statements, stating that the cost could not be determined because the Gambia Government did the construction of the facility. However, the Committee found out that Management did not liaise with the Gambia Government to get the cost of the land and buildings.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that Management should liaise with its line Ministry and the Department of Lands and Survey to determine the value of the land and building of the Hospital for recognition in the Financial Statements.

3.5.7 Hospital Equipment and Generators

The Committee observed that the Hospital maintained equipment and generators but did not record, recognise, or disclose them in the Financial Statements. The costs of these items were unknown because they were either donated or have been there since inception.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that Management should ensure that the Asset Register is updated and submitted to the FPAC for confirmation within 30 days from the adoption of this report.

3.5.8 Disposal of Assets

The Committee observed that most of the assets acquired from 2010 to 2014 were scrap and some were disposed off by the Disposal Committee. However, there was no documentary evidence to confirm these disposals during the years under review.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that Management should provide proof that some of the scrap assets were disposed off. The treatment of these disposals in the Financial Statements should be provided to the FPAC for confirmation within 30 days from the adoption of this report.

3.5.9 Difference in Cost between Fixed Asset Register and Financial Statements

The Committee noted differences in the cost of assets between the Fixed Asset Register and Financial Statements.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that Management should investigate these differences to ensure that the necessary adjustments are made and that the Financial Statements are adjusted accordingly in subsequent years.

3.5.10 Misclassification of Assets

The Committee noted the incorrect classification of assets in the General Ledgers used to prepare the Financial Statements. It was also observed that Revenue expenditures were classified into capital items for the period under review.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that Management should ensure that each class of transactions is correctly charged to their class of assets and the Financial Statements are revised accordingly.

3.5.11 Improper Upkeep of the General Store

The Auditors observed that the items were not properly arranged and there were no shelves in the store. The items were all over the place and some items could not be assessed for verification.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that Management should make sure that the stores are properly kept in an organized manner.

3.5.12 Pharmacy Stock Balances

The Committee noted that stock balances at the end of each financial year were not recognised in the Financial Statements and were not adequately disclosed to show the items involved. Nevertheless, it was disclosed in Note 1 (h) of the financial statements that there was no inventory evaluation as at the year end to ascertain the inventory closing balances.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that Hospital Management must ensure that stock is valued and end-year balances are recognized accordingly.

3.5.13 Expired Drugs

The Committee learnt that some of the expired drugs on the shelves were issued to patients.

Recommendations

- a) The Committee recommends that the Hospital must desist from issuing expired drugs.
- b) The Committee further recommends that Management should ensure that all expired drugs are removed from the shelves and dispose off appropriately.

3.5.14 Fixed Deposit Account

The Committee noted that the Hospital maintained a Fixed Deposit account with First International Bank (FIB) Gambia on 09 June 2016. The agreement between the Hospital and the Bank was not produced to confirm the Terms and Conditions of the Fixed Deposit. Below are the balances:

Year	Balance (GMD)
15/11/2016	197,568.53
27/03/2017	236,642.51
28/12/2018	178,255.17

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that the agreement should be provided to the FPAC to confirm the Terms and Conditions of the Fixed Deposit and the correctness of the figures recognised in the Financial Statements, within 30 days from the adoption of this report.

3.5.15 Accounting/Financial Manual

The Committee noted that the Hospital did not have its own Accounting/Financial Manual, detailing the processes and procedures of financial transactions. The Hospital uses the Central Government Financial Regulations.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that Management must put in place, as soon as possible, a detailed Financial Manual which will outline the Hospital's financial procedures and processes.

3.5.16 Service Rule

The Committee noted that the Hospital did not have its own Service Rules but uses central Government General Orders (GO) which is generic. There is the need for a Service Rule that is tailored to suit the Hospital's operations.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that Management should develop a detailed Service Rule regarding the operations and staffing of the Hospital.

3.6 Sheikh Zayed Regional Eye Care Centre (SZRECC)

The Sheikh Zayed Regional Eye Care Centre (SZRECC) submitted annual Activity Reports and audited Financial Statements from as far back as the year ended 31st December 2006 to 2020. However, owing to the initial agreement to cut-off the backlog from 2019 onward, the presentation of the annual Activity Report and audited Financial Statements of SZRECC covers the years ended 31st December 2019 and 2020. The GPPA did not present any Procurement Compliance Report on SZRECC. During the interface with the Board and Management of SZRECC, the Committee made the observations below.

3.6.1 Donation Register

The Committee noted that there was no Donation Register in place. A sample of the donations received includes two vehicles (Suzuki Jeep 4 wheel and Toyota Land Cruiser) cash amounts of **D19,000**, **D77,000**, **D2,217,250** in 2015, 2017, 2019 respectively, were also received.

Recommendation

- a) The Committee recommends that Management must put in place a Donation Register to record all donations received and submit it to the Committee for verification within 30 days from the adoption of this report.
- b) The Committee further recommends that Management should provide a detailed report of how the donations were accounted for, within 30 days from the adoption of this report.

3.6.2. Difference between Financial Statement and DRF Collection

The Committee noted differences between the reported amounts in the Financial Statements and the Drug Revolving Fund (DRF) revenue collections.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that Management must ensure that the differences are adjusted and the Financial Statements are revised accordingly.

3.6.3 Weekly Banking

The Committee noted that the Bank Statements and the Cash Book revealed that monies collected were banked on a weekly basis.

Recommendations

- a) The Committee recommends that Management should have a proper safe for keeping of cash collected.
- b) The committee further recommends that the banking of cash collection should be done more frequently in accordance with the Financial Regulations.

3.6.4 Improper Bank Reconciliation Statements

The Committee noted with concern that there was review on the Bank Reconciliation prepared by the Principal Accountant. The Committee further observed that it was not correctly prepared since unpresented cheques for one month were brought to the next month as uncredited cheques.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that Management must ensure that the Bank Reconciliations are correctly prepared and reviewed monthly.

3.6.5 Non-Maintenance of Revenue Cash Books

The Committee noted that revenue collectors do not maintain Cash Books to record all revenues received during the period.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that Management should ensure that all revenues collected are entered in a Cash Book to ensure accountability and transparency.

3.6.6 Ticket Book Register

The Committee noted that the Senior Revenue Collector did not record ticket books issued to Junior Revenue Collectors in the Ticket Book Register. Only ticket books received from the DRF office were recorded in the register.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that Management should make sure that the Senior Revenue Collector maintains proper records of all tickets issued to Junior Revenue Collectors for reconciliation and accountability purposes.

3.6.7 Non-Recording of Ticket Books in the Register

The Committee noted that the receipt books procured from GPPC were not recorded in the register for the period under review.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that Management should ensure that all receipt books received are recorded in the register.

3.6.8 Cash Payment without Documentation

The Committee noted that an amount of **D71,400** cash withdrawn was given to the CEO on his travel to Arusha, Tanzania, to buy two Westfield Bipolar Cautery, and for his incidental travel expenses. The Committee further noted that the payment was not supported by documentation like invoices and receipts. The details are shown below:

Date	Cheque Number	Details	Amount
10/08/2016	DD-SCBR	Incidental travel advances expenses	16 800.00
10/08/2016	DD-SCBR	Cost of two Westfield Bipolar Cautery	54,600.00
TOTAL			71 400.00

Furthermore, the Committee also noted with grave concern that payment vouchers amounting to **D1,549,501** were made without adequate supporting documents. The details are shown below:

Year	Amount GMD
2007	685 000
2008	125 631
2009	25 000
2010	128,470
2012	50 560
2013	13 800
2014	521 040
Total	1 549 501

Recommendations

- a) The Committee recommends that the Board take measures to recover the amounts of **54,600.00** from the CEO within 30 days from the adoption of this report.
- b) The committee further recommends that the Board take immediate measures to recover payments without supporting documents, amounting to **D1,549,501**.

3.6.9 Payments not recorded in the Cash Book

The Committee noted that payment vouchers totalling **D116,350** were not posted in the Cash Book. Details of the sample extracted are shown below:

Date	Details	Payee	Amount
5/3/2014	ARCOLLEY ENTERPRISE – Payt for Office stationeries and IT Consumables for first half Jan - June 2014 for SZRECC Office USED March 2014	ARCOLLEY Enterprise	66,350
3/2/2014	Galp Gambia Ltd-Payt for Vehicle & Generator fuel coupons for Szrecc Vehicle for the Month of Feb 2014	Galp Gambia Ltd	50,000
Total			116,350

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that Management should ensure that all the unrecorded payment vouchers are posted in the Cash Book and the adjustments are sent to the FPAC for verification within 30 days from the adoption of this report.

3.6.10 Duplication of Allowance

The Committee observed that the SZRECC entered into a contract in 2016 and 2017 to rent a furnished house located at Manjai Kunda for the CEO. The rent cost is **D175,000** per year with the payment plan of **D87,500** at the beginning of every six months. However, a review of the CEO's Payroll revealed that he was also paid a monthly rent allowance of **D1,500** in the year 2016.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that the Board must provide to the FPAC within 30 days from the adoption of this report, the grounds on which they relied for the payment of double allowance.

3.6.11 Contracts Committee

The Committee noted that the Contracts Committee of the SZRECC was inactive for the period under review, and procurements were made without evidence of the Contracts Committee meeting proceedings being recorded. The Committee further observed that the Centre also made a series of procurements from both within the country and overseas without evidence of following the required procurement processes. The details below are payments made on such procurements:

Date	Details	Cheque No.	Payee	Amount
27/01/2017	Payment of Ophthalmic Equipment	DD-SCBG	Apramed	1,635,826.65
27/01/2017	Payment of the cost of Hospital equipment	DD-SCBG	Carl Zeiss	773,861.27
3/14/2017	Payment for hospital equipment	DD	Soimed	2,966,448.00
9/13/2018	Payment of eye drops & consumables	DD-SCBG	Nano Vision	682,260.00
10/23/2019	Payment of eye drops & consumables	DD-SCBG-S2	Aurolab Trust	574,566.40
9/26/2019	Payment of eye drops & consumables	DD-SCBG-S2	Geuder AG	408,480.02
20/10/2020	Purchase of Anaesthetist items for the theatre	DD-S2BANK	Solmed Sarl	390,195.00
8/12/2020	Purchase of Anaesthetist items for the theatre		Eyegan Medical LLP	388,419.60

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that the Board must ensure that a well-functioning Contracts Committee is put in place and its proceedings are recorded for reference.

3.6.12 Overpayment of Salaries

The Committee noted that the Salaries of the Accountant and Cashier were overpaid by **D17,472** from January 2008 to December 2009. The details are shown in the table below:

Payroll No.	Designation	Basic as per Appointment Letter	Basic as per Payroll	Monthly Difference	No. of Months	Total
SZOOE	Accountant	2 388	2,865	477	24	11,448
SZ010	Cashier/Account Clerk	1 ,254	1,505	251	24	6,024
Total						17,472

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that Management must ensure that the matter is addressed and the differences are paid back to the Centre's account.

3.6.13 Teaching/National Duty Allowance

The Committee noted that Teaching/National Duty Allowance was paid to the following staff from January 2007 to August 2014, without evidence of Board approval. The details are shown below:

Name	Designation	Teaching/National Duty Allowance (GMD)	No. of Months affected	Total (GMD)
R. Winston Ceesay	Chief Executive Officer	12,600.00	20	252,000
O. Kiera	RN Ophthalmic	1 040.00	24	24,960
Sheriff Trawally	OMA/Cataract Surgeon	2,310.00	5	11,550
Awa Loum	SEN Ophthalmic	2 310.00	5	11550
Total				300,060

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that the Board should provide to the FPAC the grounds for the payment of these allowances within 30 days from the adoption of this reports, failure of which the amount should be refunded within 60 days from the adoption of this report.

3.6.14 Annual Increment on Pay Scale

The Committee noted that staff were not correctly shifted to their yearly incremental points as per their months of appointment or promotion. Instead, they are moved in January of each year, regardless of the effective month.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that Management must ensure that annual increments are based on the appointment or promotion month of the staff concerned.

3.6.15 150% Allowances Increment

The Committee noted that a Memo was raised by the former Chief Executive Officer, dated 2 July 2013, conveying the approval by the Interim Management Board of SZRECC for an increase of Top-Up Allowance, Call Duty Allowance and Board Allowance by **150%**. However, the meeting Minutes relating to the approval of the increment were not provided to the FPAC for review.

Recommendations

- a) The Committee recommends that Management must provide to the FPAC within 14 days of the adoption of this report, the Minutes conveying the increment of these allowances.
- b) The Committee further recommends that this matter must be investigated by the Ministry of Health and reported to the FPAC within 30 days from the adoption of this report

3.6.16 Staff Employment Number

The Committee observed that the staff of the Centre are not given unique employment numbers.

Recommendation

The Committee recommend that the Centre's Accounts Unit should give each employee a unique Employment Number for easy identification.

3.6.17 Leave of Absence without Salary

The Committee noted that the PMO gave approval for retrospective Study Leave without salary to Dr. Abba Hydera in a letter referenced 0800072/ (77) and dated 26 August 2020. The period of Study Leave was **1 August 2013 to 31 March 2015**. Prior to the retrospective approval, he was paid basic salary of **D4,778,33** for the period **1 August 2013 to 28 February 2014**.

Recommendation

The Committee strongly recommends that Management must ensure that the amount paid during the period of the leave without salary is recovered and paid back to the Centre immediately.

3.6.18 Lack of Loan Scheme

The Committee noted that loans were given to staff of the Centre during the period under review without a Loan Scheme.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that Management must ensure a Loan Scheme is instituted and that issuance of loans is within the requirements of the scheme.

3.6.19 Lack of Training Policy

The Committee noted that the Centre made payments of **D1,932,713** on staff training. However, there was no Training Policy in place.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that the Centre must develop a standard Training Policy to guide the training of the staff.

3.6.20 Assets not Tagged

The Committee noted that assets were not tagged with distinctive identification numbers.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that Management should tag or reference all the assets purchased.

3.6.21 Unverified Laptop

The Committee noted that the laptop issued to the IT Officer was not provided for verification.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that the Management should ensure that a follow-up is made to recover the laptop from the .Former IT Officer within 30 days; failure of which the matter shall be referred to the Police for investigation.

3.6.22 Lack of Inventory Register

The Committee noted that no inventory register was maintained for the period under review.

Recommendations

The Committee recommends that Management should ensure that inventory registers are maintained for all the stores.

3.6.23 Approval of Requisition

The Committee noted that Store Officers issue store items without the approval of user Department Heads on the requisition forms.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that Management must ensure that Store Officers adhere to the protocols and that no item is issued without the Department Head's approval.

3.6.24 No Stock Count Performed

The Committee noted that the Centre did not perform a stock count for the period under review.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that Management should ensure that stock counts are introduced and performed regularly to ascertain the correct records of stock balances.

Regional Ophthalmic Training Program (ROTP)

3.6.25 Non-Performance of Bank Reconciliation

The Committee noted that the ROTP Accountant did not perform Bank Reconciliations for the period under review.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that the ROTP Accountant must perform bank reconciliations.

3.6.26 Difference in Closing and Opening Monthly Cash Book Balances

The Committee noticed that there were differences between the closing Cash Book balance of a given month and the opening balance of certain subsequent months.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that all Cash Books should be adjusted in line with the recommendation of the external Auditors and presented to the FPAC for verification within 30 days from the adoption of this report.

3.6.27 Commercial Bank Account Opening

The Committee noted that the ROTP opened a Forex and Dalasi account with the Standard Chartered Bank when it was an NGO. The FPAC was not provided with any documents to prove that the Accountant General is informed of the existence of these two bank accounts:

Account Number	Account Type
0100131223200	GMD
2800131223201	Forex

Recommendations

- a) The Committee recommends that in future, the ROTP must seek approval from the Accountant General prior to opening accounts with any commercial bank.

- b) The Committee further recommends that the Accountant General must be informed about the existence of the currently opened accounts.

3.6.28 Unpresented Bank Statements

The Committee noticed that the following bank statements were not presented to the Auditors:

Year	Months
2010	August to December
2011	January to May
2012	February
2013	June, August and November
2014	May and July
2015	May
2016	April and June
2017	January
2019	March and September to December
2020	January to December

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that Management should provide the remaining Bank Statements to the FPAC for verification within 30 days from the adoption of this report.

3.6.29 Unverified Cash Book Postings and Bank Lodgements

The Committee noted that an amount of **GMD11,876,187** was received as per the receipt books but its lodgement into the bank account could not be confirmed due to the absence of Bank Statements. Out of the said amount transactions amounting to **GMD6,973,707** posted in the Cash Book could also not be confirmed.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that Management must provide to the FPAC evidence of lodgement within 30 days from the adoption of this report. Failure to do so, the matter must be investigated by the Police.

3.6.30 Missing Receipt Leaves

The Committee discovered that receipt numbers 00044 and 00045 were removed from the receipt books and could not be traced.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that Management must provide Auditors with the missing receipts for verification, failure of which the matter must be investigated by the Police within 30 days from the adoption of this report.

3.6.31 Private Receipt Book

The Committee noted that the Hospital procured forty (40) private receipt books to be used for collecting revenue, two were used whilst the remaining thirty-eight were still kept in the store.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that Management must ensure that all Receipt Books are acquired from the GPPC and the use of private receipt books must cease immediately.

3.6.32 Single Sourcing without GPPA Approval

The Committee noted that three expenditures amounting to **D457,941.25** were incurred for which three quotations were not obtained and no GPPA approval was also obtained. The Committee further noted that the GPPA forms were also not used during the procurement process.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that Management must follow all GPPA requirements.

3.6.33 Payments to Examiners Collected by the ROTP Staff.

The Committee noted that there were two payments made to examiners amounting to **D130,000**. However, there was no evidence that these payments were actually received by the examiners.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that Management must provide evidence that the payments were received by the External Examiners, failing which the matter shall be investigated by the Police.

3.6.34 Payment without Supporting Documents

The Committee noted payments amounting to **GMD3,164,285** made from the ROTP accounts that were without supporting documents such as Invoices and Receipts.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that all the relevant supporting documents must be presented to the FPAC for verification, within 30 days from the adoption of this report, failure of which the amounts involved must be recovered immediately.

3.6.35 Loans

The Committee noted that the ROTP issued a loan amounting to **D900,000** on 27 February 2017 to SZRECC. This loan was said to be for the payment of salaries of the SZRECC Consultants, without evidence to show approval of the Board

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that Management must provide evidence regarding the Board's approval for the issuance of the loan and its utilization.

3.6.36 Unpresented Payment Vouchers

The Committee noted that Payment Vouchers amounting to **GMD5,644,363** were not presented for audit inspection.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that all Payment Vouchers must be presented to the FPAC for verification within 30 days from the adoption of this report.

3.6.37 Difference between Details and Payee

The Committee noted that two transactions were posted in the Cash Book with contradicting names captured under the Details and Payee columns.

Recommendations

- a) The Committee recommends that care must be taken in recording and posting transactions to ensure that the correct transactions are captured.
- b) The committee further recommends that Management should provide reasonable explanation for the difference noted on the payee for the same transaction.

3.6.38 Assets Register

The Committee noted that assets amounting to **D158,000** were purchased. However, no Fixed Assets Register was maintained to record them.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that Management should make efforts to have an Asset Register in place to record all the assets in the register with appropriate details.

CHAPTER 4 – LOCAL GOVERNMENT COUNCILS

The National Assembly Resolution of 18 September 2023 directed all City, Municipal and Area Councils to prepare credible Financial Statements for the years 2019 and 2020 by the end of October 2023, and for years 2021 and 2022 by end of December 2023, and submit them to the Auditor General for auditing. This has not been complied with by most Councils.

4.1 Banjul City Council (BCC)

The Banjul City Council (BCC) presented its annual Activity Reports and audited Financial Statements for the years ended 31st December 2019 and 2020. During the interface with the Board and Management of BCC, the Committee observed the following:

4.1.1 Unconfirmed GTR

The Committee noted unconfirmed GTRs with serials 806101- 806550 recorded in the market CRBR. These were not part of the books supplied by Gambia Printing and Publishing Cooperation (GPPC). The Auditors could not verify the source and quantity of books received.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that the Council must provide the source of printing and the number of receipt books for verification by the FPAC.

4.1.2 Lack of Adequate Accounting Policy

The Committee noted the lack of Accounting Policies for the treatment and recognition of Revenue and Expenditure for the years 2019 and 2020.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that Management should ensure that there are Accounting Policies for Revenue and Expenditure in the revised Financial Statements for the years 2019 and 2020.

4.1.3 Unconfirmed Comparative Figures

- a) It was discovered that there were no audited Financial Statements for the year 2018, even after the Committee had recommended that the Council redo it.
- b) The Committee learnt that the Auditors could not confirm the 2019 Financial Statements due to the non-submission of evidence for confirmation of deposits from January to December 2019.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that Management must provide all relevant documents as evidence for the preparation of the 2019 Financial Statements to confirm their accuracy.

4.1.4 Improper Maintenance of Main Cash Book

The Committee discovered that the Council did not maintain a proper Cash Book to record all transactions in respect of receipts and payments for the years 2019 and 2020. The Committee further noted the following concerning the Cash Book:

- a) The Cash Book did not analyse receipts and payments to their various heads and subheads.
- b) It did not include the required Cash Book columns as required by the regulation for the debit and credit sides.
- c) It was not balanced off at the end of each month, and the balance was carried forward to the following month as the opening balance.
- d) The Cash Book showed total balances for the year and carried forward the credit side balances to the next year as opening balances.
- e) The cash column of the Cash Book was not actual cash but cash deposits, which should be treated under the bank column.
- f) The credit side showed columns for different banks, of which both cash deposits and payments were recorded in their respective bank columns.

When the Cash Book was sorted, Auditors noted that monthly Cash Book balances were the actual bank balances as per the credit side of the Cash Book only. The double entry principle was not applied in the posting and balancing of the Cash Book.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that Management should ensure that the Cash Books for the years 2019 and 2020 are rebuilt as prescribed by the Financial and Accounting Manual for Local Government Authorities, for the Council to be able to re-draft credible Financial Statements.

4.1.5 Non-Performance of Bank Reconciliation

The Committee noted that the Council did not perform monthly bank reconciliation for the years 2019 and 2020, to agree with the balances shown on the Bank Statements and Cash Books.

Recommendation

- a) The Committee recommends that Management must ensure that monthly bank reconciliations for the years 2019 and 2020 are prepared and submitted for verification.
- b) The Committee further recommends that Management must avoid reoccurrence of the same lapses in future.

4.1.6 No General Ledger

The Committee noted that the Council did not maintain a General Ledger to record all financial transactions.

Recommendation

- The Committee recommends that Management should maintain a General Ledger to record all financial transactions. The Financial Statements for the years 2019 and 2020 should be prepared based on account balances of the General Ledger.

4.1.7 Suppression of Collections

The Committee noted suppression of collections amounting to **GMD195,120** in respect of daily market ticket sales and monthly canteen rent. These were cash payments by revenue collectors to the Main Cashier, who did not bank or pay the cash to the main office.

Recommendations

- The Committee recommends that the Council must, through the office of the Chief Executive Officer, take swift and effective steps to ensure that the amounts suppressed are recovered immediately.
- The committee further recommends that the incident should be reported to the police for investigation and prosecution.
- An effective control mechanism should be instituted over the administration of revenue at the market to prevent a recurrence.

4.1.8 Unpresented GTRs

The Committee noted that the Council did not present some of the GTRs requested by the Auditors for review. These books were part of the sample selected from the Gambia Publishing and Printing Corporation extracts.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that the Management should provide the unpresented GTRs to the FPAC for verification, 60 days from the adoption of this report. Failing this, appropriate action should be taken against the Officer(s) concerned.

4.1.9 Unpresented Cash Books

The Committee noted that the Cash Books for some individual Albert Market collectors were not presented for review as detailed below:

Name of Collector	Period
Malick Njie	2020
Kumba Bah	2020
Amie Sallah	01/03/2020 – 31/12/2020
Yaba Ndure	01/10/2020 – 31/12/2020
Alagie Njie	2020
Jalika Manneh	11/06/2020 – 31/12/2020

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that Management must ensure that these books are presented to the FPAC within 60 days from the adoption of this report.

4.1.10 Un-Presented Project Proposal and Reports

The Committee noted that the Council did not provide the Project Proposal and Reports, such as Monitoring and Evaluation, and Completion of Project Reports for audit inspection. The contract was between the Council and UXL.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that Management should provide the Project Proposal and other relevant Reports for inspection by the FPAC within 30 days from the adoption of this report.

4.1.11 De-Aggregation of Procurements

The Committee noted that the Council de-aggregated the construction of an abattoir and eight (8) stores for the year under review. The Council paid **GMD1,767,812.94** and **GMD1,814,885.35** for the construction of the Abattoir and Stores at the Banjul Albert Market and BCC Ice Plant, respectively. The payments were made to the Director of Planning as imprest and were fully retired.

Recommendations

- a) The Committee recommends that the Management must ensure that procurements above the GPPA thresholds or any other regulation are adhered to.
- b) The committee further recommends that the practice of paying contract amounts to the staff of the Council should be stopped by Management immediately.

4.1.12 Conditions of The Abattoir and the Stores

The Committee noted that the two contracts in relation to the Abattoir and Stores, which cost nearly **GMD2,000,000** each, were significantly far from completion.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that Mustapha Batchilly (CEO) and Ebou Drammeh (Acting Director of Finance), and Katim Touray (Director of Planning) must immediately refund the entire contract sum to the Council and provide confirmation to the FPAC within 30 days from the presentation of this Report.

4.1.13 Non-Compliance with Disposal Procedures

The Committee noted that the Council did not conduct an auction in line with the requirements of the Regulations, and noted the following:

- a) There was no evidence that the Chief Executive Officer informed the Contracts Committee comprising Heads of Departments and Internal Audit to dispose off the assets.

- b) The Chief Executive Officer did not prepare a list showing the description of the item, the original cost, the reason for the write-off, the value according to the store's ledger or Asset Register, the current estimated value, and the proposed method of disposal.
- c) The service of a competent Engineer or Valuer was not hired to determine the write-off value of the asset.
- d) The service of a Government Licensed Auctioneer was not engaged for the auction.
- e) Procedures for the auction were not documented.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that the Management should ensure that all subsequent disposals are in line with the requirements of the Law.

4.1.14 Un-Budgeted Payments

The Committee noted with grave concern that payments of **GMD394,276** were not budgeted in the approved budget for the year 2020. The details are shown below:

Date	Payee	Details	Code	PV No	GMD
09/01/20	Aji Fatou Nyang, Chief Cashier	Commission on services.		0004	138,166.00
11/02/20		Advertisement cost for third party (XL Standard co. Ltd	200110	086	40,480.00
09/09/20	Musa Jarju (Security Commissioner)	Commission on services.		0706	213,630.00
03/09/20	Aji Fatou Nyang, Chief Cashier	Commission on services		0694	2,000.00
Total					394,276.00

Recommendations

- a) The Committee recommends that the Chief Executive Officer must ensure that payments made by the Council are within the approved budget or through supplementary funds as per the Financial and Accounting Manual.
- b) Going forward, the Committee recommends that any unbudgeted expenditure must be refunded by the Chief Executive Officer.

4.1.15 Payment without Supporting Documents

The Committee noticed payment of **GMD200,000** without supporting documents to Banjul Relief Initiative. The payment was made on 20 June 2019 with payment voucher number 352 in respect of Covid-19 Emergency Support to the Soma Community. According to the Finance Manager, the community of Banjul formed this association to provide support to the citizens, but they could not establish how the funds were received and disbursed by the BCC.

Recommendations

- a) The Committee recommends that the Management should provide supporting documents to the FPAC within 30 days from the adoption of this report.
- b) When Management fails to provide the supporting documents, the matter should be reported to the Police for investigation.
- c) The committee further recommends that Management must provide documentary proof relating to the source of funding and management of the Banjul Relief Initiative to the FPAC within 30 days.

4.1.16 Payments not Verified by Internal Auditor

The Committee noted with grave concern that the Council made several payments without evidence of verification by the Internal Auditor as shown below:

Date	Ref	Code	Payee		GMD
1-Mar-19	151	Salaries	Aji Fatou Nyang	Chief Cashier	449,310.12
1-Mar-19	153	Salaries	Trust Bank Ltd.	For Other Banks	334,090.55
6-Mar-19	169	DIP Wages	Aji Fatou Nyang	Chief Cashier	305,183.48
14-Mar-19	193	Salaries	Aji Fatou Nyang	Chief Cashier	527,079.00
29-A r-19	389	Salaries	Ri Fatou Nyang	Chief Cashier	678,483.02
29-A r-19	382	Salaries	Trust Bank Ltd.	For Other Banks	350,862.77
Sub-Total					2,645,008.94
4-May-20	354	D/P Wages	Ebou Drammeh (Ag. Finance Manager)		299,155.27
2-Jul-20	504	Salaries	Trust Bank Ltd.	For Other Banks	624,847.32
26-Nov-20	1000	P/Loan	Reliance Financial Services		45,947.27
16-Jun-20	460	20-01 18	Atlas — Fuel		100,000.00
27-Nov-20	1008	20-0105	Trust Bank Ltd.		22,597.00
23-Dec-20	1074	20-0121	Trust Bank Ltd. For Other Banks		845,473.03
Sub-Total					1,938,019.89
TOTAL					4,583,028.83

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that the Chief Executive Officer and Finance Director must ensure that all payment vouchers are properly analysed and certified by the Internal Auditor before payment.

4.1.17 Understatement of Payments in the Improper Cash Book

The Committee noted with concern the understatement of **GMD194,285.24** in the Improper Cash Book. This was due to the difference between the Cash Book and Payment Voucher amounts. The details are shown in the table below:

Date	P.V No.	Cash Book GMD	Voucher GMD	Understatement GMD
25/03/19		6,750.00	5,250.00	1,500.00
27/06/19	622	32,000.00	132,000.00	100,000.00
Sub Total				98,500.00
03/07/20	510	222,785.32	294,785.32	72,000.00

30/12/20	1098	376,002.12	399,787.36	23,785.24
			Sub Total	95,785.24
TOTAL		637,537.42	831,823.68	194,285.24

Recommendations

- a) The Committee recommends that Management must ensure that corrective measures are taken to adjust the Cash Book and revise the Financial Statements.
- b) The Committee further recommends that any irregularities uncovered by Management must be addressed immediately.

4.1.18 Non-Deduction of Withholding Tax

The Committee noted that Banjul City Council did not deduct Withholding Tax from suppliers of goods and services for the period under review.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that Management should ensure that Withholding Tax is deducted from suppliers of goods and services and remitted to the Gambia Revenue Authority.

4.1.19 Overdue Acting Appointment

The Committee noted that several key positions at the Council were on Acting Appointments for more than six months in contravention of the General Orders. There were no reports on staff performance or conduct.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that Management should review the affected appointments to regularize them as required by the General Orders.

4.1.20 Unrepaid Loans (Non-Staff)

The Committee noticed unpaid loans of **GMD40,000** owed by two non-staff members to the tune of **GMD20,000** each. The repayments were due in **2013** but have not yet been recovered.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that efforts must be made to recover the loans by establishing communications with the debtors to find out how and when these debts can be recovered.

4.1.21 Unrepaid Loans (Staff Loans)

The Committee noted with concern that staff loans amounting to **GMD136,429** were not repaid. Moreover, the Committee also noted that these staff were no longer working with BCC and no evidence was provided to ascertain that efforts were made to recover the loans. Details below:

Name	Loan Amount	Date of Loan	Employment status
Momodou Bah	65,867.00	17 th Jan. 2017	Resigned
Fatou Sallah	26,875.00	17 th Jan. 2017	Resigned
Baboucarr Secka	28,351.33	17 th Jul. 2019	Former Employee
Njaga Jammeh	9,000.00	07 th Mar. 2017	Former Councillor
Landing Sanyang	4,000.00	12 th Jul. 2016	Former Councillor
Demba Gaye	2,336.00	-	Contract terminated
Total	136,429.00		

Recommendation

The committee recommends that every effort must be made to recover the loans, including establishing communications with the debtors to find out how and when the debts can be recovered.

4.1.22 Outstanding Salary Advances

The Committee noted outstanding salary advance balance of **GMD22,075** in respect of staff for the year 2019. The details are shown below:

Date	Employee Name	Sal. Adv. Received	Amount Paid	Balance Outstanding
08/11/19	Mr. Ebou Drammeh (AG. Fin. Manager)	6,900.00	00.00	6,900.00
12/11/19	Mr. Abdoulie Secka (Accounts Officer)	5,000.00	00.00	5,000.00
14/11/19	Mr. Abdoulie J. Corr (Dir. of Internal Audit)	10,000.00	5,000.00	5,000.00
06/11/19	Mr. Dawda Jones (Clerk of Council)	6,000.00	3,000.00	3,000.00
13/11/19	Mr. Ebou L. Njie (Rates Manager)	5,500.00	3,325.00	2,175.00
	Totals	33,400.00	11,325.00	22,075.00

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that the Council must ensure that it recovers the outstanding balances by making appropriate deductions from the above staff and provide evidence to the FPAC for review.

4.1.23 No Debtors (Receivables) Control Accounts

The Committee noted that the Council did not maintain a Debtor's Control Account in respect of Loans, Advances, and Trade Debtors. Also, there were no individual Ledger Accounts or a List of Debtors as required by the regulation.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that Management should maintain a Debtors Control Account and individual Ledger Accounts or a List of Debtors for Loans, Advances and Trade Debtors to keep track of accurate debtor balances at any time.

4.1.24 No Creditors (Payables) Control Account

The Committee noted that the City Council did not maintain a Creditors' Control Account or individual Ledger Accounts for short and long-term liabilities (Payables). The Committee further noted that the Council has many creditors, including long-term, as opposed to the provisions of the Accounting and Financial Manual.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that Management should ensure that a Creditor's Control Account and individual Ledger Accounts are maintained.

4.1.25 Assets not Recorded in the Asset Register

The Committee noted that assets purchase for the years 2019 and 2020 were not recorded in their respective Fixed Asset Registers.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that Management must ensure that assets purchased for the years 2019 and 2020 are recorded in their respective Asset Registers and provided for audit confirmation.

4.1.26 Fixed Asset Register without Adequate Information

The Committee noted that key information, such as the Insurance Policy and Date of Disposal of assets, was not included in the Fixed Assets Register.

Recommendation

- a) The Committee recommends that Management should ensure that the Insurance Policy and Disposal Details are included in the Asset Register.
- b) The Committee further recommends that these details be furnished to the Auditors for verification.

4.1.27 No Minutes of Meetings (General Council)

The Committee discovered that Banjul City Council did not provide Minutes of Meetings of the Council and/or other documentation for the years 2019 and 2020. The Committee further learnt that the Auditors were not provided with personal representations of personnel of the Council during both the planning and fieldwork stages of the audit.

Recommendations

- a) The Committee recommends that Management must provide Minutes of the Meeting of the General Council for audit review and analysis.

- b) The committee further recommends that the personnel of the General Council should be available for discussion with the Auditors to assess their effectiveness.

4.1.28 No Minutes of Meetings (Finance and Establishment Committees)

The Committee noted that Banjul City Council did not provide Minutes of Meetings for review for the years 2019 and 2020, in respect of the Finance and Establishment Committees.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that Management must ensure that Minutes of Meetings are provided for review by the Auditors.

4.1.29 Unused Software

The Committee noticed two unused software programs: Integrated HR and Payroll and QuickBooks Accounting Software. The Committee also noted that the Council has purchased these since 2019. Details of the purchases are shown below:

Date	Details	Supplier	GMD
30/05/19	QuickBooks Accounting software	BKa Consulting	221,000.00
31/05/19	Integrated HR & Payroll System	Kube Jara	235,000.00
Total			456,000.00

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that Management must provide a genuine explanation to FPAC for not using this software after spending so much on it.

4.1.30 File Share Permission

The Auditors noticed that there were several folders in the active directory server that were shared over the network and accessed by different units within the Council. It was further noted that the Accounts Unit folder containing Payroll and Staff Data was included, and most of these folders were shared and can be accessed by everyone on the network because the files do not have access limited to the intended people.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that Management should ensure that appropriate permission is assigned to each folder to make sure that users are given access to only their authorized folders.

4.1.31 Non-Genuine Operating System

The Committee noted that there were some computers installed with a non-genuine Operating System (cracked operating system), which has a lower level of security that hackers can leverage to cause havoc to the computers.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that Management should install licensed and genuine Operating Systems on all Council computers.

4.1.32 No External Storage of Backup Data

The Committee noted that there was no external storage device for data backup for files in the active directory server. It was further observed that the server has limited capacity and its secondary drive storage backup data is currently not functional.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that Management must ensure that data is properly backed up and securely stored.

4.1.33 No IT Training Program

The Committee noticed that there was no defined IT training program available for the IT staff.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that Management should ensure that capacity gaps are identified and appropriate training programs are provided to relevant IT staff.

4.1.34 Lack of Uninterrupted Power Supply (UPS)

The Committee noticed that there was no UPS or power backup device to serve the network devices in the event of a power loss at the Council.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that Management should ensure that there is sufficient power backup available for the systems, particularly the server and other network devices, to protect them from electrical fluctuation and shifting from one power source to another.

4.1.35 No Physical Security and Cooling System for the Server

The Committee noticed that the server was placed in a poorly secured open office without a cooling system.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that Management should ensure that a proper server room with an effective cooling system to protect the ICT infrastructure by the end of March 2026.

Specific Recommendations

- a) Any correspondence from the Lord Mayor to the Local Government Service Commission and Ministry should be shared with the FPAC for easy follow-up.
- b) General administrative and governance matters affecting the Council should be referred to the Select Committee on Regional Government.
- c) The adjustments file of BCC should indicate to the Auditors the relevant adjustments that have been made.

5.1 Basse Area Council (BSAC)

The Basse Area Council (BSAC) presented its annual Activity Report and audited Financial Statements for the year ended 31st December 2019. During the interface with the Board and Management of BSAC, the Committee observed the following:

5.1.1 No Internal Audit Function

The Committee found out that the Council did not have an Internal Audit function. The vacancy remains unfilled while the former Internal Auditor was redeployed to Revenue Collection Unit.

Recommendation

The committee recommends that the Council should ensure the re-establishment of the Internal Audit function, which is critical and must always be kept for proper accountability and good governance.

5.1.2 Accounting Policies and Notes

The Committee noted that the draft Financial Statements presented did not indicate the Accounting Policies adopted for the preparation of the statements. The Financial Manual did not adequately address the subject as it only referred to the Central Government choice of accounting.

Recommendation

The committee recommends that management should adopt and apply appropriate and responsive accounting frameworks and polices for the preparation of its Financial Statements.

5.1.3 No Balance Sheet

The Committee discovered that the Council prepared and submitted the Income and Expenditure Statement but there was no Balance Sheet for the period under review.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that Management prepare a Balance Sheet for its Financial Position by referring to the Financial and Accounting Manual for Local Government Authorities.

5.1.4 No Control Accounts (Debtors & Creditors)

The Committee noted that the Council did not prepare and maintain Control Accounts for its transactions with Debtors and Creditors for the period under review.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that Management should prepare individual accounts for Debtors and Creditors in the subsidiary ledgers to monitor and reflect the actual balance owed to creditors, and the balance owed by debtors at any given period.

5.1.5 No Monthly Abstract Books

The Committee noted that a monthly Abstract Book as required by the Financial and Accounting Manual for the analysis of all revenue and expenditure transactions from the Cash Book has not been prepared by the Council. This step was found to be skipped and transactions from the Cash Book were directly transferred to the ledger without being analysed.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends the preparation of all essential Abstract Books as required by the Financial Manual. The procedures for the preparation can be found in the Manual.

5.1.6 Expenditure Budget and Revenue Forecasts

The committee observed that there was no evidence that the Council used any scientific basis for the preparation of its budget, since there is no indication in the budget of how the budget and forecast figures were arrived at.

There was also no evidence that the steps and requirements as per the Financial and Accounting Manual were followed. These include, but are not limited to:

- a) Dispatching budget circulars to the Wards and Council Sub-Committees.
- b) Finance Committee discussion and approval of the Draft Budget

Recommendations

- a) The Committee recommends that Management should follow the guidelines and requirements of the Financial and Accounting Manual in the preparation of the budget.
- b) The Committee further recommends that all processes and procedures should be documented to facilitate review and provide an audit trail.

5.1.7 Incomplete Asset Register

The Committee noted that the Asset Register revealed the following inadequacies:

- a) The Acquisition Dates of the assets were not registered.
- b) The Costs of the assets were not indicated.
- c) The Description and Condition of the asset were not stated.
- d) Reference Numbers for the assets were erroneously recorded as Serial Numbers.
- e) Actual Serial Numbers are not recorded.

Recommendations

- a) The Committee recommends that Management should update the Asset Register with all the missing details.

- b) The Committee further recommends that the Asset Register must always be kept up to date to ensure completeness.

5.1.8 Non-Preparation of Key Documents

The Committee noted that the following documents or records were not prepared during the period under review:

- a) Business Continuity and Disaster Recovery Plan
- b) IT Policy Manual
- c) Training Policy
- d) Procurement Plans for the period under review
- e) Database of Procurement made for the period under review
- f) Risk Assessment Policy

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that Management must urgently ensure the establishment and continuous maintenance of the records for efficient and effective service delivery.

5.1.9 No Operational plan

The Committee noted that the Council had a Strategic Plan in place, but there was no Operational Plan for the period under review to implement the Strategic Plan.

Recommendation

The Committee urges Management to ensure that an Operational Plan is prepared. This will help to ensure that the Council achieves its development objectives..

5.1.10 Misclassification of Revenue Codes

The Committee noted that the Council allocated and used codes that are different from those allocated by the policy document (Financial Manual). In some cases, the new codes used for new components correspond to different components as allocated in the Financial Manual.

Recommendations

- a) The Committee urges Management to revert to the correct codes for components as allocated in the Financial Manual.
- b) The Committee further recommends that any change to these codes must be duly authorized.

5.1.11 Use of GTRs for Income Tax and Personal Loan Deductions

During the reconciliation of the Treasurer's GTRs against the Cash book, the Committee noted that several GTRs were used in respect of Income Tax deductions as well as receipt of other Loan Repayments.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that the use of GTRs to administer the receipt of revenue must cease immediately. GTRs should only be issued when revenue is earned.

5.1.12 License Arrears

The Committee noted that review of the license assessment and receipt record revealed outstanding license arrears of **D138,500**.

Recommendations

- a) The Committee recommends that Management must take swift action to recover all the outstanding arrears.
- b) The Committee further recommends that Management must employ and maintain a mechanism that ensures effective collection of all outstanding licenses due.

Specific Recommendations

- a) The Council must comply with the Constitutional requirements of submitting reports, which will help mitigate the challenges of accumulating backlogs.
- b) The frequent redeployment of officials between Councils is a grave concern that needs to be seriously reconsidered.

6.0 Kanifing Municipal Council (KMC)

The Kanifing Municipal Council (KMC) presented its annual Activity Reports and audited Financial Statements for the years ended 31st December 2017 to 2021. During the interface with the Board and Management of KMC, the Committee observed the following:

6.1.1 Sampled Payment Vouchers Not Presented

The Committee noted that several payment vouchers amounting to **GMD7,677,470.61** have not been found within the vouchers submitted for audit review.

Recommendations

- a) The committee recommends that Management must provide the missing voucher to FPAC for review within 30 days from the adoption of this report, failure which the matter shall be referred to the Police for investigation.
- b) The committee further recommends that care must be taken during the processing and filing of transactions to ensure that all transactions are appropriately filed.

6.1.2 Incomplete Establishment Register

The Committee noted that the Establishment Register revealed numerous missing information on employees. These range from Dates of Birth, Qualifications and the Due Date of Retirement.

Recommendations

- a) The Committee recommends that the Council should review and adjust the Establishment Register with the missing information.
- b) The Committee further recommends that the revised Establishment Register should be presented to the FPAC for review.

6.1.3 Incomplete Personnel Files

The Committee noted that several key documents for the personal files were not filed. The affected staff are from various Departments of the Council.

Recommendation

- a) The Committee recommends that Management should comprehensively review the personal files with a view to ensuring that all the missing details are included.
- b) The Committee further recommends that there should also be regular review and evaluation of files to ensure they stay up to date.

6.1.4 Low Qualification for Key Positions

The Committee noted that several key positions were filled by candidates who appear to fall short of the basics as established by the Scheme of Service of the Council. Most of them

are direct entries to the positions, but neither qualification nor experience is evidenced to justify the appointment.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that Management, in collaboration with the relevant Committee of the General Council, should review the affected cadres to regularize the incompatibilities.

6.1.5 Differences in Ticket Serials

The Committee noted that reconciliation of the CRBR against the Collectors' Cash Book revealed inconsistency with serial numbers. The GTR numbers indicated for the administration of collections in the Collectors' Cash Book were different from those indicated in the CRBR as retirements for the same collections.

Recommendations

- a) The committee recommends that the collections in question should be reviewed and corrected. The corrected records should be presented to the FPAC for verification within 30 days from the adoption of this report.
- b) The committee further recommends that in the future, collectors must ensure that collections are appropriately accounted for by including appropriate audit trails to facilitate proper accountability.

6.1.6 GTRs not recorded in the CRBR

The Committee noted that reconciliation of a sample of collectors' Cash Book against the CRBR by the Auditors revealed that a couple of collectors have not administered the GTRs issued to them for both issue and retirement. This means such collections were not administered through the CRBR at all.

Recommendations

- a) The Committee recommends that Management must ensure that all GTRs affected are recorded in the CRBR and adjustments are presented to FPAC for verification within 30 days from the adoption of this report.
- b) The Committee further recommends that ensuring all GTRs administration passes through the CRBR must be instituted and monitored regularly for compliance.

6.1.7 GTR numbers duplicated in the CRBR

The Committee noted that several GTR numbers have been duplicated in the CRBR in respect of collections.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that the affected records should be reviewed and corrected as soon as possible, with the corrected records presented to the FPAC for verification within 30 days from the adoption of this report.

6.1.8 Receipt numbers not recorded on the Software Printout

The Committee noted that collections amounting to **D60,000** by some collectors have not been posted to the accounts. There is a risk that the amount in question is not accounted for and may, in effect, result in the understatement of revenue.

Recommendations

- a) The committee recommends that the amount in question should be reviewed by Management and adjusted accordingly. These corrections should be presented to the FPAC for review within 30 days from the adoption of this report.
- b) The committee further recommends that, in the future, proper care and regular review should be exercised to ensure accuracy.

6.1.9 Suppression of Collections

The Committee noted that review of collectors' Cash Book against the CRBR revealed an amount of **D125,780** under lodged. This practice affected one collector and occurred in different months throughout 2018.

Recommendations

- a) The committee recommends that the misstatement in question should be investigated by Management and appropriate steps should be taken to regularize it within 30 days from the adoption of this report.
- b) The committee recommends that Management immediately institute a monitoring mechanism over the collection and accounting of revenue to enhance its internal controls.

6.1.10 Overpayment of Collections

The Committee noted that a sample of collectors' Cash Book was traced to the CRBR and revealed postings in excess of actual collections.

Recommendations

- a) The Committee recommends that the anomaly should be investigated by Management, and corrective measures be taken to address it. The outcome must be reported to the FPAC within 60 days from the adoption of this report.
- b) The committee further recommends that Management must ensure that monitoring mechanisms are strengthened to ensure accountability over revenue collection.

6.1.11 Counterfeit Operating System

The Committee noted during assessment (system check-up) of the Operating Systems in use at the Council that the Operating Systems in use were not genuine. Staff using the system, including the IT Manager, confirmed that the systems were indeed not the genuine versions.

Recommendation

The Committee recommend that management should ensure that all computers are set up to operate on genuine Operating Systems to avoid exposure to various risks.

6.1.12 No Defined Roles & Responsibilities for IT Staff

The committee discovered that there was no formal and clearly defined roles and responsibilities for the IT team.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that Management should make sure that staff roles and responsibilities are clearly outlined for each member of the IT team

6.1.13 Training Strategy Program

The committee noted that there was no Training Strategy in place at the Council for the IT team.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that Management should ensure that a training program and strategy are developed and maintained for the technical staff and relevant training is given to their various areas of specialization.

6.1.14 Maintenance Interval

The committee discovered that there was no scheduled maintenance interval in place.

Recommendation

The committee recommends that Management should put in place a maintenance schedule that defines maintenance intervals. This could be done at a quarterly interval, twice a year, or any schedule deemed necessary by Management.

6.1.15 Change Management System

The Committee noted that the Change Management System is a systematic approach to keep track of system faults, upgrades, configuration changes, and maintenance. It was, however, discovered that there was no Change Management System in place.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that Management, through the IT unit, should establish a Change Management System as soon as possible. This should include requests, approval, and documentation of all changes made to the systems.

6.1.16 External Backup not up to date

The committee discovered that backups stored on external hard drives are not updated regularly. It has inconsistencies compared to the backups stored on the system. Additionally, the backup recovery procedures are not tested regularly.

Recommendation

The committee recommends that the IT department should ensure that backups are regularly stored on the external drive and updated accordingly. There must also be routine and regular tests to ensure that the backups remain healthy.

6.1.17 Centralized Management System

The Committee noted that the local user accounts of the end user computers are given administrator rights, enabling users to install applications and perform any other operation on the computer without limitation. Also, it was noted that there is no password complexity or renewal policy applied to the computers

Recommendations

- a) The committee recommends that Management should implement an Active Directory that will be used to manage all end-user systems from a centralised location.
- b) The committee further recommends that an extra effort to add a password complexity policy and scheduled password renewal for system user accounts should be implemented.

6.1.18 No Backup of Old Matrix System Data

The committee discovered that the old matrix system used to keep records of individual properties is running on a stand-alone computer with no data backup

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that Management should ensure that a copy of the data running in the old matrix system is backed up to a safe location or get the records transferred to the new system.

6.1.19 No Password Complexity in Rates Management System

The committee discovered that the use of weak passwords is permitted by the system. This means users could choose passwords that can only contain numbers or letters.

Recommendation

The committee recommends that Management engage the developers of the system to adjust security settings to require alphanumeric passwords. This will allow the use of strong passwords only and make it very difficult to guess or break.

6.1.20 Editable Date of Birth field in Employer's Profile

The committee discovered that the Date of Birth field in an employee's profile record could be readily changed by any user. The system does not restrict alteration to the DOB detail.

Recommendation

The committee recommends that Management should ensure that this function is disabled once the record of new staff is added to the system. If a mistake was made during entry, the entire record could be deleted and added again by following the right administrative procedures to ensure the integrity and correctness of data while also capturing it in the audit trail.

6.1.21 Deletion of Rate Transactions

The Committee noted suspected fraud of **GMD297,941.43** in respect of rates for the year 2020. These were deleted transactions from the Matrix Data System, which resulted in non-banking of these transactions as per the Memo dated 28 December 2020 with reference number Ref: KMC/FIN/342.

A taskforce was said to be set up by the Council to investigate the matter but no Investigative Report was provided to auditors to confirm the conclusion of the investigation. The matter remained unresolved and the amount unrecovered. It was also noted that the matter was not reported to the Gambia Police Force for proper investigation.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that Management should provide the Investigative Report of the Taskforce to the FPAC for review within 30 days from the adoption of this report. Failure to provide the report will result in the matter being referred to the Police for further investigation.

6.1.22 Outstanding Balances (Shortages of Mbalit Project)

The Committee noted that an outstanding balance of **GMD121,806.00** in respect of shortages of revenue of the Mbalit by Ward Secretaries for the year 2021 was discovered. No investigation was conducted, but action was taken to recover the shortages from the Ward Secretaries.

Recommendations

- a) The Committee recommends that Management must give updates to the FPAC on the recovery of these monies within 30 days from the adoption of this report.
- b) The Committee further recommends that any defaulter who remains must be reported to the Police for investigation.

6.1.23 Unpresented Fraud Allegation Report

The committee noted that the investigative report for the fraud allegation at the Council was not presented to the FPAC for review. The allegations include the following:

- a) A loan of **GMD12,000,000** secured for the purchase of a parcel of land for the Councils' Senior Management.

- b) Alleged **forgery of a letter** captioned: Guarantee purchase of land advance agreement purportedly written by the Council
- c) Solicitation and receipt of a bribe of **GMD30,000**.

Recommendation

The committee recommends that Management should present the Official Investigative Report to the FPAC within 30 days from the adoption of this report.

6.1.24 Mbalit Project Allowances Paid to Council Staff

The committee noted that the Council paid an unapproved Transport Allowance of GMD500.00 and risk allowance of GMD1,000.00 to the Manager and Supervisor of the Environment and Sanitation Unit of the Council from the Mbalit project. A request for Council resolution that was passed for the payments was not presented to the FPAC for review.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that the authority or approval for these Allowances should be provided, failing which, the payments should be stopped immediately.

6.1.25 Restated Financial Statements

The committee noted that the Council did not restate its 2019 Financial Statements since the audit opinion was an Adverse Opinion. The previous Committee of the National Assembly also recommended to the Council to restate its financial statements. However, the Auditors were informed that the 2019 Financial Statements could not be restated because the accounting software was locked for that period.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that Management must ensure that the Finance Director discloses the affected account balances and state when the adjustment will be made.

6.1.26 Disclosure of Current, Non-Current Assets and Creditors

It was noted that Councils' financial reporting framework and accounting policies as per the Financial and Accounting Manual for Local Government Authorities did not require them to recognise Fixed Assets, Trade Receivables and Payables in their Balance Sheet. Thus, the Council neither recognised nor disclosed their Fixed Assets, Trade Receivables and Payables.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that Management, through the Finance Director, should disclose all fixed assets including Land and Building, Uncollected Moneys such as Rates and Tax, Licenses, Fees, etc.

6.1.27 Non-maintenance of Imprest Holders Account

The Council did not maintain an Imprest Holder's Account for the issuance and the retirement of these imprests. The total imprest issued was recorded in the entertainment account, where retirements will be entered as receipt of cash.

Recommendation

The committee recommends that Management should ensure that an Imprest Control Account is maintained to account for all imprests issued and their subsequent retirements.

6.1.28 Arrears of Rates

The Committee noted rate arrears of **GMD242,450,956.97** and **GMD253,404,553.58** for the years 2020 and 2021 respectively. These were in respect of residential and commercial rates.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that Management must institute a mechanism to ensure that these arrears are recovered and rates collected on time.

6.1.29 Under Valuation of Properties

The Committee noted that the Council last valued properties including commercial and residential in 2005.

Recommendations

- a) The committee recommends that Management should provide updates to the FPAC on the current market values of all properties in the Municipality within 30 days from the adoption of this report.
- b) If the revaluation has not been completed, the Council must conduct the revaluation within 18 months and provide updates to the FPAC accordingly.

6.1.30 Unpresented License Invoices

The committee noted that the Council did not present the physical invoices recorded in the collectors' Cash Books. It was further noted that some of the collectors' Cash Books include the invoice serial numbers and some did not.

Recommendation

The committee recommends that Management should ensure that these invoice books are presented to the FPAC for verification.

6.1.31 Unpresented GTRs

The committee discovered that GTRs to the tune of **GMD186,650** were not presented for inspection. These GTRs were recorded in the revenue collectors' Cash Books but the physical GTRs were not provided for audit inspection.

Recommendation

The committee recommends that Management must ensure that these receipt books are presented to the FPAC for verification without delay.

6.1.32 License GTRs

The committee noted that GTR of **GMD141,464** with GTR numbers 3002501 to 3002600 dated 05 March 2020 used by Keway Jeng were not presented.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that Management must ensure that these receipt books are presented to the FPAC for verification within 30 days from the adoption of this report. Failure to do so will result in the matter being referred to the Police for investigation.

6.1.33 Unpresented Collectors Cash Book

The committee noted that the Council did not present some of its license collectors' Cash Books. Some licenses were received but without the Cash Book.

Recommendation

Management should ensure that these books are presented to the FPAC within 30 days from the adoption of this report for verification. Failure to do so, the matter shall be reported to the Police for investigation.

6.1.34 Purchase of Unused Hammer Mill (Bottle Crusher Machine)

The committee noted that the Council purchased a Hammer Mill at a cost of **GMD1,143,198.19** which include **GMD34,931** for fees and charges by Gamdirect Money Transfer. It was however discovered that the Council did not use this machine since it was purchased and the machine is not included in the Fixed Asset Register. Moreover, it was also noted that the purchase did not follow GPPA procedures.

Recommendations

The Committee recommends that Management should ensure that:

- a) Genuine explanation with proofs for the purchase of this machine which is not in use, within 30 days from the adoption of this report, failure of which the matter shall be referred to the Police for investigation.
- b) The Council always complies with GPPA rules and regulations.
- c) The funds are used only for their intended purposes.
- d) The machine is listed in the Council's Fixed Asset Register.

6.1.35 Excess Expenditure

- The Committee noted excess expenditure of **GMD12,605,860** between actual and budgeted expenditure.

Recommendation

The committee recommends that Management must ensure that a mechanism is instituted to ensure that all expenditures are within its approved budget.

6.1.36 Non-Deduction of withholding Tax

The committee noted that the Council did not deduct withholding tax from its suppliers and remit it to Gambia Revenue Authority as required by statutory laws.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that Management should ensure that withholding tax is deducted from all procurements made as required by law.

6.1.37 Payment of Allowances without Authority

The committee noted payments of various allowances without approval or authority. These allowances were based on the Council's Service Rule which was not approved. It was further noted that the General Council or the Ministry did not give any approval for the payment of these allowances.

Recommendation

- a) The committee recommends that Management must ensure that these payments are stopped immediately until the right authority is obtained.
- b) The committee further recommends that the Council should adhere to the Local Government Staff Service Rules, 2003.

6.1.38 Late Banking

The Committee discovered late banking of **GMD1,326,492.50** in contrast to the Financial Regulations.

Recommendation

The committee recommends that Management must ensure that all monies collected are banked in a timely manner as per the dictates of the Financial and Accounting Manual.

6.1.39 Improper Maintenance of Fixed Assets Register

The committee noted from the review of the Council's Fixed Assets Register for the period under review that there was no column for the location of assets.

Recommendation

The committee recommends that Management should ensure that the Fixed Assets Register is properly maintained by including the location of the assets and present the revised Fixed Asset Register to the FPAC for review within 90 days from the adoption of this report.

6.1.40 Assets Not Recorded, Tagged, or Seen

The committee observed that some assets were not recorded in the Fixed Asset Register, given a tag, mark, or model, and some were not seen.

Recommendation

The committee recommends that Management should ensure that all assets of the Council are recorded in the Fixed Asset Register and given a unique identification number. The unseen assets must be provided for confirmation without delay.

6.1.41 Lack of Title Deeds and Valuation Report for Properties

In 2010, an accumulated amount of **GMD805,693,000** was recorded in the Council's asset register as the total value of 48 properties (**land and building**) owned by the Council. There was no evidence such as Title Deeds for proof of ownership and Valuation Report to confirm that the valuation was conducted by qualified personnel and the values in the Fixed Asset Register are accurate.

Recommendations

- a) The committee recommends that Management should ensure that all Title Deeds are provided with the Valuation Report for confirmation.
- b) The committee further recommends that Management should liaise with the right authorities to establish all their properties without delay since this might lead to losses.
- c) Moreover, there is the need to revalue these properties to meet the current market price of these properties.

6.1.42 Unpresented Auction Report

The committee noted through the Councils' meeting minutes dated 26 June 2021 and the Financial Statements for the same year, Auction Sale of **GMD600,500** for the year 2021. However, there was no evidence to proof that the auction was carried out as required by the Financial and Accounting Manual for Local Government Authorities.

Recommendation

The committee recommends that Management should ensure that all the documentary evidence are provided to the FPAC within 30 days from the adoption of this report, to confirm that the auction was carried out in line with the aforesaid Manual.

6.1.43 Unpresented Lease or Rent Agreements

The committee noted that lease or rent agreements of Council properties between the Council, Jah Oil, and Equa Energy, respectively, were not presented for confirmation. These two properties are along Jimpex Road.

Recommendation

The committee recommends that Management must ensure that these documents are made available to the FPAC for verification within 30 days from the adoption of this report.

6.1.44 Lack of Medical Policy

The Committee noted that the Council did not have a Medical Policy that outlines the conditions and requirements for the treatment of staff. However, the Council did make medical refunds and payments for local and overseas treatment. These payments and claims were for the Senior Staff of the Council only.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that Management should put a stop to the payment of medical treatment until the introduction of an approved Medical Policy by the Council.

6.1.45 Poor Maintenance of Block Toilets (Serrekunda Market)

The committee noted that **GMD561,688** was spent on the renovation of the toilets in 2021. However, the committee observed the following:

- a) Men and women share the same toilets. The manhole for the toilet was broken and covered with plastic bags.
- b) There were blockages within the toilets that needed attention, and the flush system was not functioning; the water supply was through basins.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that Management should ensure that there are gender separated toilets, which are clearly tagged, and the broken manhole and dysfunctional flush should be repaired and replaced immediately.

6.1.46 Bakau Market Rehabilitation

The Committee noted that the entire market was not rehabilitated. Part of the market was left out during the rehabilitation. Most of the light systems that were installed were not functioning.

Recommendation

The committee recommends that Management should ensure that the installation and proper functioning of the lighting system is regularised. The porch of the old canteens should be well managed to ensure that vendors' produce are well kept and secured.

6.1.47 Tallinding Buffer Zone

The committee discovered that the Council has not deployed a Toilet Attendant at the zone for quite a long time. As per the 2021 ledger records, it was noted that a total amount of **GMD1,875,650** was posted as various expenses for these developments.

Recommendations

- a) The committee recommends that Management should ensure that a Toilet Attendant is deployed for proper management of the toilets.
- b) The committee further recommends that the contract document for the rehabilitation should be presented to the FPAC for review within 30 days from the adoption of this report.

6.1.48 KMC Annex

The committee noted that the construction of a 300-metre driveway awarded to Zen Construction and Trading in February 2021, was agreed to last for 6 months at a cost of **GMD3,595,550**. The work was observed to be unsatisfactory and has already depleted.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that Management provide updates on the resolution of this contract within 30 days from the adoption of this report, with all corresponding proofs and other relevant documentation.

6.1.49 Bakoteh Dumpsite

The committee noted that the security barbed wire for the perimeter fence was not completed. The newly built office, constructed in 2020, had no power and water supply. It was also observed that the access roads are too narrow to properly accommodate the trucks.

Recommendation

The committee recommends that Management should give an update to the FPAC on the completion of the security barbed wire.

6.1.50 Audit Trail not Setup on the Matrix and Payroll

The committee found out that both the Matrix Property Tax and Payroll Systems have no audit trail functionality to log user activity and system transaction history.

Recommendation

The committee recommends that Management should make sure that there is an audit trail feature on the Matrix Property Tax and Payroll Systems that logs user activities and transactions carried out on this system by the end of 2025.

6.1.51 Online Trade License System not in Use

The committee noted that the Council purchased the Trade License System at a cost of **D450,000** and it has been hosted by a service provider at cost of **D191,000** annually. A support fee of **D70,000** was also paid. Despite this, the Trade License System has not been in use.

Recommendation

The committee recommends that Management must ensure that issues with the Trade License Software are fixed within 60 days from the adoption of the report in line with the contractual obligation of the provider, failing which the Council must get the monies refunded to the Council within 30 days from the adoption of the report.

6.1.52 Missing Data on the Ecowtech System

The Committee discovered that the Council started using the Ecowtech System to manage the "Mbalit" Project's daily collections and transactions in 2019. However, there was no data in the system prior to August 2021. The only available data on the Ecowtech System was from August 2021 to date.

Recommendation

The committee recommends that Management should show cause why the data that was collected prior to August 2021 was not input into the system.

6.1.53 Missing Sequencing of Receipt Numbers

The Committee noted that there are missing receipt numbers on the Ecowtech System in the sequencing of receipts captured by the system for a collector in a particular Ward on the same day.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that the General Council establish a committee to investigate the matter and report back to FPAC within 60 days from the adoption of the report.

6.1.54 Inputting of Backlog Transactions

The committee found out that the Council had not yet started raising current transactions on the IFMIS system, and the Council was inputting a backlog of the previous year, 2021.

Recommendation

The committee recommends that both General Council and Management must ensure that the IFMIS system is judiciously utilized, which will save the Council from support fees and update or upgrade its current accounting software when such need arises.

7.0 Kerewan Area Council (KAC)

The Kerewan Area Council (KAC) presented its annual Activity Report, audited Financial Statements for the years ended 31st December 2020 and 2021 with no GPPA Procurement Compliance Report for consideration by FPAC.

7.1.1 Improper Maintenance of Cash Book

The Committee observed that the Council operates a manual Cash Book for the year 2020, and the following were noted:

- a) The main manual Cash Book did not include opening and closing balances, which means that the Cash Book was not balanced monthly to show cash balances at the end of each month.
- b) The double-entry principle was not applied in recording transactions.
- c) Bank deposits were recorded under the cash and bank columns, respectively.
- d) Unpaid payroll deductions, such as Income Tax and others, were recorded in the Cash Book.
- e) Transaction details were not adequate to show or establish the types of transactions recorded in the Cash Book,
- f) The Cash Book did not show analysis for line items,

The new IFMIS Cash Books, that is, the Recurrent and Development for 2021, were not properly maintained, and the following were noted:

- a) Cash and bank transactions were recorded in the same column in the Cash Book.
- b) There was no separate Cash Book for cash transactions since the Council collected and spent out of the cash collections.
- c) The Cash Book balances did not show the cash or bank balance for each month.
- d) Transaction details were not adequate to show or establish the types of transactions recorded in the description column of the Cash Book. This, in most instances, shows details such as the names of the Payer or Payee.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that Management should show cause as to why they should not be held accountable for failing to act on the committee's resolution during the Council's last appearance.

7.1.2 Closing Bank Balances Not Recorded in the Cash Books

The Committee noticed that six closing bank balances amounting to **GMD863,568.84** for the year 2020 were omitted as opening bank balances in the IFMIS 2021 Cash Book. Only two closing bank balances of **GMD137,062.29** and **GMD78,958.17** were used for the Recurrent and Development Cash Books, respectively.

Recommendation

This Committee recommends that Management should ensure that the Cash Books for 2021 are adjusted to include the above 2020 closing bank balances.

7.1.3 Non-Maintenance of Ledgers

The Committee noted that there were no ledgers such as Expenditure, Revenue, Debtors, and Creditors for the period ended 31 December 2020.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that Management should ensure that ledgers are maintained and the Financial Statement is revised accordingly.

7.1.4 Non-Performance of Monthly Bank Reconciliation

The Committee noted that the Council did not perform monthly bank reconciliation for the years 2020 and 2021.

Recommendations

- a) The Committee recommends that Management should ensure that monthly bank reconciliations for 2020 and 2021 are done within 30 days from the adoption of this report.
- b) The committee further recommends that, in the future, reconciliations be performed monthly.

7.1.5 Direct Transfers not Posted in the IFMIS Cash Books

The Committee noted that some direct transfers of revenue, revenues received, and payments directly to the Council's Bank Accounts were not receipted or posted on the IFMIS Cash Book.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that Management should ensure that the Cash Book and Financial Statements are adjusted with these deposits and details provided to the FPAC for verification within 30 days from the adoption of this report.

7.1.6 Understatement of Revenue Collector's Cash Book

The Committee noted an understatement of **D97,000** in respect of market collections shown below:

Date	Serials	Actual GMD	GTR GMD	Understated GMD	GTR No.	Collector
10/02/20	203001-228000	80,000.00	8,000.00	72,000.00	2862691	Isatou Sonko
28/02/20	239001-261000	75,000.00	70,000.00	5,000.00	2883729	
16/03/20	259001-280000	60,000.00	55,000.00	5,000.00	2883744	
12/07/20	361001-365300	78,000.00	73,000.00	5,000.00	2893596	

08/09/21	723001-781000	30,000.00	20,000.00	10,000.00	2942873
Total		323,000.00	226,000.00	97,000.00	

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that Management should ensure that these understatements are recovered from the Officer concerned within 30 days from the adoption of this report; failure of which the matter should be reported to the Police for investigation.

7.1.7 Understatement of the Main Cash Book

The Committee noted an understatement of **GMD30,827** in the main Cash Book. This was noted during the review of the collector's Cash Books against the main Cash Book. Details are shown below.

Date	GTR No.	GTR	Cash Book	Understated
		GMD	GMD	GMD
10/2/2020	2862694	129,715.00	127,415.00	2,300.00
28/02/2020	2883718	226,981.00	224,981.00	2,000.00
31/03/2020	2888776	113,063.00	88,363.00	24,700.00
4/5/2020	2893563	93,000.00	92,173.00	827.00
8/4/2021	2926799	2,000.00	1,000.00	1,000.00
Total		564,759.00	533,932.00	30,827.00

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that Management should ensure that the officers behind these understatements are identified and the amounts recovered from them within 30 days from the adoption of this report; failure of which the matter shall be reported to the Police for investigation.

7.1.8 Un-Charged Licenses/Operational Fees

The Committee noted that some businesses were not charged for License or Operational Fees based on the review of the Demand Notes.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that the Council should ensure that License or Operational Fees are charged to all eligible businesses and ensure that they are collected on time.

7.1.9 Under-Valuation of Properties

The Committee noted that the Council last valued properties for both commercial and residential in 2005. The rate for landed properties with amenities such as electricity and those without electricity are valued at GMD250.00 and GMD150.00, respectively. The Committee further noted that an additional tax of GMD15.00 was charged on houses with corrugated iron sheet and GMD10.00 for grass huts situated on each property.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that Management should liaise with the right authorities to ensure that properties are revalued to meet current market value.

7.1.10 Un-Presented Lease or Rent Agreement

The Committee observed that the Council did not provide leases or rent agreements for Supersonics and Reliance Financial Services for properties owned by the Council. Also, there was no evidence (Ledger Account) to confirm that these two businesses pay their lease or rent to the Council. These properties are in Barra and Farafenni, respectively.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that the lease or rent agreements should be presented to the FPAC for confirmation, and documentary evidence should also be provided to confirm that these businesses were paying lease or rent to the Council.

7.1.11 Incomplete License Register

The Committee noticed that Business Types, Business Class, and the Amount Charged from the License Act (Tariff) were missing from the register.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that Management should ensure that the License Register is completed and provided to FPAC for confirmation.

7.1.12 Payments from Cash Collections

The Committee noted with great concern that most of the Council's payments were in cash, from the collections made for the years 2020 and 2021.

Recommendations

- a) The Committee recommends that the Council must ensure that all cash collected is banked within 24 hours.
- b) The committee further recommends that the council must stop using cash collections for payments. Management should introduce the imprest system for cash payments.

7.1.13 Payments without Adequate Supporting Documents

The Committee noted payments amounting to **GMD190,725**, which were without adequate supporting documents to verify their authenticity.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that Management must ensure that the relevant supporting documents are provided to the FPAC for inspection within 30 days from the adoption of this report.

7.1.14 Overpayment of Allowances

The Committee noted that the Director of Finance and Deputy Director of Planning received GMD2,000 monthly Transport Allowances instead of GMD1,500 for the years 2020 & 2021.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that Management should ensure that approval for the payment of Transport Allowance of D2,000.00 is provided to the FPAC for confirmation. Otherwise, the approved rate of GMD1,500.00 should be paid to the Directors of Finance and Planning.

7.1.15 Payment of Allowances without Approval

The Committee noted that the Council paid allowances without authority or approval.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that the Council should provide the approval or authority of these allowances for confirmation, failing which, the payment of such allowances must cease.

7.1.16 Improper Maintenance of the Payroll

The Committee noticed that the payroll format did not show columns for the different types of allowances, only a single column for total allowances. The Auditors also reviewed the Pay Slips and noted that there was no breakdown of Allowances.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that Management should ensure that the payroll is properly maintained and includes all types of allowances and their rates of pay.

7.1.17 Incomplete Establishment Register

The Committee noted that the Establishment Register maintained by the Council was not in line with the requirements of the Manual. Below are the details of the Establishment Register maintained by the Council:

- a) Serial Number
- b) Name
- c) Age
- d) Date of appointment
- e) Rank
- f) Basic Salary
- g) Income Tax deducted

- h) Net Salary
- i) Hardship
- j) TelfTrans Allowance
- k) Residence Allowance
- l) Net Pay
- m) Annual Income

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that Management must ensure that a detailed Establishment Register is maintained as prescribed in the Manual.

7.1.18 Improper Maintenance of Fixed Assets Register

The Committee noted that the Council's Fixed Assets Register for the period under review did not have the following information for the recorded items:

- a. Date of Acquisition
- b. Cost of Purchase
- c. Insurance Policy and Date
- d. Date of Disposal.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that Management should make sure that the above details are included in the Fixed Asset Register.

7.1.19 Lack of Title Deeds for Council Properties

The Committee noted the Council did not have Title Deeds for their properties to ensure ownership. These properties are not recorded on the Fixed Asset Register.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that the Management must ensure that the Title documents for all properties are provided to the FPAC for confirmation.

7.1.20 Assets Not Recorded in the Fixed Asset Register or Not Tagged

The Committee noted that assets acquired within the scope of the audit were recorded in the Fixed Asset Register but not tagged or given a unique identification number.

Recommendations

- a) The Committee recommends that Management ensure that all assets of the Council are recorded in the Fixed Asset Register and given unique identification numbers.
- b) The committee further recommends that the assets that were not seen by the Auditors should be provided to the committee for confirmation.

7.1.21 Obsolete, Redundant, or Unserviceable Assets

The Committee noted several obsolete and redundant items at the store and within the premises of the Council. These include Computers, vehicles (Nissan Terrano/KAC3, Nissan/KAC2B), a Solar panel, a battery bank, and an Air conditioner.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that the Management should ensure that all assets are disposed-off in accordance with the Financial Regulations.

7.1.22 Issuing of Fuel to Obsolete Vehicles

The Committee noted that the Council issued fuel to vehicles that were not in use.

Recommendation

- a) The Committee recommends that the Finance Director must refund within 14 days the value of all the fuel issued to him for use in KAC 3 and KAC 6 for 2020 and 2021, with receipts of payments provided to the FPAC for review. Failure to do so, the matter shall be reported to the Police for investigation.
- b) The committee further recommends that Management should provide a comprehensive report to the FPAC of the fuel allocations to KAC 3, KAC 6, and KAC2B from 2020 to date within 30 days from the adoption of this report. Failure to do so, the matter shall be referred to the Police for investigation.

7.1.23 Non-Maintenance of a Fuel Register

The Committee noted that the Council did not maintain a fuel register to record purchases and issues. The Committee discovered that fuel is verbally requested through the CEO when the need arises. Also, there was no agreement provided between the Fuel Station and the Council.

Recommendation

- a) The Committee recommends that Management must ensure that a Fuel Register is maintained.
- b) The committee further recommends that the Council should provide the agreement between the Fuel Station and the Council for verification.

7.1.24 Lack of Training Policy

The Committee noted that the Council did not have a Training Policy in place. Some staff were trained by the Council at various institutions and were given monthly allowances of GMD2,000.00 without the approval of the General Council.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that Management should make sure that a Training Policy is put in place without delay.

7.1.25 Performance Review

The Committee observed that there were no road rehabilitation works from Daru Rilwan to Kerr Pateh feeder road, but rather to fill potholes at **GMD700,000**. However, the rain, as well as the movements of cars, washed the gravel used to fill the potholes, leaving the pathway dilapidated.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that the Council should seek funding from counterparts or engage the relevant authorities to construct a gravel road from Daru Rilwan to Kerr Pateh.

7.1.26 Farafenni Guest House

The Committee observed that the Farafenni Guest House, constructed by GAMWORKS in collaboration with the Council, was not in use. The structure was dilapidating both on the outside and inside. There were nine rooms with toilets, nine beds, cupboards, and stools. The Council did not provide a reason for the non-usage of the Guest House.

Recommendations

- a) The Committee recommends that Management should ensure that the Guest House is used to serve its purpose and to generate revenue for the Council.
- b) The committee further recommends that it would be more effective if the Guest House were managed by a different management from the Council.

7.1.27 Condition of Market Sheds

The Committee noticed that the market sheds at Chilla/Prince, Daru Rilwan, and Ngeyen Sanjal constructed in 2021 at **GMD832,117**, **GMD925,000**, and **GMD925,000** respectively, were poorly constructed as highlighted below.

- a) The concrete tables, benches, and floor of the markets were dilapidated with potholes.
- b) There was animal dung scattered on most parts of the floor.
- c) There were no barriers to serve as security for vendors and their goods from animals.
- d) The Ngeyen Sanjal market was not in use. Vendors complained about the lack of storage facilities, and that they cannot sell fish and meat in such a structure.

Recommendations

- a) The Committee recommends that the Council should ensure that these markets are maintained properly for future use.
- b) The committee further recommends that a needs assessment is carried out before any development to ensure that these developments are needed by the communities.
- c) Furthermore, the committee recommends that the Council should ensure that qualified companies are hired to meet the quality.

8.0 Kuntaur Area Council (KTRAC)

The Kuntaur Area Council (KTRAC) presented its annual Activity Report, audited Financial Statements for the year ended 31st December 2020. During the interface with the Board and Management of KTRAC, the Committee observed some key lapses.

8.1.1 Incomplete Financial Statement

The committee discovered that the 2020 Financial Statement was incomplete. There was no Balance Sheet, and the Revenue and Expenditure Statement did not include note numbering.

Recommendation

The committee recommends that Management should ensure that the 2020 financial statement is completed with the relevant statements and notes.

8.1.2 Non-Preparation of Trial Balance

The committee noted that the Area Council did not provide a Trial Balance for the years 2019 and 2020 as required by the regulation.

Recommendation

The committee recommends that Management should ensure that a Trial Balance is maintained to detect and correct errors before figures are transferred to the final accounts.

8.1.3 Lack of Comparative Figures

There were no comparative figures that were used as the basis for the preparation of the 2019 and 2020 Financial Statements.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that Management must provide all relevant documents as evidence for the preparation of the 2019 and 2020 Financial Statements to confirm their accuracy.

8.1.4 Un-Presented Bank Reconciliation Statements

The committee discovered that the Council did not provide its monthly Bank Reconciliation statements for inspection despite several requests.

Recommendation

The committee recommends that the monthly Bank Reconciliation statements for the years 2019 and 2020 must be presented to the FPAC for confirmation within 30 days from the adoption of this report.

8.1.5 Payments without Payment Voucher

The committee noted that there was payment of Salaries without Payment Vouchers as required by the Financial Regulation 2016.

Recommendation

The committee recommends that Management must ensure that Payment Vouchers are raised for all payments made by the Council.

8.1.6 Non-Payment of Withholding Tax

The committee noted that the withholding tax of **GMD50,000** was not paid to the Gambia Revenue Authority (GRA). This was in respect of tax withheld from a contract awarded to Sinkanding Company Limited.

Recommendation

The committee recommends that the Council should establish all withheld tax and pay them to GRA as required by the Act, within 30 days from the adoption of this report.

8.1.7 Contract without Appropriate Tender

The committee noted that a contract of **GMD549,975** was awarded to Tournet General Merchandise for borehole drilling at Kerr Makka. There was another award of **GMD552,300** awarded to Baisa Lateral Drilling and Plumbing Enterprise. There was no evidence on file that these contracts were approved by GPPA and/or a Contracts Committee. There was also no evidence of involvement of the Specialized Procurement Unit, even though that office exists.

Recommendations

- a) The committee recommends that Management must ensure that the payment documentation is regularized and presented to the FPAC for verification within 30 days from the adoption of this report.
- b) The committee further recommends that all procurements must be made in full compliance with the GPPA rules and Financial Regulations

8.1.8 Staff Not in the Establishment Register

Regulation 503 (1) of the Financial and Accounting Manual for Local Government Authorities requires that: *An "ESTABLISHMENT REGISTER" is to be maintained for the purpose of recording details of all employees of the Council as follows:*

- 1, *The name of the officer/employee*
2. *Date of birth*
3. *The position and grade*
4. *The salary per annum*
5. *The incremental date of the officer/employee*
6. *Staff employment number*

Recommendation

The committee recommends that the Council must review and adjust its Establishment Register with the missing details. The revised register should be presented to the FPAC for review and verification within 30 days from the adoption of this report.

8.1.9 Incomplete Asset Register

The committee noted that the Asset Register was not up to date, the Date of Acquisition had not been stated, the Serial Numbers were not accurate, the Descriptions of the asset were missing and the Location of some of them were changed without any update in the register.

Recommendation

The committee recommends that Management should update the Asset Register with the missing details and present it to the FPAC for review within 30 days from the adoption of this report.

8.1.10 No Debtors (Receivables) Control Account

The Council did not maintain the Debtors Control Account in respect of Loans and Advances and Trade Debtors. There were also no individual Ledger Accounts or a list of Debtors.

Recommendation

The committee recommends that Management should maintain Debtors Control Account and individual Ledger Accounts or list of Debtors for Loans and Advances and Trade Debtors to keep track of accurate debtors' balances at any time.

8.1.11 No Creditors (Payables) Control Account

The Council did not maintain Creditors Control Account or individual Ledger Accounts for short and long-term liabilities (payables). It was further noted that the Council has many creditors' including long-term in contravention of the manual.

Recommendation

The committee recommends that Management should prepare these accounts to avoid overpayments to third parties.

8.1.12 Fuel Allocations without Authority

The committee found out that the Council allocated fuel of **500 litres** and **200 litres** to the Chief Executive Officer (CEO) and Chairman, and Directors of Finance and Planning respectively without evidence of authority.

Recommendation

The committee recommends that the authority for the allocation of fuel should be provided to the FPAC for confirmation within 30 days from the adoption of this report.

8.1.13 Fuel Issued to Non-Council Vehicles

The committee noted with concern that the Council issued fuel to non-Council vehicles. Moreover, no reasonable basis was given for how such activities relate to the Council.

Recommendation

The committee recommends that Management must provide to the FPAC, reasons for fuelling non-Council vehicles or provide evidence of authority. Failure to do so, the CEO must refund the Council the total amount of money involved.

8.1.14 Weak Governance Function

This committee noted very little Council oversight over Management even though committees were established. There were no Minutes of meetings on file for the year 2019 for the Council and the Committees. The Chairpersons of the Committees revealed poor coordination and delegation of responsibilities since most meetings were cancelled due to a lack of quorum.

Recommendation

The committee recommends that the Council and its Committees must meet regularly as required by the Local Government Act, 2002 and ensure that Minutes of meetings are on file as evidence.

8.1.15 Non-Implementation of Reports

The committee observed a general lack of implementation of internal audit recommendations, with no management response to their audit findings.

Recommendation

The committee recommends that Management must ensure that audit reports are responded to and recommendations implemented on a timely basis.

9.0 Mansakonko Area Council (MKAC)

Mandakonko Area Council (MKAC) did not present any credible Financial Statements to the FPAC for scrutiny. The 2019 Management Letter of the National Audit Office was based on an audit of the transactions of the Council for that financial year. The GPPA also did not present a Procurement Compliance Review on the Council for the said period. The 2019 annual Activity Reports and audited Financial Statements of Mansakonko Area Council were adopted **with reservations**.

The Accounts of Mansakonko Area Council for 2020 were manually done. Therefore, no report was generated on them. The 2021 Financial Statements of Mansakonko Area Council were generated but not submitted to the National Audit Office for audit. During the review of the Management Letter for the year ended 31st December 2019, the Committee made observations regarding some key issues.

9.1.1 Internal Control Environment

Internal control arrangements designed by management to ensure that misstatements are detected and corrected in a timely manner revealed the following weaknesses:

- i. There is currently no evidence of a Code of Conduct for staff. The general staff do not know what the standards are in terms of behavioural conduct regarding the work.
- ii. There is a clear disregard for standard policies and procedures relating to key processes such as payments and receipts. There do not appear to be consequences to most of such breaches, as there appears to be Management tolerance to such practices.
- iii. There are currently no robust fraud prevention and detection mechanisms in place to mitigate the occurrence, even though several incidences of suspected fraudulent activities have been reported.

Recommendations

- a) The committee recommends that Management should implement the appropriate good corporate governance practices as established by the relevant Council policy and procedural documents.
- b) The committee further recommends that Management should always uphold this very important responsibility put to its charge.

9.1.2 Accounting Policies for the Preparation of Financial Statements

The Committee noted that Notes to the Financial Statements did not indicate the Accounting Policies adopted for the preparation of the Financial Statement. The related Notes to the Financial Statements were not submitted to the Auditors for review.

Recommendation

The committee recommends that Management adopts and applies appropriate and responsive accounting framework and polices for the preparation of its Financial Statements.

9.1.3 Governance Structure (Weak Governance)

Assessment of the governance structure of the Council revealed the following:

- i. No minutes on file for Establishment and Development from 2019 to date
- ii. Only one Minute for the Finance Committee during 2020 and none for 2019.
- iii. There was no other evidence regarding the functioning of the Committees.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that the General Council, through the Chairperson, must assume its full responsibility as outlined in the Local Government Act.

9.1.4 Sustainability of Services

The following were noted by the committee as going-concern issues:

- i. The three revenue components of Billboard fees, Hotel/Lodge license & Car Park fees were transferred from the Council to NRA, GTBoard, and GRA, respectively.
- ii. Grant payable to the Council from the Government has not been received by the Council in accordance with the Local Government Finance & Audit Act.
- iii. Generally, the low rates of taxes collected by the Council is barely sufficient to implement planned activities.

Recommendations

- a) The Committee recommends that the Council, through the General Council, must take up the matter of the withdrawn revenue streams with the relevant authorities with a view to having them restored.
- b) The Committee recommends that a similar approach should be pursued with the Government through the relevant Ministries to facilitate the execution of the grants.
- c) Moreover, the Council through concerned stakeholders, is also urged to initiate the process of reviewing the current rates of Tax Levies with a view to upgrading them.

9.1.5 No operational plan

The Council did not develop an Operational Plan for the period under review.

Recommendations

- a) The Committee recommends the development of annual Operational Plans, by drawing from the Strategic Objectives planned for the council.
- b) The committee further recommends that these annual plans should be detailed achievable operational milestones to ensure an effective realization of the long-term plans of the Council.

9.1.6 Lack of Disaster Recovery Plan

The Committee noted that the Council did not document any Disaster Recovery Plan to ensure business continuity in case of a disaster.

Recommendations

- a) The committee recommends that Management should consider establishing a comprehensive disaster recovery mechanism to mitigate for possible losses from disaster.
- b) The committee further recommends that the plan should cover all material aspects of the council's operations and identify in detail practicable actions/steps to be taken before, during, and after a disaster.

9.1.7 Un-presented Documents

The following documents were requested by Auditors for inspection, but none was presented:

- a) Disaster Recovery Plan
- b) Operational Plan
- c) Budget 2018/2019
- d) Quarterly Revenue and Expenditure Report
- e) Bank Statement and Bank Reconciliation Statement
- f) Fuel Register
- g) Training Policy
- h) Database of procurement made for the period under review
- i) Procurement Plans for the period under review

Recommendations

- a) The Committee recommends that Management should provide these documents to the FPAC for review within 30 days from the adoption of this report.
- b) Failure to provide these documents, the committee recommends further recommends that that immediate action must be taken to ensure that they are prepared.

9.1.8 Segregation of Duties over Payments (Payments Processed and Authorized by CEO)

The Committee noted that several payments were made with the authorization of only the CEO.

Recommendations

- a) This committee recommend that the payments in question must be duly regularized and presented to the FPAC for verification.
- b) The committee further advises the Director of Finance to channel all payments via the appropriate stages of authorisation and approval.

9.1.9 Un-posted Collections

An amount of **D27,800** was not posted in the main Cash Book. The details are shown below:

Date	GTR #	Amount	Collector Name
31/05/19 – 13/06/19	2734775 – 2734800	27,800.00	Director of Finance

Recommendations

- a) The Committee recommends that the Director of Finance must investigate and provide evidence of the amount in question to the FPAC for verification within 30 days from the adoption of this report.
- b) The Committee further recommends that Management must institute a control mechanism over the collection and posting of revenue to avoid the recurrence of such misstatements.

9.1.10 No Bank Reconciliations Performed

The Committee noted that Bank Reconciliation was not performed during the entire period of 2019 (January to December).

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that Bank Reconciliation must be performed monthly to correct any errors or omissions between the bank and other records.

9.1.11 Non-preparation of Subsidiary Books

The Committee discovered that the following subsidiary books as required by the Financial & Accounting Manual for Local Government Authorities to facilitate financial reporting were not prepared and filed by the council.

- a) Control accounts: (for Debtors & Creditors): to report balances owed to and from Creditors and Debtors respectively.
- b) Monthly abstract books: to analyse all revenue and expenditure transactions from the Cash Book.

Recommendation

The Committee recommends that Management should prepare control accounts for the debtors and creditors as well as the monthly abstracts for the relevant revenue heads in accordance with the requirements of the Manual.

9.1.12 Discriminate Allowance Payments

The committee noted with concern that no appropriate basis was provided for a discriminate payment of allowances to a few staff. Different rates of transport allowances allocated to staff, with no reason advanced for the different rates applied. All the rates (250 & 500) were well below the revised rate legislated by the government of D1500.

Recommendations

- a) The committee recommends that all payments of allowances and rates should be dictated by authorised policies and approved rates.

- b) The committee further recommends that Accounting Officers must not use discretion to award allowances and apportion rates since these are already established.

9.1.13 Incomplete Assets Register

The following was observed about the Council's Asset Register:

- i. Assets not recorded
- ii. Serial numbers not correctly recorded
- iii. Cost of assets not stated
- iv. Movements of assets not appropriately updated on the register
- v. Two motorbikes (L82PCKB2F1360609 and 1292C0100784) not having number plates
- vi. The register was not updated with all assets (procurement of 2020 not included)

Recommendations

- a) The Committee recommends that Management must update the Asset Register with the missing details within 30 days from the adoption of this report.
- b) The Committee further recommends that the register must always be kept up to date to ensure its completeness.

9.1.14 Incomplete Staff Files

The Committee noted that several key documents from a sample of staff files were not filed.

Recommendation

The committee recommends a comprehensive review of all staff files to identify the missing records and regularizing them. The files must always be kept up to date.

9.1.15 Incomplete Establishment Register

Review of the Council's Establishment Register revealed some misstatements.

Recommendation

The Committee urges the Council to review and adjust the Establishment Register with the missing information. The revised register should be presented to the FPAC for review within 30 days from the adoption of this report.

CHAPTER 6 – GENERAL RECOMMENDATIONS

The Finance and Public Accounts Committee (FPAC) hereby resolves as follows:

- 1) The Judiciary should prepare their accounts and submit them to the National Assembly, with effect from the year ended 31st December 2023.
- 2) That documents to be provided to the Auditors when requested
- 3) Digitalization of revenue and non-tax collection to be done
- 4) That the AGD to provide the Committee with the IT policy and the level of implementation status of the Audit recommendation on ICT
- 5) The MOH in consultation with Finance and AGD to develop a financial manual that will be used by all subvented Institutions
- 6) That the PMO in consultation with the relevant institution to develop a service rule that can be used by all agencies and subvented institution
- 7) For the President to review some of the Chairpersons of the governing Boards, Council of agencies chaired by the Vice President / Ministers to be reviewed for reconsideration
- 8) That all Ministers must work with their subvented institutions under them to ensure their budget are captured accordingly
- 9) FPAC, Health Committee, MOH, Finance and AGD to look into the budgetary allocation of all the hospitals and their subvented institution
- 10) An interface between the committee and MOFEA to review the Public Finance Act
- 11) All hospitals to ensure that their accounts are done by competent personnel
- 12) The PS Ministry of Health in consultation with PMO to come up with an appropriate allowance for all hospitals and health care worker
- 13) That an administrator should not serve as a consultant in the hospitals. All hospital administrators should have the required qualification.
- 14) The Permanent Secretary, MoFEA to impose sanctions on Accounting Officers/Vote Controllers that failed to adhere to the provisions of the financial regulations.
- 15) Management must ensure that control mechanisms are put in place to regularly monitor the revenue collections processes and procedures in order to mitigate against financial irregularities.
- 16) The modalities of surcharge by the Auditor General should be incorporated in the amendments to the NAO Act.
- 17) The Warrant of Expenditure must be signed by the Auditor General as opposed to the Minister of Finance and Economic Affairs.

- 18) The Board of Directors and Management of public institutions must take management responses to audit queries very seriously since they are jointly accountable for them.
- 19) Local Government Councils must collectively adopt sound accounting bases and policies in consultation with the National Audit Office.
- 20) The Abattoir and Stores project of Banjul City Council must be investigated by the Police.
- 21) Any unbudgeted expenditure by any Council must be immediately paid back or refunded to the Council by the Chief Executive Officer (CEO) of the Council.
- 22) All Payment Vouchers raised at the Councils must be verified by the Internal Audit department before they are forwarded to the CEO for payment.
- 23) Withholding Tax from all contracts and procurements of the Councils must be deducted and paid to Gambia Revenue Authority (GRA).
- 24) The Minutes of all meetings at the Councils, whether General Council or Committees, must be recorded and filed accordingly.
- 25) The entire IT systems of Councils must be backed up in properly maintained Server Rooms.
- 26) The Financial and Accounting Manual of Local Government councils must be updated to cater for accruals accounting treatments.
- 27) The residential and commercial properties in all the Councils should be revalued to reflect current market values.
- 28) Councils must avoid unplanned or unbudgeted expenditure by making sure that all expenses are budgeted for or approved by the General Council in the case of unforeseen situations.
- 29) Councils must endeavour to keep their Fixed Assets Register up to date with all the required information at all times.

CONCLUSION

In discharge of its constitutional mandate under Sections 102, 109, and 160 of the 1997 Constitution, the Finance and Public Accounts Committee (FPAC) has meticulously scrutinized the Auditor General's Report on the Audited Accounts of the Government of The Gambia for the year ended 31st December 2020, together with the Annual Activity Reports and Audited Financial Statements of Public Agencies, Institutions, Hospitals, and Local Government Councils for the period 2019 to 2021.

The Committee's findings reveal widespread and persistent weaknesses in public financial management across the entities reviewed. These include chronic non-compliance with the Public Finance Act, the GPPA Act, and other financial governance instruments; misuse of public funds—including the Contingency Fund; unauthorized virements; poor record-keeping; delayed financial reporting; weak revenue collection and accountability frameworks; inadequate monitoring of public investments; and serious internal control lapses, particularly within Local Government Councils and certain public institutions.

Whilst noting marginal improvements in specific areas, the Committee is gravely concerned that the recurrence and magnitude of these financial irregularities continue to undermine transparency, accountability, and the prudent management of public resources.

Accordingly, the Committee calls on the Executive—particularly the Ministry of Finance and Economic Affairs, the Accountant General's Department, and all public institutions—to act with urgency in implementing the recommendations contained in this report. This includes strengthening internal controls, ensuring strict adherence to financial regulations, improving timeliness in financial reporting, and holding accountable those officers and institutions whose actions or inactions have breached financial governance standards, including, where appropriate, administrative, civil, or criminal sanctions.

The Committee further underscores the need for stronger coordination and collaboration with the National Audit Office, the SOE Commission, and other oversight institutions to reinforce financial discipline and good governance across the public sector.

In conclusion, the FPAC respectfully recommends that this Honourable Assembly adopt this report in its entirety and calls upon all stakeholders—without exception—to demonstrate renewed commitment to the highest standards of transparency, accountability, and financial stewardship in the supreme interest of national development and the welfare of the Gambian people.

APPENDICES

Appendix I (Membership of FPAC)

Honourable Members

1. Hon. Alhagie S. Darbo - Chairperson
2. Hon. Alhagie Mbow - Vice Chairperson
3. Hon. Fatoumatta Njai - Member
4. Hon. Fatou Cham - Member
5. Hon. Musa Cham - Member
6. Hon. Kebba Lang Fofana - Member
7. Hon. Kebba T. Sanneh - Member
8. Hon. Sulayman Jammeh - Member
9. Hon. Seedy SK Njie - Member

Subject Matter Specialists (SMS)/Aides

1. Mr. Modou Ceesay - Auditor General, NAO
2. Mr. Babucarr Badjie - NAO Legal Counsel
3. Mr. Abdoulie B. Cham - Subject Matter Specialist
4. Dr. Alieu O. Faal - Subject Matter Specialist

Support Staff

1. Mr. Kalipha MM Mbye - Clerk of the National Assembly
2. Mr. Buba ME Jatta - Deputy Clerk (Admin & Finance)
3. Mr Marabi S. Hydera - Director of Committees
4. Mr Lamin E. Manneh - Principal Committee Clerk
5. Ms Sarata Bojang - Committee Clerk
6. Ms Isatou Sonko - Committee Clerk

Appendix II (List of Witnesses)

<u>No</u>	<u>NAME</u>	<u>DESIGNATION/INSTITUTION</u>
1.	Fatoumatta Jallow	- Audit Manager NAO
2.	Sering Mass Jallow	- Director of Audit NAO
3.	Alasan Jatta	- Assistant Auditor
4.	Abdou Joof	- External Auditor HAD & Co.
5.	Ramatoulie Jallow	- Senior Audit Manager DT Associates
6.	Fatoumata Bah	- Audit Manager DT Associates
7.	Aji Penda Sankareh	- Managing Partner DT Associates
8.	Pa Majagne Ndow	- Deputy Auditor General 1, NAO
9.	Baba S. Drammeh	- Deputy Auditor General 2, NAO
10.	Ousman O. Cham	- Snr. Manager Finance, NAO
11.	Ebrima Jadama	- Senior Audit Manager, AP
12.	Augustus Prom Jn	- Eng. Manager AP
13.	Jainaba Jallow	- ATO GPPA
14.	Abdoulie J. Bah	- CA GPPA
15.	Sering Mass Jallow	- Director of Audit, NAO

- | | | |
|-----|--------------------|---|
| 16. | Sarian Monday | - Associates Auditor, NAO |
| 17. | Samba JB Tambura | - DCPG GPPA |
| 18. | Habib A. O. Jeng | - Chairman GPPA |
| 19. | Ebrima Darboe | - Finance Manager GPPA |
| 20. | Fatou Darboe | - Ag. OLLE |
| 21. | Hassan Jatta | - Audit Partner HAD & Co |
| 22. | Paul Gaye | - External Auditor Nexia Payce Consulting |
| 23. | Ousman Saïdy bah | - PRO & Head of Demand Reduction |
| 24. | Fatoumatta Jallow | - Audit Manager NAO |
| 25. | Sering Mass Jallow | - Director of Audit NAO |
| 26. | Alasan Jatta | - Assistant Auditor |
| 27. | Abdou Joof | - External Auditor HAD & Co. |
| 28. | Ramatoulie Jallow | - Senior Audit Manager DT Associates |
| 29. | Fatoumata Bah | - Audit Manager DT Associates |
| 30. | Aji Penda Sankareh | - Managing Partner DT Associates |
| 31. | Karamba Touray | - Auditor General National Audit Office (NAO) |
| 32. | Pa Majagne Ndow | - Deputy Auditor General 1 NAO |
| 33. | Baba S. Drammeh | - Deputy Auditor General 2 NAO |
| 34. | Ousman O. Cham | - Snr. Manager Finance NAO |
| 35. | Ebrima Jadama | - Senior Audit Manager AP |
| 36. | Augustus Prom Jn | - Eng. Manager AP |
| 37. | Jainaba Jallow | - ATO GPPA |
| 38. | Abdoulie J. Bah | - CA GPPA |
| 39. | Sering Mass Jallow | - Director of Audit NAO |
| 40. | Sarian Monday | - Associates Auditor NAO |
| 41. | Samba JB Tambura | - DCPG GPPA |
| 42. | Habib A.O Jeng | - Chairman GPPA |
| 43. | Phoday M. Jaiteh | - Director General GPPA |
| 44. | Ebrima Darboe | - Finance Manager GPPA |
| 45. | Paul S. Mendy | - Director Finance & Admin PURA |
| 46. | Yusupha M. Jobe | - Director General PURA |
| 47. | Alieu M. Ngum | - Board Chairman PURA |
| 48. | Solo Sima | - Director Customer Affairs PURA |
| 49. | Ibraïma Sanyang | - DPPO GPPA |
| 50. | Nicholas Jatta | - Director ICT PURA |
| 51. | Rodine S | - DDICT PURA |
| 52. | Gibou Joof | - Deputy Director Internal Audit PURA |
| 53. | Malamin Darboe | - Director HR & Board Secretary PURA |
| 54. | Burama Jatta | - Director of Economic Regulation PURA |
| 55. | Salifu Bah | - Snr. Procurement Manager PURA |
| 56. | Musa Njie | - Snr. Water Manager PURA |
| 57. | Fatou Darboe | - Ag. OLLE |
| 58. | Hassan Jatta | - Audit Partner HAD & Co |
| 59. | Paul Gaye | - External Auditor Nexia Payce Consulting |
| 60. | David Mendy | - Associate Auditor NAO |